

**Synopsis of the February 19, 2004 Meeting of the
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) of the
New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC)**

A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS, CHAIRPERSON'S REMARKS

1. The meeting was called to order at 1:20 p.m. by Mr. Robert Dennison, Chairperson of the Program, Finance and Administration Committee and Regional Director of the New York State Department of Transportation, (NYSDOT) Region 8. All attendees introduced themselves.
2. **Chairperson's Remarks** – Mr. Robert Dennison began the meeting by thanking Alan Borenstein, Gerry Bogacz and Kuo-Ann Chiao for their combined efforts to keep the organization running smoothly in the absence of an Executive Director. Mr. Dennison said they were doing a great job “holding the fort” while the Executive Director search continued. He said that a job opportunity notice was posted for the position of Acting Executive Director, interviews would be conducted and a selection should be made soon after. He informed everyone that the Annual Council Meeting would be held on March 18, 2004 at New York University. He said there was confirmation of attendance from many of the Council Principals and encouraged everyone to attend. He then turned the meeting over to the three Acting Executive Directors to give their staff report.
3. **Staff Report** – Mr. Alan Borenstein said that the move to 199 Water Street in lower Manhattan was moving forward. The landlord signed the lease and the lease needed to be signed by the State Comptroller's Office. He said that there were two new staff members on board and lost one staff member from the Technical Group.

Mr. Kuo-Ann Chiao said that staff continuously worked on the Best Practices Model applications and he introduced two data product--Transportation Safety Report 2000 and Travel Patterns in the New York Metro Area 2002. He said that the reports were available at the sign-in table.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the staff continued to work on the timetable of the Conformity Waiver and they continued to update the Transportation Improvement Program and Regional Transportation Plan. Mr. Bogacz said the each of the Transportation Coordinating Committees continued to work on the various studies in their area.

B. ACTION ITEMS

1. Accept: November 20, 2003 Meeting Synopsis

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to accept the November 20, 2003 Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Ms. Patricia Chemka representing Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Robert Shinnick representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and the synopsis was accepted.

2. Adopt: Resolution #182 – Recommendation to the Council to Adopt the 2004-2005 Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #182 – Recommendation to the Council to Adopt the 2004-2005 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

3. Adopt: Resolution #183 – Editorial Services Amendment to the 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #183 – Editorial Services Amendment to the 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Mr. Larry Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation

Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

4. Adopt: Resolution #184 – Amend the Central Staff Portion of the Second Year 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program, Best Practices Model Development and Maintenance

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #184 – Amend the Central Staff Portion of the Second Year 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program Best Practices Model Development and Maintenance. A motion was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. John Pilner, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

5. Adopt: Resolution #185 – County Road 97/Nicolls Road Major Investment Study Amendment to the 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #185 – County Road 97/Nicolls Road Major Investment Study Amendment to the 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Charles Ukegbu, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

C. REGIONAL ISSUES

Transportation Job Access Study

Ms. Judy Bliss of the New York City Department of Transportation presented the results of Transportation Job Access Study in New York City. Ms. Bliss gave a background of the project, the site selection parameters and study areas and talked about transportation issues concerning the project. She went over the findings and recommendations, lessons learned and the next steps for the project. For detailed information, see the attached presentation.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

There were no speakers.

E. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

1. New York State Department of Transportation Regional Arterial Goods Movement Study

Mr. Peter King reported that New York State Department of Transportation undertook a subregional study to look at the State's arterial system and to assess what the goods movement problems and potential enhancements. The study was conducted through a Department contract with the University Transportation Research Center. An advisory committee was formed consisting of people who had goods movement interests either as shippers or receivers. Five improvement scenarios were developed from the information collected. The most basic scenario called "S1", was the "no-build" and reflected projects already in the program and Transportation Improvement Program and for which funding was identified. The next scenario, "S2", added in a number of other major elements such as the construction of a Cross Harbor Tunnel, the Gowanus Expressway Environmental Impact Statement Preferred Alternative, and the new interchange on the Gowanus, and the new interchange between the Bruckner Sheridan in the Bronx and Hunts Point. The "S3" scenario included "S2" and also included new truck ways in Brooklyn and Queens where rail line corridor Right-Of-Way made dual use potentially viable. "S3" also included reconstructing the Grand Central Parkway in Astoria to allow trucks between the Triboro Bridge and Brooklyn-Queens Expressway. The "S4" scenario expanded the truck way idea up to the Hell Gate Bridge and extended the Clearview to the vicinity of the JFK Airport. The "S5" scenario was the development of new rubber tire freight tunnel under the Hudson, which would somewhat compliment the Cross Harbor Tunnel. Mr. King said that the above scenarios were tested using information from the Best Practices Model (BPM). The BPM was used to help identify where future resources should be allocated in order to hold current link levels of congestion at their current levels. Several ideas were developed from the study, such as—need for better goods movement information, better opportunities for the movers of goods to have real time information, and better use of the parkway system by opening selected links to small commercial vehicles. It was identified that there was a need

to continue to address substandard geometrics features and a need for an information clearing house. Preliminary unit cost figures were developed for different kinds of improvements and used in the BPM model runs and analysis.

2. Regional Transportation Plan Public Review Meetings

Mr. Jan Khan said that the update of the Regional Transportation Plan began in 2000 and that the updated Plan was originally due in 2002, but because of the Conformity Waiver the Plan was now due April 2005. He said that the information collected from the public meetings was shared with the PFAC members and then translated into a discussion document along with maps. The documents were available at the sign-in table. He said several public review meetings were scheduled throughout the region.

3. Job Access and Reverse Commute Workshops

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that under TEA21, NYMTC is responsible for administering the Federal Job Access and Reverse Commute Grant Program. These are federal dollars that are made available nationally for transportation services to people with low income or welfare recipients to access employment opportunities. NYMTC is responsible for reaching out to the communities and to those who are qualified for these grants. There would be a series of workshops held this year within the each of NYMTC's counties. Meetings were scheduled for May and June 2004.

4. September 11th Memorial Fund

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said the September 11th Memorial Fund was created to memorialize Ignatius Adanga, Charles Lesperance and See Wong Shum, the three employees of NYMTC who perished in the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001. The fund's intention was to remember our colleagues and recognize their contributions to NYMTC and to facilitate our organization's recovery from the devastating impacts of the attacks. Mr. Bogacz said that there were two parts of the fund and explained that the planning program would solicit proposals for planning activities which would further the goals and improvement proposals in the Regional Transportation Plan. The academic program would assist students in completing their education in transportation planning and computer science, which were the careers of Mr. Adanga, Mr. Lesperance and Mr. Shum. Mr. Bogacz said that the Memorial Fund meant a lot to the staff at NYMTC and he thanked the PFAC members for their support.

5. Transportation Improvement Program Solicitation

Mr. Steven Hausch said that the NYMTC staff and the Transportation Coordinating Committees were in final stages of setting up the initiation of NYMTC's new project Transportation Improvement Program solicitations to the public. It will be coordinated through the TCC offices and the announcements letter will go out to the public soon. The applications for each TCC will be downloadable from the NYMTC's website. Various workshops will be given throughout the region and supported by the TCC's. The process will begin March 1, 2004 through April 15, 2004.

F. CONFIRMATION OF ANNUAL COUNCIL MEETING

Mr. Dennison confirmed that the Annual Council Meeting was scheduled for March 18, 2004 and would be held at New York University, 60 Washington Square South, New York City.

G. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING

Mr. Dennison confirmed that the next PFAC meeting was scheduled for May 20, 2004 and to be held at the NYSDOT Offices located at 47-40 21st Street; Long Island City, Queens.

H. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned approximately at 2:40 p.m.

IN ATTENDANCE

Voting Member/Alternates

Lawrence Berger, Nassau County
Patricia Chemka, Westchester County
Robert A. Dennison III, NYS Department of Transportation
John Pilner, Putnam County
Sarah Rios, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Jack Schmidt, NYC Department of City Planning
Robert Shinnick, Nassau County
Charles Ukegbu, NYC Department of Transportation
Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County

Advisory (non-voting) Members

Denny Escarpeta, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Irwin Kessman, Federal Transit Administration
Robert Griffith, Federal Highway Administration
Michael Moltzen, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

NYMTC Staff

Afolabi Aiyedun	Daniel Coots	Howard Mann
Gerry Bogacz	Stephen Hausch	Larry McAuliffe
Alan Borenstein	Jan Khan	Andrea Miles-Cole
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Carl King	Karen Rosenberger
Margaret Conklin	Uchenna Madu	Kevin Wolford

OTHERS

Vaino Ader, DDC Struct
George Arment, ESD
Rick Backlund, FHWA
Patrick Centolanzi, Modern Transit Society
Vincent Corrado
Judy Bliss, NYCDOT
Donald O Eiseh
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
David Harris, NYCDOT
Chris Jandoli, MTA
Scott Lowe, Manhattan College
Chris McBride, AAA
Kevin Olinger, NYCDCP
Richard Peters, NYSDOT
Michael Pferr, NYSDOT
Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Jeff Silverberg, NYSDOT
Garvin Tom, Louis Berger Group
Neil Trent, Rockland County
Wayne Ugolik, NYSDOT

Meeting Synopsis accepted by PFAC on 6/17/2004

Respectfully submitted by,

Andréa Miles-Cole

**SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 18, 2004 MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:20 p.m. by Mr. Joseph Boardman, the Council's permanent Co-Chair and New York State Department of Transportation's Commissioner.

Mr. Boardman called attention to the 20-year anniversary report at the sign in table and said that June 2002 was an important milestone for the NYMTC organization. However, there were many more challenges to deal with over the next 20 years. He added that there would be discussions at the meeting which would address some of the challenges, especially the redevelopment of transportation in lower Manhattan. He thanked everyone for attending and then he introduced the Council members and/or their representatives. It was established that there was a quorum.

B. OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing Mr. Robert Gaffney, the out-going Co-Chair, was given the opportunity to speak on behalf of Mr. Gaffney. Mr. Shinnick, on behalf of the Suffolk County Executive Gaffney, who regretted not being able to attend the meeting, sent his best regards. Mr. Shinnick said Mr. Gaffney wanted to highlight his concerns for coordinated emergency response planning and to advise everyone that Suffolk County strongly supports the emergency response resolution which would be addressed later in the meeting. He spoke about the considerable role NYMTC would play in ushering federal transportation funding into the region, as Transportation Equity Act-21 (TEA-21) expired and TEA-3 replaced it. He said he was confident that NYMTC and its staff and member agencies were capable to meet the challenges that would be faced in implementing programs under the new Act. Mr. Shinnick closed by saying that Suffolk County would provide any assistance NYMTC needed to have a productive year.

Mr. Boardman spoke about the difficult year NYMTC had trying to finalize space for its staff and dealing with the conformity waiver. He praised Tom Schulze for doing a wonderful job in making NYMTC what it should be--getting stakeholders involved in the emerging role that NYMTC was playing in terms of delivering a forum that transportation can be discussed across the borders into the counties.

C. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Tom Schulze welcomed Council members, agency staffs and members of the public. He said that in the past year, NYMTC was driven by two overriding goals: 1) continuing the rebuilding of files, offices and the planning process, and 2) continuing to strengthen the efforts to meet the needs of members and the public. He said he was happy to report that over the past 12 months, NYMTC, with the help of staff, and its members, was successful in those areas. He reminded attendees that this was NYMTC's 20 year anniversary and encouraged everyone to take a copy of the report. Mr. Schulze updated attendees on the effort being made to secure a new home for staff. He said he was hopeful that a lease would be signed within a month for space at the northern end of Water Street. He then spoke about the accomplishments over the past year. NYMTC received a waiver for conformity through the year 2005; updated the Regional Transportation Plan; redid the Transportation Improvement Program; rebuilt the Unified Planning Work Program; strengthened the public involvement activities; restored administrative functions; and produced state reports. Mr. Schulze continued and said staff was also focusing on new challenges, such as the Regional Freight Plan; the working groups were all active and the groups were meeting on a regular basis; the Best Practices Model was launched mid-2001 and was being used in studies all

over the region; and the Sustainable Developments were either completed or underway. The staff was also involved in the Waterborne planning on Long Island and the Hudson River, the Canal Area Transportation Study, and the Regional Transit Study in Mid-Hudson South. He said he was comfortable saying that NYMTC's planning process was back in place. He then spoke about some of the new undertakings for the future. 1) moving to a new address; 2) developing a strategic plan 3) finishing studies that were underway; 4) launching a new website; 5) emissions reduction planning; and 6) meeting the requirements made by Congress for the conformity waiver. He said the challenges were to stay focused on the important things in this age of fiscal constraints, and making sure NYMTC had the resources to do the work. He closed by thanking his staff.

D. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: MARCH 20, 2003 SYNOPSIS

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to accept the March 20, 2003 Council Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Rockland County and seconded by Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The synopsis was accepted.

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-1 – RECOMMENDED AMENDMENTS TO THE SECOND YEAR OF THE 2002/2004 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM

Mr. Boardman introduced Mr. Gerry Bogacz, Assistant Director of the NYMTC Planning Group.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, with the help of slides, gave a summary of the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP). See attached. A digest of the UPWP was made available at the sign-in table. Mr. Bogacz thanked Steve Hausch and Mikhail Kotikovskiy (Planning Group), Nina Del Senno and Anthony Gawrych (Administration Group); the three Transportation Coordination Committee Directors Uchenna Madu, Jean Shanahan, and Kevin Wolford, and the members.

Mr. Boardman asked if there were any questions for Mr. Bogacz. There were none.

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to adopt the Recommended Amendment to the Second Year of the 2002-2004 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Robert Shinnick, representing Suffolk County Executive Robert Gaffney and seconded by Dr. James Yarmus, representing Rockland County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef. There was no discussion. The Resolution unanimously passed.

3. RESOLUTION #2004-2 – NYMTC'S EMERGENCY PLANNING COORDINATION POLICY

Mr. Spano thanked NYMTC's members and staff for acting quickly and responsibly to his suggestion. He felt his request was appropriate having dealt with Indian Point and September 11, 2001 and now the war. He said last year he came to the Council and requested a consideration be given to having NYMTC adopt a role in the coordination of emergency planning in the region. He was happy to hear that members and staff took the suggestion seriously and even before the resolution was formally adopted, have begun to incorporate emergency response and security concerns within the body of the planning products being developed. Mr. Spano gave as examples the ferry services study on Long Island Sound and the upcoming ferry services study on the Hudson River. The update of the Regional Transportation Plan would include issues related to emergency response. In addition, the Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Working Group will be preparing a chapter in the Regional Transportation Plan which would highlight the development of an ITS infrastructure to ensure that all agencies would be able to access information on, and respond to any incident occurring in the region via linkages with TRANSCOM and other transportation management systems in the region. He said outreach to the agencies responsible to responding to emergencies had already been made at both the County and State levels.

The outreach would continue to ensure needs of the responders were addressed as part of the planning for the transportation network. He said the inclusion of the 2003-2004 Unified Planning Work Program, of an activity to address disaster recovery support, was critical to undertaking the work that had been requested to facilitate emergency response planning.

Mr. Spano then introduced the Resolution 2003-2, NYMTC's Emergency Planning Coordination Policy by reading it. Mr. Spano made the motion to adopt Resolution 2003-2, NYMTC's Emergency Planning Coordination Policy and it was seconded by Nassau County. The Resolution passed unanimously. There was no discussion.

Mr. Boardman said he wanted the record to show that he appreciated the fact that Mr. Spano's leadership helped get the concept of transportation and emergency, on a regional basis, on the front burner.

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-3 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO JONATHAN MCDADE, FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION

Mr. Boardman turned the meeting over to Mr. Robert Dennison, the PFAC Chair and Council Secretary for this action item.

Mr. Dennison gave a background on Mr. McDade and said that he was an active participant and contributor at PFAC in his role with the Federal Highway Administration. He said that Mr. McDade was promoted and would be the Administrator in Maine and would no longer be a part of the New York State organization. The Council was being asked to adopt the resolution to recognize his service.

A motion was made to adopt Resolution 2003-3 – Recognition of Service to Jonathan McDade, FHWA by New York State Department of Transportation and seconded by Rockland County.

Mr. McDade was presented with a plaque. Mr. McDade thanked everyone and said it was an honor to work with everyone for the past six years, especially the last 1 ½ years.

5. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-4 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO NORMA P. HESSIC, NYMTC

Mr. Boardman said that Norma Hessian was with NYMTC and its predecessor agency for 32 years. He said that Norma was the type of person you share a lot of laughs with and you can also share tears with. He said that he had done that with Norma, especially during the last couple of years. Mr. Boardman said that Norma was moving to Florida, but before she did that she planned on volunteering in her disabled granddaughter's school. He said Norma went through the 1993 bombing and she was the emotional leader in many ways through the terrible terror, especially to the NYMTC staff. He said that she had stepped forward for him as NYSDOT Commissioner and for her family and for NYMTC as a whole. He said he was extremely pleased with Tom and all the members to honor her and to say they loved her. A plaque was presented to Ms. Hessian.

Ms. Hessian said she was at a loss for words. She thanked everyone and said that it was a wonderful experience and that she would miss everything about the job.

Mr. Schulze said he was going to miss Norma but he saved his comments for her send off luncheon.

A motion was made by Mr. Boardman and seconded by Westchester's County Executive Spano. The Resolution 2003-4 – Recognition of Service to Norma P. Hessian was passed unanimously.

6. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2003-5 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO HONORABLE ROBERT J. GAFFNEY, COUNTY EXECUTIVE

Mr. Boardman said that Robert Gaffney had been interested in transportation issues and he appreciated the work he had done over the past year and the Council would like to honor him. A plaque was presented to Robert Shinnick for Mr. Gaffney in appreciation for the work he had done as Co-Chair of the Council.

A motion was made by Mr. Boardman and seconded by Nassau's County Executive Thomas Suozzi. Resolution #2003-5 – Recognition of Service to Honorable Robert J. Gaffney, County Executive passed unanimously.

Mr. Shinnick thanked members on behalf of Mr. Gaffney and said that Mr. Gaffney took his responsibility as Co-Chair very seriously, especially most recently with the lobbying effort for the Air Quality Conformity Waiver. He added that Mr. Gaffney leaves the Council as Co-Chair while the Council was making great strides with the things that had to be accomplished. He wished the new Co-Chair well.

7. CONFIRM: NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIRPERSON – AMANDA BURDEN, DIRECTOR, NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING

Mr. Boardman stated that unfortunately, Ms. Amanda Burden could not be present; however she must be confirmed as the new rotating Co-Chair for NYMTC. He said that Ms. Burden was an urban planner and civil activist, and currently the Chair of the New York City Planning Commission and the Director of the Department of City Planning; and has been a member of the Commission since 1990. She was responsible for the planning and design of the 92-acre Battery Park City project in lower Manhattan, received the Sidney Strauss Award from the New York Society of Architects, and received an honorary membership to the American Institute of Architects, New York Chapter. Ms. Burden lives in Manhattan and has two children.

Mr. Boardman said that Mr. Sandy Hornick would accept the confirmation on behalf of Ms. Burden.

Mr. Hornick apologized for Ms. Burden's absence, and said she had to testify concerning the budget. He said that Ms. Burden recognized the importance of the work NYMTC does.

Ms. Burden was approved by a unanimous vote as the rotating Co-Chair for April 2003 to March 2004.

E. NASSAU COUNTY'S TRANSPORTATION VISION – Honorable Thomas Suozzi, County Executive

Mr. Thomas Suozzi said he was very excited to attend his first NYMTC meeting. With the help of slides, Mr. Suozzi gave a presentation and said that Nassau County was the first suburban county. He said that the County faced many challenges, but there were three overriding goals. The County must grow, create high wage jobs with benefits so that people can afford to live in Nassau County, and preserve the suburban quality of life. In order to realize the goals, six economic development goals were set up. 1) Promote high-tech, high skilled industries, 2) revitalize the downtowns, 3) recycle and redevelop brown fields (clean up pollution), 4) facilitate affordable housing, 5) preserve and secure the open space, and 6) promote sports and entertainment and tourism.

He spoke about the transportation issues and the lack of planning for decades-- no communication between the County and New York State Department of Transportation, or with local governments. He said that a transportation policy needed to be developed which would integrate state, regional, county, and local towns and village's policies. He said that as a result of all the issues he had talked about, Nassau County had outgrown the existing transportation structure and growth was necessary, but without being overloaded by traffic. He talked about the difference between Suffolk and Nassau Counties and said he was concerned about the future development of Suffolk County and how it related to Nassau County. He spoke about the Long Island

Transportation Plan (LITP) 2000 and how it would impact Nassau County. He said that Nassau County was divided into 35 economic development areas for planning purposes only. He said that the long term economic vision for the County was being discussed, and would be used as a vehicle to discuss the traffic and transportation issues that arise on a community by community basis. The information would be used as part of Nassau County's Master Plan and would work with the State to accomplish goals. Mr. Suozzi then spoke about the Nassau Hub, which he said was one of the most important things in Nassau County. He said that the County wanted to use the Hub for an economic growth opportunity for the County, but that huge transportation needs had to be addressed first. Mr. Suozzi then summarized what needed to be done in Nassau County. 1) Complete the Hub Study; 2) complete LITP 2000; 3) complete the Long Island Sound Waterborne Transportation Study; 4) complete the Long Island Railroad project, with eastside access; 5) improve rail freight options; 6) consider new technologies for addressing transportation problems; and 7) examine options whereby the County no longer has financial responsibility for operating an expanded bus system. Mr. Suozzi concluded by saying for the first time, Nassau County was looking at every village, town and county road to develop a rational approach for managing its network. He said he wanted to open a dialogue with members of the Council to draw upon their collective expertise, because their help and advice was needed. He introduced the Deputy County Executive for Economic Development, Mr. Peter Sylver and the Director of Planning, Ms. Patricia Bourne.

Mr. Boardman said that Mr. Suozzi brought a lot of messages that were ready to be heard and that he would be an asset to the Council. Mr. Boardman said that the NYSDOT saw the need to think about things differently in terms of performance management, the future, and the necessity to address congestion differently. He said we had to change the way we thought, not operate, in our own silos. Mr. Boardman said that he appreciated Mr. Suozzi's enthusiasm.

