Move NY

Faster. Smarter. Fairer.
(+35,000 Recurring Local Jobs)

“Insanity: doing the same thing over and over again and expecting different results.”

- Albert Einstein

Samuel I. Schwartz, P.E.
Sam Schwartz Engineering
October, 2012
The Current Formula is broken and unfair, a vestige from past eras of bridge and tunnel pricing.
$670 million collected in 2011 on three bridges connecting Queens and the Bronx (Robert F. Kennedy Bridge + Throgs Neck Bridge + Whitestone Bridge)

Most of the $$ goes to subways, Metro-North and LIRR
Yet awful transit across bridges
Round trip tolls hiked $11 to $13 cash, $9.14 to $9.60 EZ Pass on Dec. 30, 2010 and more to come in 2013
This is Insane...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Rate</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>$0.50</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>$8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>$1</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>$13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>$3</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>$25 projected*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>$6</td>
<td>2030</td>
<td>$51 projected*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Cash rate round trip
This is Unfair…

- One would think Staten Island is New York’s Central Business District. Every entry point is tolled
- $580 million collected annually at the four bridges to Staten Island
- No subways
- Increased costs to truckers means increased prices of goods & services on the island
This is unhealthy...
People shop for the cheapest bridge

- 50,000 cars, trucks and taxis flood the streets of Long Island City, Astoria, Hunter’s Point and Manhattan’s East Side to get to the “FREE” Queensboro Bridge
- Drivers hop off Long Island Expwy and Great Central Pkwy to avoid tolls at Queens Midtown Tunnel and Grand Central Pkwy
- Taking indirect routes adds millions of vehicle miles travelled annually
- Adds noise and air pollution
- Increases pedestrian and car crashes
- Same is true for Brooklyn crossings

This is unhealthy...
Putting Traffic On City Streets vs. Highways Makes No Sense

- Highways lead to the three tolled East River crossings
- City streets are main feeders to “free” bridges
- This encourages drivers to use city streets over highways, adding congestion, casualties and pollution.
We toll drivers going from Queens to Queens across the Cross Bay Bridge but not to go from Queens to Manhattan’s CBD across the Queensboro Bridge.

This is Dumb...
This is Crazy...

**Verrazano Bridge Boondoggle**
Created by an act of Congress

**New Jersey**
**“Trucker’s Special!”**

*Take Manhattan Bridge*
*Save $70 and have fun!*
*Tour Chinatown, Tribeca, and Little Italy via Canal St.*

*(While supplies last)*

---

**FREE! Outbound**

**$70 (5-Axle)**

---

**FREE!**

**FREE!**

**FREE!**
This Is Absurd...
In Brooklyn we put cars on highways and trucks on city streets

- 40 states lie west of the Verrazano
- A highway, the Belt Parkway, connects the Verrazano with JFK airport
- Trucks are banned from the Belt. Truck route includes: Atlantic Ave., Caton Ave., Linden Blvd and Conduit Blvd. – all primarily residential
PREVIOUS ATTEMPTS AT PRICING IN NYC:

and why it will continue to fail

- Viewed as a tax
- Sanctity of inter-borough travel
- No trust that dollars will go to transportation
- Little in it for car centric outer communities
- Boroughs pay bulk; little burden on Manhattanites
  south of 86th St.

Unless, we learn from history

"Those that fail to learn from history are doomed to repeat it."

-Winston Churchill
-(Var. George Santayana)
Every councilmember with a bridge or road to be ‘priced’ voted ‘Aye.’” Heavy Opposition from outer perimeters of Queens, Brooklyn and Staten Island as well as central Brooklyn and Queens
Current Dysfunctional Pricing Scheme

2012 Toll Rates

Legend

$# ($#) $EZPass ($Cash)

Tolls in both directions
Toll in one direction
* Peak hour rate

FREE!
FREE!
FREE!
FREE!
Wipe the Slate Clean
Fair Pricing: A more equitable transportation formula

1. Only apply pricing where there is:
   - Serious Congestion
   - Good Transit

2. Make it performance driven:
   - Guarantee a 20 minute crosstown trip from 1st to 8th Avenues
   - Lower prices during poor economic times; higher prices during better times.