**F. ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION:
INTER-AGENCY COORDINATION IN THE REBUILDING OF LOWER MANHATTAN'S
TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE**

Mr. Boardman gave an overview of the slide program for the roundtable discussion and said he would have the agencies involved—Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority), New York State and New York City Department of Transportation, the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC), Federal Transit Administration (FTA), and Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), talk about the details. Mr. Boardman said the regional map showed what was happening from the MTA's Fulton Street Station to the PATH Terminal. It shows NYCDOT's local streets need improved circulation within lower Manhattan between the subways and need to rebuild local streets to manage to meet overall transportation goals. The Fulton Street Station needed to be improved between the lower Manhattan subways, PATH, ferries, and the World Financial Center as well as improve the connections to commuter rail and other inter-modal facilities in New York City. He said the Port Authority's PATH to lower Manhattan needed to restore New Jersey commuter rail services at Hoboken and Newark and provide access to northern and central New Jersey and Rockland County. He said MTA's South Ferry Station needed to improve its connections with the west side of Manhattan, Penn Station to Long Island and better connections to Staten Island. He said NYSDOT's Route 9A, West Street, needed to restore the highway connection with Staten Island, Brooklyn, New Jersey, Rockland County, northern Manhattan, and the Bronx. He said better ferry services were needed. New services were beginning all the time and there were terminal improvements being planned such as, Hoboken, and other New Jersey location on the Hudson River, Hunters Point in Queens, Yonkers and Rockland County further up the Hudson River, and possibly LaGuardia, JFK and Newark airports, and the Long Island Sound. He said there were numerous options being evaluated to improve access to the regional airports, especially JFK and Newark. Mr. Boardman said the objective was to make sure that lower Manhattan had the best possible transportation connections to the rest of this large region. He then introduced each agency that was involved with the redevelopment of lower Manhattan.

Metropolitan Transportation Authority - William Wheeler

Mr. William Wheeler said he would talk about the projects being undertaken and their significance. He said that downtown was the third largest central business district in the nation. He said that a study was completed in the summer of 2001 and what people wanted was their trip improved during their lifetime. He talked about two projects—the Transit Center Project in the Dey Street area. He said that people came from all over the region to this area. The area was critical for better access. The area was very difficult to find and improvements were being made to provide connection under Dey Street to the World Trade Center site. MTA and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey had been planning since September 11, 2001 on a regular basis to make sure the connection was made and to create a surface presence so that people could see that there was a complex. This would be done between John Street and Fulton Street on Broadway. More access points would be created. Mr. Wheeler said the goal was to finish the projects by 2007 at a cost of \$750 million, a grant from Federal Transit Administration. The second project he spoke about was one that affected the service that ran through the World Trade Center. About 500 trips a day were affected after the September 11, 2001 incident. He said the #1 and #9 trains, which were damaged at the site itself, linked the lower most portion of lower Manhattan to Staten Island and the ferries. He said it was a critical service. Four hundred million dollars would be the cost of the project and an anticipated finishing date of 2007. The planning had begun for both of these projects. Mr. Wheeler said that many public meetings would be held on both projects and NYMTC would help in getting the message out.

Port Authority of New York and New Jersey – Lou Venech

Mr. Lou Venech said that like the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority) had additional information that would be available after the meeting. Mr. Venech said that although this was a great endeavor, he wished it was not thrust upon us by the September 11, 2001 attack. Mr. Venech said that at last year's meeting, there was discussion on efforts that were being made such as recovery activities and the focus of the Port Authority and other agencies was to restore transportation connections that were destroyed or disrupted by the attacks. He said that a great deal had happened since last year. He said the Port Authority had a dual responsibility--at the site itself, Port Authority was committed to working with the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) the City and the MTA and others partners to achieve shared goals, to plan initial developments of the site, especially the memorial; to plan for temporary and permanent transportation facilities and to think about how the site can contribute more effectively to the overall recovery effort in lower Manhattan. The Port Authority focus of planning has shifted to the reaction of permanent facilities to improve the transportation connections. He updated the audience on the initial recovery, and the temporary facilities. He spoke about the coordination between the MTA and Port Authority about the potential of creating a downtown transit complex to link with the project on Fulton Street which Mr. Wheeler had spoke about. The Port Authority cost estimate for the project including the track and platform work was \$2.0 Billion. Meetings were still being held with LMDC, MTA and other partners to refine the concept. Discussions were also being held with Federal Transit Administration to prepare the funding application. He said he hoped the project would be completed within 5 to 6 years. He also spoke about the World Trade Center ferry terminal and said that ferries were an integral part of the Hudson transportation system for downtown before September 11. Since then, the Port Authority had worked with New York City Department of Transportation and New Jersey agencies to expand services both as an emergency transportation link to New Jersey, but also using program funds and federal funds that have become available to work on a permanent expansion of the regional ferry network to better serve the Region. He said that the Port Authority worked with other agencies to improve commuter bus service to lower Manhattan and airport access to Newark and JFK Airports.

New York City Department of Transportation – Andrew Salkin

Mr. Andrew Salkin said that New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) had a couple of roles to play. One was to rebuild the streets in lower Manhattan; the other was traffic and construction cops. It was the role of NYCDOT to make sure that the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey projects were completed without shutting down lower Manhattan. NYCDOT was committed to working with the public, to keep them informed, and to receive input. He said that the coordination and cooperation that has taken place was unprecedented.

New York State Department of Transportation – Richard Schmalz

Mr. Richard Schmalz spoke about the 9A project. He said that 9A was the roadway that ran along the west side of Manhattan and that the roadway was built instead of Westway. It was a 5 mile landscaped boulevard that incorporated a highway, a walkway, and the Hudson River Park. The segment that was of concern was in the vicinity of the World Trade Center (WTC) which was destroyed on September 11, 2001. Because of the destruction, between September 11th and the end of March 2002, the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel was closed and there was no traffic on the west side of lower Manhattan. In mid-February, 2002 New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) let a contract to provide an interim roadway in the vicinity of Route 9A by the WTC.

A six lane interim roadway was constructed in six weeks restoring traffic on the west side and the re-opening of the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel. Mr. Schulze said that the Route 9A carried 100,000 people daily in 60,000 vehicles, providing good movement to downtown as well as local circulation. He said the needs for Route 9A was to restore functionally, the eight travel lines, the left turning lanes, while being sensitive to the building of a national monument. While looking at all options, the NYSDOT would work very closely with the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC), the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and New York City Department of Transportation, as well as with the federal agencies and Economic Development Corporation and the New York State Department of Environmental Protection. Mr. Schmalz said two alternatives for the reconstruction of Route 9A had been developed from Chambers Street to the Battery. He spoke about the extraordinary level of coordination and cooperation among all agencies. He spoke about the next steps which would be the Environmental Impact Process. He said that the public would be involved as NYSDOT moved forward with the two alternatives which would be advanced.

Mr. Boardman Said that the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation was in the middle working with all agencies.

Lower Manhattan Development Corporation – Kevin Rampe

Mr. Kevin Rampe said that the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) was formed by Governor Pataki and Mayor Guiliani to provide a coordinating role in terms of the revitalizing of lower Manhattan. LMDC was funded with \$2.80 billion in grants from the Federal Government. He said the LMDC was a planning agency. LMDC went out to the public and discovered that lower Manhattan was the third largest central business district and wanted it to become a 21st Century City. He said LMDC looked at the problems in the lower Manhattan infrastructure, specially the transportation infrastructure, from a planning prospective. He acknowledged the amount of work done by Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority), Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) and New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT). Mr. Rampe spoke about many issues--some because of the damage done to lower Manhattan, and others because of historical problems due to the lack of investments. He identified as a high priority the direct link to the airports. He reiterated the statement made about coordination among the agencies and then turned the segment over to Stefan Pryor who spoke about the report which was being prepared by LMDC, who would review the projects that were essential to restoring the

functionality that was lost on September 11 and also looking beyond to remedy the effects that September 11 caused to the economy of lower Manhattan and support the memorial that would be built. He said transportation investment downtown would be addressed in the report as well as access to the airports, funding, and air quality issues.

Ms. Amy Peterson of LMDC spoke about the coordination between NYCDOT, NYSDOT, Port Authority, US Environmental Protection Agency as well as the funding agencies. He said LMDC was scheduling regular meetings with all agencies to discuss the progress of their projects as well as the funding, scheduling, and the environmental aspects.

Mr. Boardman thanked all of the presenters.

Federal Transit Administration – Susan Schruth

Ms. Susan Schruth represented the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA). She spoke about the efforts at the federal levels for delivering federal aid to the New York region to help rebuild after the September 11 terrorist attacks. She said that once a national disaster was declared, the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) became the lead federal agency for responding to the disaster. FEMA met with agencies to make sure all assistance to New York was being delivered. Ms. Schruth said that the President had announced that \$2.75 Billion from FEMA and \$1.8 Billion of FTA funds were committed to the transportation rebuild projects. She said that after the President's announcement, FTA was named the lead agency which meant a transfer of FEMA's role to FTA. FTA would be the lead agency for environmental actions. The Administrator of FTA established a special office called the Lower Manhattan Recovery Office of which Mr. Schruth was the Director. The mission of the office was to deliver an expedited federal product and to get the transportation projects built quickly. A transportation management group was established from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, FHWA, FTA and FEMA and they met monthly to discuss the tough issues. She spoke about the informal mechanisms that were in place to make sure environmental concerns of additional ferry service were addressed. She said that FTA was committed to building the projects as soon as the project's sponsors were ready. The restoration of transit infrastructure to lower Manhattan was key to Manhattan and its future success. Ms. Schruth said that a new approach was developed to deal with the cumulative environmental impact of the projects. She said there was a list of 9 potential projects from Governor Pataki for the use of the \$4.55 Billion funds. Three of the priority projects were--South Ferry, the Fulton Street Transit Center, and the PATH Station. Other projects included the New York State Department of Transportation rebuild of West Street. She closed and said that the federal government had collapsed the FEMA and FTA requirements; therefore Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Port Authority, New York City Department of Transportation would work with FTA as the agency to administer the aid which would provide a faster product.

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency – William Muszynski

Mr. William Muszynski said with all the construction and reconstruction taking place, there was a unique opportunity to create an environmentally friendly development in the lower Manhattan area. He spoke about encouraging the use of Green technology which included the use of construction techniques and materials that minimize environmental impact. He asked that agencies promote the use of Green technology. He said that U.S. Environmental Protection Agency would do all it can to provide information on the Green vision. He asked attendees to focus on "the how" of development in Manhattan and the environmental legacy that the reconstruction would leave in the future.

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation – Carl Johnson

Mr. Carl Johnson said he appreciated the opportunity to speak. He spoke about the conformity waiver. He explained what the waiver meant and the commitment made in redeveloping the Downtown area. He said meetings would be held to discuss the programs being made and where New York State Department of Environmental Conservation was headed as more contracts are let.

Mr. Boardman said it was difficult to get things done given the amount of agencies involved. He said one of the difficulties was the public participation process. He asked people to take a moment of silence for the terrorist attack from September 11, the decision that had been made to try and end terrorist attack, and the military families involved because of that decision, as well as the loss of Zee Frank, of Landmark Studios, a frequent public participant, in addition the loss of the three staff members lost on September 11, Ignatius Adanga, Charles Lesperance, and See Wong Shum.

G. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Barry Druss – Rail Advocate

Mr. Druss said he was impressed by the meeting and all the work that was being done. He said he was not familiar with the agency or its work but would like the agency to consider the idea of an expanded station for the World Trade Center to include Metro North. It was important that people would demand a direct connection into the World Trade Center. He said the station could be a seamless station connecting the PATH and the rail trains. He thought it would improve transportation elsewhere and have collateral effects.

Alexander Saunders

Mr. Saunders said he was sorry that the two County Executives involved in the Tappan Zee and Long Island Sound were not present. He said there was a lot to talk about coordination and achieving compliance with air pollution. He spoke about two major investment studies underway--one on Long Island and one in Westchester/Rockland Counties. He said his mission was to join the two. He said all Western Europe was investing in underground highways which were much less costly. He said the technology was available for the Tappan Zee and Long Island Sound tunnel. Mr. Saunders said the Tappan Zee Bridge had to be replaced. He said there were too many trucks on the road. He hoped that NYMTC would coordinate the studies of trucks and trains. He said that there could be a transportation system in the New York region that worked but we could not have it if what we designed in the 1960's were not completed and people would have to make a 40 mile detour and merge with an ever increasing number of trucks to get to one of the major goal, which is Long Island, which is one of the major commercial areas of the nation.

George Haikalis – President of the Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc.

Mr. Haikalis was pleased that a new office space was found for the NYMTC staff and that it would include a transportation library. He said he would be delighted to assist in the building of the library while ridding his tiny apartment of a lot of material. He said that the lengthy process to find space in Manhattan, especially when there was a 15% vacancy rate in lower Manhattan for office space, weakened the planning process in this region and hindered the economic recovery of this region. He said we need to make up for this by making sure the staff is taken care of well, in their new space and their resources are made available to catch up on this serious loss. He said among the reforms that many suggested for transportation planning in this region was to find an independent host for the staff of NYMTC, partly because of the difficult procedures that have to be followed with the New York State Department of Transportation's structure. Mr. Haikalis said that he heard the three Governors of Connecticut, New York and New Jersey met to coordinate domestic security. He said the Governors need to think about economic security for the Tri-State region as well. He asked the Commissioner and Co-Chair to pass that on to the Governor that we need some kind of three state regional economic development efforts. NYMTC was doing a fine job coordinating, but should be somewhat more formalized. He

spoke about NYMTC being a Council of governments and said it operates on a consensus basis or one might say a veto power basis, which could make sense when divvying up piles of capital program dollars. He asked the Council to think about how projects are cut back or reviews and analysis were done early in the process. He said that the staff of NYMTC was doing a terrific job on the Southern Brooklyn Transportation Study and many ideas were brought up from the community, but Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) vetoed the request for using the Bay Ridge Freight line for rail passenger services as well as rail freight services. He said the service could have been analyzed using the Best Practices Model and did not think it was fair to veto a look at something. Mr. Haikalis said that the Best Practices Model could be used for MTA's fare increase and the City's plan for tolls on the East River Bridges. The Best Practices Model should be used for dealing with regional problems. He said he would like to see NYMTC be a regional "think tank", where ideas could be circulated and credible thoughts could be exchanged amongst the Council members, staff and the public. He said he would like the Council to be a little braver about these kinds of things and cut the staff a little slack so they could explore some of the really serious issues that we are facing in our region.

Charles Komanoff

Mr. Kumoniff said he lived in lower Manhattan and is a tax payer. He said he had a question for Mr. Boardman about the Best Practices Model. He said that it was good news that the model was being used on several projects. However the East River tolls were not being analyzed using the Best Practices Model. He said that over the past months, he had met with staff or elected officials to discuss East River Bridge tolls as a revenue generator, as a mobility enhancer, and as an environmental optimizer and each one had asked him--what would the traffic consequences be? He said that the Best Practices Model was not being used to analyze the issue which was at the forefront of transportation and fiscal policy discussions in the City of New York. He asked Commissioner Boardman if he would liberate the Best Practices Model, unleash the NYMTC staff, and commit to giving the public the results of what the Best Practices Model would tell. What the traffic, revenue, and air quality consequences would be if putting tolls on the East River Bridges.

Mr. Boardman thanked Mr. Kumoniff for his question and said he would get an answer to Mr. Kumoniff.

Michael Rossmly - Brooklyn Borough President's Office

Mr. Rossmly said he had two questions on the great presentations he heard. The first was for Mr. Wheeler of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) with regard to the development of lower Manhattan. He wanted Mr. Wheeler to explain the relationship of the work with the Second Avenue Subway. The second question he asked was, when the traffic conditions in lower Manhattan might be restored to pre September 11 conditions.

Mr. Wheeler said that the transit center envelope extended to William Street and questions were asked of the MTA not to preclude the possibility of connections further east in the future; therefore, MTA would design not preclude those types of connections. He said that a challenge for MTA in lower Manhattan projects identified are to understand the improvements and the fact that it's essential to enjoy those improvements quickly given the fragility of the lower Manhattan economy.

The Single Occupancy Van (SOV) ban was in effect for many reasons. In terms of how the construction would play out for the next several years, one could see it's quite extensive and it would be quite disruptive to the normal transportation system. As certain activities began to happen, new travel patterns would be reestablished. The opportunity may arise for the SOV ban to be lifted, but currently, it will remain in place, and as for managing the activities in lower Manhattan, the SOV ban helped out tremendously. The lifting of the ban would take some time.

Mr. Boardman adjourned the meeting.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Joseph Boardman, NYS Department of Transportation
Chris Boylan, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Sandy Hornick, NYC Department of City Planning
John Pilner, Putnam County
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Andrew Salkin, NYC Department of Transportation
Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive
Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive
Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Robert Arnold, Federal Highway Administration
Carl Johnson, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Letitia Thompson, Federal Transit Administration
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
William Muszynski, US Environmental Protection Agency

NYMTC Staff

Fatai Adekoya	Emma Gaitan	Darrin Moret
Aizaz Ahmed	Anthony Gawrych	Christine Rodrigues
Wieslawa Amber	Stephen Hausch	James Rubin
Gerry Bogacz	Norma Hessic	Tom Schulze
Alan Borenstein	John Lopez	Jean Shanahan
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Deinbo MacHarry	Judith Wilson
Robert Donohue	Larry McAuliffe	Kevin Wolford
Chapin Fay	Uchenna Madu	

OTHERS

Marc Ameruso	Ifay Chang
Allan Aronoff	Patricia Chemka, Westchester County DOT
Rick Backlund, FHWA	Aileen Cho
Jacob Balter, Nassau County	Carter Craft, Metro Waterfron Alliance
Elizabeth Bartlett	John Culpepper, LWHNA
Dean E. Bennett	Nancy Danzig, FTA
Lawrence Berger, Nassau County	John Deeker
Robert Brickman, Nassau County	Victor Dizengoff
Patricia Bourne, Nassau County	Barry Druss
Donald Burns	Denny Escarpeto
Anthony Carr, FTA	William C. Fahey
C. J. Catiero	Phil Ferguson, NYSDOT
Kevin Casta	Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Paul Cavota	Luke Gerfano

ATTENDANCE

OTHERS (continued)

James Graam Jr.
George Haikalis,
David Harris, NYCDOT
Jen Hensley
John Hummer, NJTPA
C. Komanoff
Debra Kustka
Michael Levine, Nassau County
Larry Malsam, NYSDOT
James Manzillo, LKB
Christopher McBride, AAA
Johnathan McDade, FHWA
Jay McLaughlin
Maurice Mitchell, L.I. Progressive Coalition
Josh Moreinis, Parsons & Brinkerhoff
Yvonne Morran
John Moye, Nassau County
Riely Olando
John Orcutt
Steven O'Neill
Sharon Persaud, MTA L.I. Bus
Amy Peterson, LMDC
John H. Prince Jr, USDOT – FTA

Stefan Pryor, LMDC
Kevin Rampe, LMDC
Dave Rettig, NYSDOT
Sarah Rios, MTA
Evelyn Rivera, USEPA
Joseph Romeo, STV
Nicolas Ronderos
Michael J. Rossmly, Bklyn Boro Pres. Office
Lawrence Salley, Westchester County DOT
Alen Saunders
Richard Schmalz, NYSDOT
Jack Schmidt, NYCDOT
Ellyn Shannon
Jay Shuffield, PANYNJ
Jeremy Soffin
Sasha Statman-Wein
Peter Sylver, Nassau Deputy County Executive
Charles Ukegbu, NYCDOT
William Wheeler, MTA
Julie Zarate-Watson
Melanie Zeman, USEPA
John Zamurs, NYSDOT

Meeting Synopsis accepted by Council on March 18, 2004

Respectfully submitted,

Andrea Miles-Cole

**SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 18, 2004 MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:15 p.m. by Mr. Joseph Boardman, the Council's permanent Co-Chair and New York State Department of Transportation's Commissioner. Mr. Boardman welcomed everyone to the meeting and thanked everyone for attending. He asked the Council members and/or their representatives to introduce themselves. It was established that there was a quorum.

B. OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Joseph Boardman spoke about the progress NYMTC made in the past year in the metropolitan area and said in terms of air conformity, NYMTC made great progress. He said one report was submitted to Congress in January. Debates at the federal level had occurred and soon would be occurring at the state level on how transportation improvement for the future would be financed. Mr. Boardman said that there had been a second extension of the TEA-21 legislation, which was supposed to have been re-authorized October, 2003, and hoped that the bill would be re-authorized soon. Mr. Boardman said that the New York State Department of Transportation had been thinking differently on how it performed its job for the future and believed that it needed to be held accountable by residents or users of the transportation system or by the legislature at the federal and/or state level for five priority result areas, which were safety of the system, security of the system, sustainability of the environmental improvement that was made, the economic sustainability or improvement that could be made in the economy and the mobility and reliability of the transportation system. He said the "just-in-time" delivery of a good or a person became critically more important and said that a greater need for reliability of the transportation system was necessary for all modes. Mr. Boardman said that since September 11, 2001 in New York City, a heavier emphasis had been on security. He said that Congress was looking at how they might be able to improve the security and safety of additional transportation facilities because of its importance to maintain for that security and that safety. Mr. Boardman said that the transportation industry could make improvement in water quality because of the run off from the roadway and could make improvement in the quality of life in a community based on "Context-Sensitive Solutions". He said that the transportation industry could also make improvements in the economic environment by making sure there was a reliable connection across the region and across the country. He said the level and how projects were chosen for the future needed to be based on the five priority result areas.

Ms. Amanda Burden spoke about the government structure and density, the challenges, and opportunities for the region. Ms. Burden said with a combination of density and transit infrastructure available to us, we had levels of transit ridership that were unrivaled by any other North American city. Our transit network allowed us to minimize energy consumption and to continue to accommodate economic growth while at the same time, reduce production of greenhouse gases and other environmental pollutants. Ms. Burden said that NYMTC was essential to achieving these goals and NYMTC performed many vital functions for the region, and said that its' efforts were often invaluable to the work of each of the Council's agencies. She then spoke about NYC Department of City Planning's

plan for the redevelopment of the Westside of Manhattan, where the tradition of coordinating land use and development with investment in transportation and other infrastructure was built on. She said NYMTC's forecast of population and employment had formed a basis for much of the analysis of the future transportation demands of the development area. Ms. Burden spoke about the planning of the revitalization of lower Manhattan and the continued growth in downtown Brooklyn and said that NYMTC must continue to be the forum to ensure that land use and infrastructure planning go hand-in-hand so that progress toward improving mobility and air quality continued. Ms. Burden said that she looked forward on continuing to work with NYMTC and the other member agencies on shaping the transportation network to accommodate the growth and development that would keep the region vibrant for years to come. She welcomed NYMTC back to lower Manhattan, to help continue its revitalization, and wished NYMTC many productive years in their new Water Street office.

C. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Robert Dennison, the Council's Secretary, delivered the Executive Director's report. Mr. Dennison welcomed Council members, agency staffs and members of the public. He mentioned the passing of Debra Murray, a secretary of NYMTC, who died in service on March 3, 2004 after being ill for ten months with the Lou Gehrig disease and asked for a moment of silence in her memory. Mr. Dennison said that on January 1, 2004, Tom Schulze, the former Executive Director of NYMTC, resigned from NYMTC to accept a position with New Jersey Transit. He thanked Alan Borenstein, Gerry Bogacz and Kuo-Ann Chiao, the three Group Directors of NYMTC for stepping up and managing NYMTC as a team. He said that someone would be selected as the Acting Executive Director and the process of filling the job on a permanent basis would begin. Mr. Dennison reported that, after 2 ½ years, NYMTC received a signed a lease for office space located at 199 Water Street in lower Manhattan. Mr. Dennison then spoke about the NYMTC products underway or completed and mentioned that the Regional Transportation Plan discussion document was available and that public meetings were being held to gather input. He said that the Best Practices Model (BPM) was up and running and was being used on ten ongoing major investment studies in the NYMTC region. He said that the BPM was becoming a more useful and vital tool and the run time had been cut in half. Mr. Dennison referenced the NYMTC website, www.nymtc.org and said that there were many studies that were completed and data available to download or view.

D. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: MARCH 21, 2003 MEETING SYNOPSIS

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to accept the March 21, 2003 Council Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Westchester County Executive Spano and seconded by Nassau County Executive Suozzi. The synopsis was accepted.

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2004-2005 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM

Mr. Boardman said that the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) sets the Council's priorities and work schedule for the fiscal year. He said that the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) endorsed the UPWP at its February 19, 2004 meeting. Mr. Boardman then introduced Mr. Alan Borenstein and Mr. Gerry Bogacz to talk about the UPWP and introduced the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Alan Borenstein, with the help of slides, provided the details about the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP). He said that the UPWP was the key element of the metropolitan planning process; a strategic program; a budget; a grant application and a required product of the planning process. He said that software had been developed so that the members were able to enter their UPWP information via access to the website. He said the UPWP provided a strategic framework for the regional metropolitan transportation process and NYMTC as a planning organization. It also provided a financial framework which supported NYMTC operations, funded important consultant work and supported the members planning programs. Mr. Borenstein said the total UPWP program was approximately 36 million dollars which included new funds and carryover funds. He said the document was available at the sign in table as well as on the NYMTC website, www.nymtc.org.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, with the help of slides, said that the work program was built from two key elements that provided a foundation—(1) NYMTC’s mission statement and (2) the regional goals that were defined in the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The work program was built from concepts that were defined in the RTP for further study, as well as from a prospectus assembled through listening sessions, and from staff and member agencies priorities and needs. Mr. Bogacz said that the required planning products, by law, in the work program included a Regional Transportation Plan, a Transportation Improvement Program, and a Unified Planning Work Program, as a body, so that the NYMTC region could remain eligible for federal funding for transportation improvements. NYMTC was also required to perform a congestion management analysis of the RTP and air quality conformity analysis. Mr. Bogacz said the planning process operational components in the work program included the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC), the three Transportation Coordinating Committees, and nine advisory groups that advised the members of NYMTC on various topics. There were various ad-hoc planning groups and study committees that operated, workshops were provided, focus groups met, planning forums were held, public information meetings were conducted, and a newsletter and website were maintained. Mr. Bogacz said that Best Practices Model, integrated data collection, and the socio-economic forecasts were a few of the technical components of the work program and the foundation of the planning process. He said the major investment studies were essential in defining the future in the region, the sustainable development studies were a new approach to bringing land use and transportation planning closer together, and sub-area and corridor studies looked at different components of the transportation system. Mr. Bogacz highlighted some of the new, first time, projects in the work program such as the Assessment of Freight Villages, the Henry Hudson Parkway Corridor Management Plan, and the River Towns Traffic Calming Study in Westchester, Nassau County’s Traffic Signal Progression Study and the Staten Island Ferry Planning, and the model and feasibility studies. Mr. Bogacz talked about NYMTC’s new funding program, the September 11th Memorial Program, which was a planning and academic program to memorialize the three NYMTC staff members who perished on September 11, 2001, Ignatius Adanga, Charles Lesperance and See Wong Shum. He said that the program would include solicitation of proposals for planning activities and would provide academic assistance for students completing their education in specific career fields. Mr. Bogacz concluded by thanking the members for their support and consideration of this memorial program.

Mr. Boardman asked if there were any questions or comments for Mr. Bogacz. There were none.

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to adopt the 2004-2005 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Amanda Burden representing New York City Department of City Planning and seconded by Robert Shinnick representing Suffolk County Executive Steve Levy. There was no discussion. The resolution unanimously passed.

Honorable Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive, said that he was very pleased that the plan incorporated \$130,000 for Westchester County to do a critical infrastructure survey because the County was doing an all hazard plan for emergencies. Mr. Spano said that all projects discussed and incorporated the awareness for emergencies that could occur. Mr. Spano then asked his surrounding county colleagues to join in on the study.

Honorable C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County Executive, said that he was pleased that emergency awareness was raised a number of times by Mr. Spano and not only would he be pleased to join, but also intended solicit for some additional dollars to do a study of their own for emergency planning mobility, in particular, the surrounding Indian Point area.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-2 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO TOM SCHULZE

Mr. Boardman said that Tom Schulze was NYMTC's Executive Director from 1999 to 2003 and had represented the Council and PFAC. He said that Tom had accepted a position with New Jersey Transit to manage the Access to the Region's Core Project and he was being recognized for his service to the Council and PFAC.

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to adopt the Recognition of Service to Tom Schulze Resolution. A motion was made by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, representing Rockland County, and seconded by Chris Boylan representing Katherine Lapp of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority. There was no discussion. The resolution passed unanimously.

Mr. Boardman presented Tom Schulze with a plaque and read the resolution printed on it. Mr. Boardman said that Mr. Schulze held things together at a time when it was very difficult for all, and with staff losing staff. He thanked Mr. Schulze wholeheartedly for all the things he did, not just for the requirement of the job, but for the compassion and love he showed to his fellow man and patience he had as NYMTC tried to rebuild.

Mr. Schulze said that it was wonderful to be back for the Annual Council Meeting and more wonderful to come back as a member. He said he was happy to hear that the lease had moved forward. He said he appreciated all the warm wishes he received from the people and from the Council through the resolution and plaque. Mr. Schulze said that he could not accept it without acknowledging the hard work and many accomplishments all of the NYMTC staff and members achieved during the six years he was with NYMTC. Mr. Schulze said that despite the many small and large challenges NYMTC had to overcome, he was very proud. He said he was very proud of the NYMTC staff. Mr. Schulze closed by thanking everyone for their support, their confidence and their good will given to him while he worked at NYMTC and said that the plaque presented to him and continued friendships would be important to him forever.

4a. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-3 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO AMANDA BURDEN

A motion was made to adopt Resolution 2004-3 – Recognition of Service to Amanda Burden, Director of New York City Department of City Planning and also Co-Chairperson of NYMTC by Mr. Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive, and seconded by Mr. C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County Executive. The Resolution unanimously passed.

Mr. Boardman presented Ms. Amanda Burden with a plaque for recognition of one year service as the Council's Co-Chairperson and thanked Ms. Burden for her service.

Ms. Amanda Burden said that NYMTC played a key role in making this region regional issues work. Ms. Burden said she had been proud and privileged to service as Co-Chairperson and thanked Mr. Boardman and the Council.

4b. CONFIRM: NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIRPERSON – ANDREW SPANO, WESTCHESTER COUNTY EXECUTIVE

Mr. Boardman said that a new incoming co-chairperson for NYMTC will be confirmed. He explained the Memo of Understanding for the Council in which the co-chairperson was rotated annually among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees--The Mid-Hudson South, Nassau/Suffolk, and New York City. Mr. Boardman said that this year the Co-Chairperson would be the Honorable Andrew Spano, County Executive of Westchester County. Mr. Spano was approved by a unanimous vote as the rotating Co-Chair for April 2004 to March 2005.

Mr. Boardman said that County Executive Andrew J. Spano became Westchester's seventh County Executive on January 1, 1998 and was re-elected to office in November 2001 with 73 percent of the vote—the highest margin of victory in the county's history. Mr. Boardman provided a brief biography on the Honorable Spano and said that he was happy to have Mr. Spano as Co-Chair of NYMTC.

Mr. Spano said that he was looking forward to being the Co-Chair and said that looking at things regionally was so significant. He said that so much of what happened in New York City affected the quality of lives of those in Westchester or Rockland County and it affected how emergencies were conducted. He said that 55,000 people came to work in Westchester County and many had come from Queens, Brooklyn, Manhattan and the Bronx and because of this things like the Second Avenue Subway and where it linked at its northern end was important to the counties. Mr. Spano said he looked forward to his tenure in working with everyone. He said that it was very important to listen and get involved and said that was what he had planned to do.

E. ROUNDTABLE – TRANSPORTATION VISIONS AND PROJECTS

Mr. Boardman said that there were seven speakers who would talk about their transportation vision and projects. He then introduced Mr. Thomas Suozzi, County Executive for Nassau County to speak.

Nassau County Hub Major Investment Study – Nassau County Executive Thomas Suozzi

County Executive Thomas Suozzi thanked the Council for the opportunity to speak and apologized in advance that he had to leave after he gave his presentation. Mr. Suozzi provided some history of Nassau County, saying that it's the nation's first modern suburb and that Levittown was the first suburban community in the history of the United States of America. Mr. Suozzi talked about Nassau County's financial problems and how the county's bond ratings were one step above junk bond status. He said that Nassau County had a \$428M deficit which led him to make many changes within his workforce and operations. He said that Nassau County received six bond upgrades and were recovering financially. Mr. Suozzi talked about how the problems discovered within the county were not related just to the fiscal mismanagement that took place, but talked about how Nassau County stopped growing. He said that the population grew tremendously from the 1950's to the 1970's and was the fastest growing county

in the USA with a population of 1.5 million, but today, the population had decreased by two million. There was no growth in offices, stores and homes because there was very little land left in the county and the commercial strips were over-developed with too much traffic. Mr. Suozzi talked about how the county had pockets of poverty, two failing school districts, segregated neighborhoods, no affordable housing for the young and elderly, and high property taxes. He also talked about the positive aspects of Nassau County such as low crime, low unemployment and raising property values. Mr. Suozzi then talked about how the county did not have any growth in their revenues, but dramatic growth in their expenses, escalating taxes and insurance costs. Mr. Suozzi said that Nassau County needed to grow and therefore needed to change the county's suburban lifestyle by marrying together the elements of the suburban dream with targeted growth and targeted locations and targeted industries that would supply money for the county to support the government and improve the county's quality of life. He called it "New Suburbia". He said New Suburbia was a ten point plan that would target high skilled, high-tech industries and sports, entertainment and tourism in four locations—traditional downtowns, brown fields, minority neighborhoods that were under-invested and the Nassau County Hub, which was the center of Nassau County and the most important economic engine of the county. Mr. Suozzi said the Nassau Hub had to connect to Northern Nassau County, Southern Nassau County, New York City and Suffolk County. He said the Nassau Hub should be the downtown of Long Island. He talked about the transportation needs to get into the Nassau Hub by mass transit. He said that twenty-nine alternatives were identified as to what was needed for the Nassau Hub and was in the process of limiting those alternatives down. He talked about utilizing the Garden City secondary line to connect to the Nassau Hub and to Mineola, Hempstead and West Hempstead. Mr. Suozzi said that the support from the entire region was needed. He said that making this investment would not only improve the quality of life and improve travel time, but would also an investment that would pay off in the future. The jobs and housing that would be created from this investment would bring in new revenue not only to Nassau County, but to the State of New York and to the federal government as well, which would make us economically more powerful. Mr. Suozzi talked about how New York, New Jersey and Connecticut subsidized the growth of other parts of the country and while they obtain new roads, bridges, mass transportation lines, new schools, newer services, New York, New Jersey and Connecticut received dollars enough to just fix up the old stuff and get by on a day to day basis. He said that we were being short changed by the federal government and we needed to be unified as a region to try to get dollars to help us to do the important work we do. He said that there needed to be a coordinated effort with New York and other states to recognize that the rules set up 30 or 40 years ago needed to be changed.