3. Lower or eliminate tolls at poor transit locations
Manhattan CBD: Serious Congestion + Good Transit
The Fair Plan
An example of flat rate approach

Alternatives to consider:
- Time of day
- Day of week
- Seasonal
The Fair Plan
Delta rates from 2012

Legend
$# ($#) EZPass ($Non EZ)
Tolls in both directions
Toll in one direction
* Peak hour rate
Manhattanites Contribute (So. of 86th St)

- On-Street Parking Surcharge: $25M
- End Parking Tax Rebate: $15M
- Taxis Surcharge: $200M
- For-Hire-Vehicles: $50M
- On-Street Parking Surcharge: $25M
Addressing “No Trust Dollars Will Go to Transportation”

**Bottom Line**

- $1.4 billion net/year*, $56 billion over 40 years
- Bondable $12-15 billion at start, or “pay-as-you-go” capital
- 35,000 recurring local jobs/year

**Include Following in Enabling Legislation**

- $400M annually for “state of good repair”
- Divide remaining $1B to capital programs
  - Two-thirds for transit
  - One-third for road & bridges
- Define these capital investments
- Nothing for fare reduction** or fare maintenance

*From Balanced Transportation Analyzer by Charles Komanoff

**Except for local buses in transit deserts
Truck, Bus and Highway Improvements

- Get trucks off Brooklyn Streets; widen Belt Parkway, allow commercial vehicles, and improve access to JFK/Aqueduct
- LIE, Bruckner and Belt Bus Rapid Transit down median
- Build continuous service roads for Staten Island Expressway
- Solve Van Wyck bottleneck to/from JFK Airport
Local Buses

• Reduce bus fares by $1 in neighborhoods with no subways (transit deserts)
• No service reductions on local buses for three years without Community Board approval
• Consider restoring some local bus service discontinued in 2010
• Central Brooklyn, Central Queens bus improvement plan
Strengthen and Expand Ferries

- Support capital investments by private operators
- Strengthen existing trans-Hudson ferries
- New:
  - La Guardia via Westchester and East River
  - East & South shores of Staten Island
  - Bay Ridge
  - Upper East Side
  - Bronx
  - Westchester
  - Jamaica Bay/Rockaways
Three New Bridges to Manhattan for Peds/Bikes

$50 cent toll for bikes

- Hoboken / Jersey City
- Midtown
- Financial District
- Governor’s Island
- Downtown Brooklyn
- Long Island City/Hunter’s Point
- Greenpoint
Brooklyn > Governors Island > Lower Manhattan
Equitable Transportation Formula

**Not a Tax**
- Fair Pricing where there’s congestion and good transit (Manhattan CBD only)
- Make it performance-driven; when congestion worsens increase tolls, if economy is bad and traffic decreases lower tolls

**Cheaper Inter-borough Travel**
- Tolls reduced between Queens-Bronx, Brooklyn-Queens, Staten Island-Brooklyn
- Only travel to CBD is priced

**Manhattanites Pay Most**
- No parking rebate south of 86th St.
- $1 surcharge on taxis and black cars south of 86th St.

**Dollars Must Go To Transportation**
- Enabling legislation will define revenue assignments
- Two thirds will go to transit
- One third will go to highways and bridges

**Lots In It For Car-centric Outer Communities**
- Many of their tolls reduced
- Staten Island Expressway, Belt and Van Wyck Expressway widened
- Bus rapid transit for LIE, Belt Parkway and Bruckner to suburbs

**+ 35,000 Jobs**
What’s in it for Staten Island?

• Equity, not a stepchild
• Lowered tolls at Verrazano Bridge
• Precedent for other bridges
• $1 reduction on bus fares
• Potential for new ferry services
• Widened Staten Island Expressway
• Reduced cost of doing business
• Improved Belt Parkway
• Thousands of jobs
• Better infrastructure
Motorized Tranquility

“The idea is not to penalize people for using their cars, but to give everyone a choice about how best to get from here to there.

“If New York is to become a better habitat for automobiles, it should never be cheaper to drive than to take a less convenient form of transportation. To put it another way: Saving time should cost money, and vice versa. That way, car-haters can stop spluttering about the ills of driving and let the rest of us whip around the city in motorized tranquility.”

Justin Davidson
NY Magazine, June 5, 2012