Rockland County Transportation Challenges – Rockland County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef

County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef said that Rockland County had been and would continue to be very supportive of NYMTC. Mr. Vanderhoef said that over the course of history, Rockland County had been essentially a county whose past was dictated by transportation initiatives. He said that the first ever railroad for passenger went to Piermont Pier, which was called Tappan Pier in the 1850's. He said the roads that were built in Rockland County prior to the Tappan Zee Bridge were roads that served much of the brick and straw industries, rock and irons mines, and railroad cars that existed, which eventually led to the recognition that a thing called a thruway would be good for Rockland and good for the region. Mr. Vanderhoef said that in 1955, the Tappan Zee Bridge was built and changed Rockland County forever. He said that Rockland County was an agriculture county which housed over 150 farms and currently there were about five farms. He said that Rockland County was growing in population and diversity. Mr. Vanderhoef said that Rockland County was growing through its transformation attaching to all the other counties that were in NYMTC and other Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPO's). Mr. Vanderhoef said to Tom Schulze that he was pleased he was with New Jersey Transit because it was

so critical to Rockland County. He said that New Jersey Transit's, Access to the Region's Core, would make an enormous difference on those competing scenarios on how we move people in and out of Rockland County. He said that NYMTC must talk to Orange County, which is a separate MPO, about how to improve transportation from Orange County, Sullivan County, Ulster County to New York City through Westchester. Mr. Vanderhoef said that the Interstate-287 Corridor changed Rockland County's history and its diversity and that the county's future was linked to that very corridor. He said when there is talk about replacement of the Tappan Zee Bridge, it's not just talk about a bridge but talk about the future of Westchester and Rockland Counties. He said when transportation issues were looked at with NYMTC colleagues and other colleagues from other MPO's, the destiny of the entire county of Rockland would be reviewed, as well as the State of New York and he was very pleased to be a part of it. Mr. Vanderhoef said that it was taken quite seriously that while there may be competing interest within NYMTC, there were none which were mutually exclusive if everyone worked together; and if everyone worked together, then the ultimate end would be that this region and this MPO will be the highlight of the United States with respect to planning, thinking and investing in transportation.

Hudson RiverWalk – Westchester County Executive Andrew Spano

County Executive Spano said that quality of life was the single most important aspect and asset for Westchester County and was the reason why companies and people moved to the county, and for that reason, he would focus on preserving the county's quality of life. He talked about the county's diversity. He said there were almost one million people, different ethnic groups and 35% of the population was minorities. Mr. Spano said that transportation was a very critical issue because of the traffic that traveled through the county, affected the county's quality of life. He said that trying to find a balance between the county's quality of life and the needs for the region was very tough and he acknowledged New York City as the engine of their economy. Mr. Spano then talked about Westchester's RiverWalk. He said that RiverWalk was a 46 mile greenway trail along the Hudson River from Peekskill to Yonkers that had open space initiatives, housing developments and economic development opportunities. There were fourteen municipalities, twenty-nine segments, eighteen miles of trail way in place and seven miles in the planning stage, and the RiverWalk connected directly with thirteen Metro-North Hudson Line Stations. He said that the county had a legacy program where the county would put in money to develop new parks and then would turn the parks over to the localities. The localities would maintain and run the parks. He said the county was trying to create the infrastructure walk and then have the creative aspects of each individual town and city approach it from their perspective with the assistance of the county's Planning Department. Mr. Spano said that the RiverWalk document was published so people could get an idea of what it was and view the different stages that it was in and the different problems that were encountered. He said that the project was split into 29 segments so that it could be approached segment by segment, in any order. He said the RiverWalk would represent sustainable, inter-modal transportation by connecting with thirteen Metro-North Rail stations and connecting with 27 Bee Line Bus routes, including the Tappan Zee Express. He said that the RiverWalk would represent smart growth by providing non-motorized access to and between downtown centers, residential areas and parks and by reducing automobile trips and improving accessibility for everyone. He said that the RiverWalk would also represent improved quality of life by increasing non-motorized access to reduce traffic. Mr. Spano said that a Guidelines Manual for the RiverWalk Greenway Trail was available. He talked about design possibilities for trails through existing parking areas, trails on shorelines, trails adjacent to railroads and transforming urban waterfronts to bring people to the river. Mr. Spano said that people would use the trails to get from place to place because it would be easier to take bikes to get to places than taking vehicles and it would offer pleasure and increase or at least contribute to the quality of life in Westchester County.

Access to the Region's Core – Tom Schulze, Program Manager, New Jersey Transit

Tom Schulze gave a presentation on Access to the Region's Core on behalf of Richard Roberts and apologized for him not being able to attend the meeting. Tom Schulze said that Access to the Region's Core (ARC) was a draft Environmental Impact Statement being prepared by New Jersey Transit in partnership with Port Authority of New York and New Jersey. He said that the project was a complicated project going through some complicated areas but the pace on the project would pick up over the next six months. Mrs. Schulze said that there would be more need for contact with agencies in New York and New Jersey and with public groups to ensure people understood what the project was and then the necessary planning on the project would be done. He then described the project. Mr. Schulze said that ARC was a new two track railroad between downtown Newark, New Jersey and the vicinity of Penn Station in New York which required new tracks in the Meadowlands and a new two track tunnel under the Hudson River. He said that there was a loop in Secaucus that would connect New Jersey Transit lines that travel into Bergen, Orange and Rockland Counties that would give area residents a one seat ride into New York for the first time. Mr. Schulze described three options for new station facility locations that were being looked into. One would be a deep tunnel about 150 feet beneath the block between 30th and 31st Streets; the second would be a deeper tunnel, about 170 feet beneath the existing Penn Station and the third option would be under the Right-Of-Way of 34th Street. He said that since 1994, the number of trains going between New Jersey and Penn Station grew from 88 to 186 and there had been a high increase in demand for rail service into the area because of growth and population in jobs. Also, because of the changes in the way New Jersey Transit ran train service in New Jersey such as the Midtown Direct, which generated increased demand for rail service into Penn Station. He said that recreation had increased demand in which 16% or 2.5 million of theatre goers come from West of the Hudson River. Mr. Schulze said that scoping was completed in December 2003 and the scoping document was in the process on being completed. Sixty comments from the public were received and were being incorporated into the scoping document. He said the draft Environment Impact Statement should be completed by the summer of 2005 and a final Environment Impact Statement should be completed by mid 2006. Mr. Schulze said that construction for the first operating segment was anticipated by late 2007 and the first phase operation by 2010-2012. For more information on this project check the website at www.accesstotheregionscore.com

Regional Connectivity – Lou Venech, Chief Planner, Port Authority of New York & New Jersey

Mr. Lou Venech said that he was adding the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey's (PANYNJ) message of importance to provide a framework for the joint planning in the region and would talk about PANYNJ's upcoming projects. Mr. Venech said that since the attacks of September 11, 2001, the PANYNJ was stretched in financial and in human in institutional terms as never before. He said that the PANYNJ had advanced lower Manhattan recovery working with others, opened Air Train JFK in cooperation with the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and other agencies, and committed to rail freight and bridge and tunnel improvements affecting both sides of the Hudson River. He said that NYMTC was an invaluable resource to foster the kinds of multi-agency planning that was going to be needed to keep the region moving. He said that the PANYNJ was bringing a new lower Manhattan ferry terminal, in partnership with New York City and with communities in the Hudson Valley to bring additional ferry service, but NYMTC's Long Island Sound Waterborne Transportation Plan helped with a roster of services containing a real ferry network that serviced the water metropolitan region. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ had partnered with both New York City and New York State Department of Transportation on rail freight capital improvements and worked to better manage truck flow at

crossings, but NYMTC's forth coming Regional Freight Plan would help support informed decision making about the next wave of highway and rail freight investments that would be needed to keep regional business competitive. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ fine-tuned access busses and trucks at the Holland Tunnel to make the best use of the facility in a very congested part of the region, but was counting on NYMTC's Canal Street Area Corridor Study to provide a long term look at a platform for the affected agencies to work together and consider future option for best mangering the local and regional traffic that had relied on this corridor historically. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ created the Air Train services along with transit partners and supported planning for expansion of passenger rail transit throughout the region, but NYMTC provided an overall framework for the region's transit agencies to understand together the pivotal role of Penn Station as a shared regional asset for communities from both states and for inter-city rail and for airport passengers. Mr. Venech said that NYMTC and the neighboring Metropolitan Planning Organization's helped all to see the region as a whole. He said that the PANYNJ was restraining to repair and modernize its existing facilities, while upgrading security and improving the reliability of the facilities and services. He said that the PANYNJ had preserved and added to its funding partnerships with other operators in host cities to the limits of its resources. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ did not attend meeting to casts votes, but attended to plan and to partner with other agencies and jurisdictions. He said that NYMTC didn't have to become a household word to be successful in its mission, but there wasn't a household in the region that wouldn't benefit from the things that were achieved together.

Metropolitan Transportation Authority – Deputy Executive Director Christopher Boylan

Mr. Christopher Boylan talked about some of the progress the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) had made in the last 20 years and where MTA was heading in the future. Mr. Boylan said that twenty years ago, MTA was headlined as a national disgrace because of daily breakdowns, fires, endless waits, high crimes and debt. He said twenty years later, MTA had improved on most of those issues and had invested about fifty billion dollars into the system. The current levels of investment were about three and a half billion dollars a year. He said that MTA added new subway cars and retired old fleets, such as the John Rocker Express. He said that the MTA bought new M7 rail cars for the Long Island Rail Road, which provided a nicer, cleaner and smother ride and improved the mean distance, which translated into fewer late and/or canceled trains. Mr. Boylan said that 103 new clean fueled busses were added to the New York City Transit fleet and another 300 were on the way. He said that the Long Island Bus fleet would have the largest CNG bus fleet in the country after they obtain 58 additional busses by the end of the year. Mr. Boylan talked about the Capital Construction Company, MTA's new family member, who was in charge of the mega projects, like the Eastside Access Project, the Second Avenue Subway, the work that would be done on the #7 line, the projects in lower Manhattan and the security projects. He said it would bring a singular engineering focus to all those projects. Mr. Boylan talked about the MTA's link to the new Air Train project, in conjunction with PANYNJ and how it had been successful with getting people from Howard Beach and Jamaica to JFK Airport in a convenient and inexpensive way. Mr. Boylan said that Metrocard had been added to a new station with PATH in lower Manhattan. MTA's Metrocard had also been added to the Air Train and to the Roosevelt Island Operation Company for the tram that traveled to Roosevelt Island. He said that the technologies of Metrocard, coupled with E-Z Pass, helped improve service for the region, dramatically. Mr. Boylan said that the MTA tried to take a little bit of the edge off of the fare increase by lowering the buy in on the Metrocard, by providing discounted rates of 20% on the multi-ride cards. The MTA had also provided balance protection for people who purchased monthly cards. He said that the average fare was about \$1.26, factoring into the average customers used some kind of discounted fare media. Mr. Boylan said

that the use of E-Z Pass provided benefits to customers by eliminating congestion, cleaning the air and saving dollars on roundtrips. Mr. Boylan then talked about some of MTA's projects. He said that the MTA was working through the Environmental Impact Statement with the Federal Transit Administration for the Second Avenue Subway and were working with New York City on the financing plan for the #7 line. He said that the Fulton Transit Center Project should be completed by 2007. Services would be linked with the PATH Concourse for the \$750 million project and would re-volumize transportation into and around lower Manhattan. He said the South Ferry Terminal project would create a new terminal down at South Ferry instead of the little loop that existed and would increase capacity in lower Manhattan and the Westside IRT line because ten car trains would be able to platform and more people would board on and off quickly. Mr. Boylan said that there were some significant projected out-year deficits in terms of MTA's operating budget and they were faced with renewing the current capital program. He said the projected out-year deficits were structural imbalances that stemmed primarily from raising debts service costs, increased health and pension welfare expenses and the depletion of some of the non recurrent revenue sources that was benefited from over the last few years. He said that debt services would grow, operating revenues pension cost would double by 2007, health & welfare cost would increase. He said that he would hope that the next capital program would be the same size and scope at least as the existed program, which was approximately twenty billion dollars. Mr. Boylan then talked about security and how it was an entirely new area for the MTA to address through the capital program. Mr. Boylan said that MTA was celebrating its 100th anniversary of the subway system and that fortunately, people a hundred years ago had vision, insight and the support to build the system that really made the region work. He said that the MTA was looking to their funding partners to help them be as creative as they headed into the next century.

Harlem River Bridges – Deputy Commissioner Gwen Perlman

Ms. Gwen Perlman said that she would talk about what the New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) would be doing with its next large federal project. She said that previous funds were mostly devoted to the East-River Bridge Program and over a billion dollars in federal aid was used to restore the bridges, and that the department was organizing a similar project for the Harlem River Bridges. Ms. Perlman said that the NYCDOT was nearing completion of the four East River Bridge Program receiving one billion dollars from the federal government and two billion dollars from city and state funds. She said that the last project in the East River Bridge Restoration Program would begin in 2010 and should be completed by 2013. She provided a summary of what was done on the four east river bridges and the costs. Ms. Perlman then talked about the Harlem River Bridge. She said that those bridges were Manhattan's link to the northeast and they carried over 340 thousand vehicles per day. She said the Harlem River Bridge Program consisted of the Broadway Bridge, University Heights Bridge, Macomb's Dam Bridge, 145th Street Bridge, Madison Avenue Bridge, The Third Avenue Bridge, the East 127th Street Viaduct was being included, the Willis Avenue Bridge and the Wards Island Bridge. She said with the exception of Wards Island Bridge, they were all movable bridges. She said the Broadway Bridge carried three tracks of the IRT on its upper deck in addition to vehicles; the University Heights bridges was completed; the Macomb's Dam Bridge would be completed by fall 2004; work had begun on the Third Avenue Bridge and work on the 145th Street Bridge would begin soon. She said that all projects would include incentive and disincentive clauses, which would penalize contractors for not completing work on time and would provide financial incentive to those who completed work earlier. She said the total cost for all of the projects would be 713 million dollars. Ms. Perlman said the biggest and most ambitious project within the program was the Willis Avenue Bridge and provided history on the bridge. The Willis Avenue Bridge, the third oldest bridge in system, was opened to the traffic in 1901. She said the Willis Avenue Bridge expanded the Harlem River Drive on the Manhattan side and

the Oak Point Link Rail Road and other businesses on the Bronx. The Willis Avenue Bridge carried traffic to the Bronx and its neighboring Third Avenue Bridge brought traffic from Manhattan. It carried approximately 71,000 vehicles per day. Ms. Perlman said the plan for the Willis Avenue Bridge was a completely off line new replacement bridge and said that the new bridge would be built to the south of the current structure which would help ease traffic problems during construction and would address most of the bridges geometry issues. The Willis Avenue Bridge would be a spring span bridge after completion and at the State's request new approach ramps on the Bronx side would be completed. Ms. Perlman said that the project was in the design phase, with 60% completed, and construction was expected to begin Spring 2007 and should be finished by 2012. Ms. Perlman said that federal funds were requested to pay for the project and that the NYCDOT would ask congressional delegation to support earmarking funds to pay 80% of the expected 713 million dollar cost of the program.

F. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Dee Vandenburg – United Transportation Union/Staten Island Taxpayers' Association, Inc.

Ms. Vandenburg introduced herself as the President of the Staten Island Taxpayers' Association, Inc. and as the Local Chair of the Local 1440 United Transportation Union of Staten Island Railway. She addressed New York State Department of Transportation and said that all mapped, unbuilt service roads needed to be completed and that three million dollars for the Staten Island Railway Park & Rides, which was ISTEA money at one time and was allocated, now faced problems getting Park & Rides. She said that the Staten Island Railway ridership gave the appearance that it had declined, but it didn't. Everyone drove their vehicles. She said that Richmond was the fastest growing county and were in dire need for improvements. She said that people from Staten Island had the longest commute on the entire east coast to get to work. Ms. Vandenburg then addressed the New York City Department of Transportation and said left hand turning arrows was needed to be placed on all traffic signals where there were existing turning bays and synchronized traffic lights to keep rush hour traffic moving. She said that Staten Island had become a pass through borough. Ms. Vandenburg asked the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey to look into a fast ferry site for the South Shore in the vicinity of Mount Loretto and the New York City Department of Parks Fishing Pier on Sharrots Avenue. She said that the North Shore Passenger Line needed to be up and running immediately. Ms. Vandenburg then addressed the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and said that the Staten Island Railway needed to not be left out in the cold because it was a vital part of transportation on Staten Island and the fare needed to be put back on this line. She said that the elimination of the fare with daytime riders affected the transit venue and rail was once again the future. She said funding streams were vital and the Verrazano Bridge needed to supply the county's fair share. Ms. Vandenburg said that the Metropolitan Transportation Authority needed to work with New York State Department of Transportation on getting Park & Rides in place where they were originally planned and work on enhancing connecting bus routes.

Hilary Hinds Kitasei – Henry Hudson Parkway Task Force

Ms. Kitasei said that the Henry Hudson Parkway Task Force included representatives of thirteen parks, four community board districts, seven historic districts, property owner associations, cultural institutions, and environmental and preservation organizations which all had a stake in the future of the 11.1 mile parkway corridor. She said that there were many agencies and authorities with jurisdiction over the corridor and many of them were represented on the NYMTC board. Ms. Kitasei thanked NYMTC for daring to undertake this collaboration to develop design guidelines based on a shared vision for the historic parkway and said that the Task Force was committed to support and participate in the process required to designate the Henry Hudson Parkway a New York Scenic Byway for the several years it is expected to take. She said that the Task Force was fortunate to have the leadership of

NYMTC, whose members come from regions and agencies where the Scenic Byways program was successfully applied and everyone would be in a position to establish the Henry Hudson Parkway not only the first scenic byway in New York City but a national model for urban scenic byways. She then explained that the Task Force also served on the Hudson River Valley Scenic Byway Steering Committee, a project of the Hudson River Valley Greenway to explore the potential for a regional system of scenic byways and the committee also identified Route 9A in New York City, as a potential New York Scenic Byway, which would make the New York Harbor, Statue of Liberty, and the World Trade Center Site the origin and terminus of a Hudson River Valley Scenic Byway and Greenway. Ms. Kitasei then requested the Council to consider expanding the scope of this project to include all of Route 9A, in which the Committee would continue public outreach to stakeholders throughout the corridor. Ms. Kitasei again thanked the Council for supporting the Scenic Byway initiative for New York City.

Joe Hartigan - Rockaway Action Committee

Mr. Hartigan said that he was a recent retired Fire Lieutenant and questioned why there wasn't any talk about terrorism in any of the discussions. He said the New York City subway system was wide open. There was a State law that was changed in regards to driving 15,000 gallons of gas in trucks that traveled on city streets over subway grates. He said that hot dog trucks on city corners contain propane and some buildings in lower Manhattan stored 20,000 gallons of diesel fuel in basements, and that vent pipes were within fifty feet of subway grates. He also said that there were parking lots, such as the Riis Park and Orchard Park parking lots, one mile south of the Belt Parkway that could be used for tours along the Hudson River. He said not to utilize an alternative transportation that was available, with a minimum expense, was foolish.

Luis E. Reyes, representing Council Member Alan J. Gerson, First District/Lower Manhattan

Mr. Reyes spoke on Council Member Alan Gerson's behalf, who was not able to attend the meeting. Mr. Reyes said that Council Member Gerson congratulated the honoree Tom Schulze and looked forward to meeting with him and he congratulated the NYMTC board for the work that they were doing and said all of the solutions that were necessary for his district needed to be regionally coordinated solutions. Mr. Reyes said that adequate parking was needed and requested that parking be considered in any solutions and studies that were being undertaken in lower Manhattan. He said that the parking situation could only get worse as the building continued. Mr. Reyes said that Mr. Gerson requested for a study that would address the problem of wholesalers that existed in Chinatown, Soho, and the lower Eastside because of the huge trucks that cause significant congestion. He asked for a study that would create a terminal somewhere in lower Manhattan or possibly in Brooklyn, that would serve as a transfer point from large trucks to smaller trucks that could then deliver to businesses in lower Manhattan. He requested a study to decrease the traffic traveling through lower Manhattan. He said that the traffic from New Jersey received free round trip, from the Verrazano-Narrows Bridge, the free no toll on the East River crossings, and then crossed back into New Jersey through the toll free Holland Tunnel. He said that the technology like E-Z Pass should be used.

Mr. Boardman adjourned the meeting.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Joseph Boardman, NYS Department of Transportation
Chris Boylan, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning
Gwen Perlman, NYC Department of Transportation
John Pilner, Putnam County
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive
Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive
C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Robert Arnold, Federal Highway Administration
Ron Borsollino, US Environmental Protection Agency
Carl Johnson, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Tom Schulze, New Jersey Transit
Karen Shannon, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority
Letitia Thompson, Federal Transit Administration
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

NYMTC Staff

Aizaz Ahmed	Emma Gaitan	Uchenna Madu
Robert Angell	Anthony Gawrych	Larry McAuliffe
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Stephen Hausch	Deinbo MacHarry
Gerry Bogacz	Jan Khan	Andrea Miles-Cole
Alan Borenstein	Navaid Khalil	Karen Rosenberger
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Carl King	Vividiana Vivar
Nina DelSenno	David Kletsman	Judith Wilson
Dan Evans	John Lopez	

OTHERS

Christina Alexiou, STV, Inc.	Robert Brickman, Nassau County
James Anderson, PBQD	Tyler Burke, Tri-State Transportation Campaign
Alfred Angiola, Cashin Associates	Subimal Chakraborti, NYSDOT
Arthur Anthonisen, Orange Co. Citi Found	Patricia Chemka, Westchester County DOT
Vincent Antonecchia, Westchester County	Howard Chynsky, HAKS Engineers
Alan Aronoff, Brookhaven Women Voters	Bradley P. Craig, LAK
Tony Augusto, DMJM	Liz Covorti, Office of State Comptroller
Richard Backlund, FHWA	Nancy Danzig, FTA
Jacob Balter, Nassau County Planning	James Dean, Orangetown Highway Development
Vince Barone, FHWA	Robert Dennison III, NYSDOT
Elizabeth Bartlett, NYSDEC	Beverly Dolinsky, PCAC/MTA
Lawrence Berger, Nassau County Planning	Frank Eadie
Pam Bortorl, LIRR	Dunson O. Eisele, NJ Transit
Patricia Bourne, Nassau Co. Planning Commission	William Fahey, Liberty Lines

ATTENDANCE

OTHERS (continued)

Christie Fasano, NY League of Conserv. Voters
Luke Galfano, Lockwood Kessler & Bartlett
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Paul Gisondo, Westchester County Planning
William K. Gord, NYC TRC
Robert Griffith, FHWA
Richard Gualtieri, NYSDOT
David Harris, NYCDOT
Joe Hartigan, Rockaway Action Committee
Rick Herbek, Village of Croton
Jennifer Hoppa, NYC Parks & Recreation
Sandy Hornick, NYCDCP
Michael Jones, PB
Gary Kassof, US Coast Guard
Irwin Kessman, FTA
Peter G. King, NYSDOT
Danielle Kisinger, SSC
Lisa Kuhner, NYSDOT
Conn MacAogain, NYCDOT
Larry Malsam, NYSDOT
James Manzolillo, LKB
Christopher McBride, AAA
Michael McCarthy, NYSDOT
Meg R. Midan
Maureen Morgan, Rail Project
Anne Morris, Baruch College
Jerry Mulligan, Westchester County Planning
Bob O'Brien, NYC Transit
James O'Shea, Real Estate Consultant
Sharon Persaud, MTA LI Bus

Robert Reardon, Village of Croton
Luis Reyes, Office of Council Member Gerson
Veronica Reed, Urban Engineers
Joseph E. Rich, FHWA
Sarah Rios, MTA
Marc Rivlin, Sen. Lachman's Office
Michael Rossmly, Bklyn. Boro Pres. Office
Erika Rush, Urban Engineers
Lawrence Salley, Westchester County DOT
Andrew Sandor, CTE Engineer
Harvey Sands, LIRO
Mark Seaman, NYU
Lou Sepersky, Metro East Inc.
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP
Jay Shuffield, PANYNJ
Alan Tabachnick, A.D. Marble & Co.
Frances Vella-Marrone, PANYNJ
Wayne Ugolik, NYSDOT
Charles Ukegbu, NYCDOT
Dee Vandenburg, VTV & SITA
Niwlette Wagner, Sam Schwartz
Willaim R. Wright, NJARD
Meseret Yilma, NYCDOT
Ken Vought, USDOT
Melanie Zeman, USEPA
John Zamurs, NYSDOT
Rae Zimmerman, NYU
Jeff Zupan, RPA

The March 15, 2004 meeting synopsis was accepted unanimously by the Council Members.

Respectfully Submitted,

Andrea Miles-Cole

**Synopsis of the June 17, 2004 Meeting of the
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) of the
New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC)**

A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS, CHAIRPERSON'S REMARKS

1. The meeting was called to order at 1:15 p.m. by Mr. Robert Dennison, Chairperson of the Program, Finance and Administration Committee and Regional Director of the New York State Department of Transportation, (NYSDOT) Region 8. All attendees introduced themselves.

Chairperson's Remarks – Mr. Robert Dennison said that the Executive Director vacancy was not filled and that the Department was waiting for approval from the Division of Budget to fill a permanent Director's position. He commended Alan Borenstein, Gerry Bogacz and Kuo-Ann Chiao for splitting the responsibilities three ways and thanked them for continuing to get the job done. Mr. Dennison said that NYMTC received the William H. Whyte Award for creativity in planning from the American Planning Association. It was awarded for the Route 303 Sustainable Development Study.

2. **Staff Report** – Mr. Alan Borenstein said that the move to 199 Water Street in lower Manhattan was progressing. He said that construction in the space had begun and the move in date for staff would be early October, 2004. Mr. Borenstein said that there were changes being made to the NYMTC website and that the new website would have GIS capability and would be available soon.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the staff had an unprecedented number of public workshops on various topics. He acknowledged and thanked the NYMTC staff that was instrumental on conducting the workshops and the PFAC members who supported them. He said that there were over 70 meetings conducted, which included the Regional Transportation Plan, the Long Island Waterborne Transportation Plan, the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) Grant Program, the Regional Freight Plan and the Transportation Improvement Plan (TIP). Mr. Bogacz said that evaluations of project proposals for the TIP update and a solicitation for the next round of JARC grants were being done.

Mr. Howard Mann gave a report for the Technical Group of NYMTC on behalf of Kuo-Ann Chiao, who was not in attendance. Mr. Mann reported that two new products were developed by the Group. He said that the NYMTC County Profiles for Richmond County and the NYMTC Truck Toll Volumes 2001-2002 pamphlets were both available at the sign-in table.

B. ACTION ITEMS

1. **Accept: February 19, 2004 Meeting Synopsis**

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to accept the February 19, 2004 Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Dr. James Yarmus representing Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and the synopsis was accepted.

Mr. Dennison explained that the adoption of the Regional Freight Plan was scheduled to be on the agenda, but action on the Freight Plan would be taken at a later date, and instead a presentation on the Regional Freight Plan would be given.

C. REGIONAL ISSUES

1. **Presentation of the Regional Freight Plan**

Mr. Howard Mann thanked the staff, the members and those who participated in the Regional Freight Plan Project. Mr. Mann said a lot of time, effort and money were spent evaluating and studying the movement of people for the Regional

Freight Plan. He explained how people make freight move and how freight supported one's lifestyle and that a good efficient freight transportation system that works for everyone was needed. He said the process, which was a complex and complicated situation that required a great deal of effort, was an ongoing process of identifying issues or trying to hold on to focus on what some of the specific improvements could be. He said that there were a number of people that were involved in the movement of freight who had a large stake of why the need to improve the freight transportation system. Mr. Mann said that in his presentation, it would explain what the issues were, the reasons for selection and where the process would end. See the attached presentation.

2. Successful Grants from the Job Access and reverse Commute Program:

a. Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Long Island Bus

Mr. Francis X. Ryan of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), Long Island Bus thanked NYMTC for the invitation to speak before the committee members and guest and then he introduced his co-workers, Millicent Herrera and Sharon Persaud. He said that NYMTC had been a vital partner in the effort to provide access to jobs and offer people the opportunity to public transportation. Mr. Ryan said that MTA, Long Island Bus, formerly called Metropolitan Suburban Bus Authority, was founded in 1973 and provides fixed route and paratransit services to Nassau, Queens and Suffolk Counties. He then spoke about the Job Access/Reverse Commute (JARC) Program. Mr. Ryan said that the NYMTC's regional JARC program was coordinated with local county agencies, such as the Nassau Department of Social Services, local employees and human services providers. Through the Area-Wide Transportation Plan, several transit services initiatives were identified. Mr. Ryan talked about the JARC collaboration effort and the grants obtained through partnerships with Nassau County Department of Social Services, New York State Department of Labor, and New York State Department of Transportation. He emphasized the importance of understanding where residents needed to go and how they would get there, as well as how Long Island Bus services were provided to allow these residents transit access to get to jobs. He said that meetings with local employers were held that resulted to adding transit services to accommodate their workers. He talked about the transit services that were provided because of the JARC grant program. Mr. Ryan said that new and enhanced services and new routes were developed for communities throughout Nassau County, and that community outreach assisted planners in developing new routes and expanded services in areas that were under served. Mr. Ryan thanked the Federal Transit Administration, the New York State Department of Transportation, the New York State Department of Labor and NYMTC, and said that without their support, these transit services would not have been done. Mr. Ryan ended and said, "Transit service and Long Island Bus are a good solutions, keep helping out". See the attached presentation.

b. Westchester County Department of Transportation

Ms. Patricia Chemka talked about the Westchester County's Job Access and Reverse Commute Initiatives. Ms. Chemka said that Westchester County received four Job Access and Reverse Commute grants from the Federal Transit Administration. She said the grants funded service expansions on existing routes and one grant funded an entirely new Bee-Line route. Ms. Chemka talked about the service hours that were extended to accommodate workers at the Yonkers, New Roc City and New Rochelle. She identified the routes that connected low-income communities with prime employment markets in southern and central Westchester. Ms. Chemka said that Westchester County has been an active participant in NYMTC's Job Access and Reverse Commute Working Group and commended the working relationship with the County's Department of Social Services and Department of Aging. For details of the program, see the attachment.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

There were no speakers.

E. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

1. Canal Area Transportation Study Track II

Mr. Aizaz Ahmed said that the Canal Area Transportation Study was a medium and long range transportation investment study. He said that recommendations would be developed for long range investment for the Canal Street corridor which would compliment ongoing short term efforts of the Canal Area Transportation Study Track I and would

be a multi model/agency analysis. Consultant selection had been completed and the project would begin in September, 2004.

2. NYMTC's Highways and Streets Planning Initiative

Mr. Aizaz Ahmed said that the Highways and Streets Planning Initiative was a research project that would identify pressing highway issues and needs in the NYMTC region and would recommend strategies to address them. As part of the research project, interviews were conducted with NYMTC member agencies and neighboring Metropolitan Planning Organizations in order to identify highway issues within the region. The project would develop strategies through literature review and exam the best practices worldwide in dealing with issues identified by the agencies. The project findings and recommendations would be considered for inclusion in the current update of the Regional Transportation Plan. At the end of this project, a full day conference would be held in November, 2004, to educate a broad audience including elected officials and agency heads about the needs to address the region's highway needs and to present the findings of the research project.

3. Transportation Demand Management Evaluation

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) services were expanded to apply for the various air conformity milestones. The Travel Demand Management project, funded through NYMTC's planning process, would undertake research to define modal shifts in the region's travel patterns that could be attributed to TDM programs. The project would measure effectiveness and help to determine the level of emissions reduction benefits which could be attributed to programs.

4. Clean Technologies Group

Ms. Karen Rosenberger said the Clean Technology Group's purpose was to further optimize the objectives of the Regional Clean Fuels Initiative Program by developing a clearinghouse for information, funding, and stakeholder coordination for regional clean vehicle technologies and promoting the use of clean fuels, emissions control strategies and alternate fuel vehicles. The major goal of the group would be to develop a forum for public and private fleet operators so that opportunities would be optimized for small fleet operators to compete economically for funding by leveraging the cooperative buying power of multiple fleet operators through funding banks so that smaller fleets would be able to commit to clean vehicles. Under the Green Fleets Program, methods would be reviewed and evaluated to provide funding banks. The Clean Technology Group program, which is funded through the Unified Planning Work Program, would include a branding element, a recognition program and an effective system to track emissions reduction. The kick off for the program is expected to begin in the Fall, 2004.

5. Henry Hudson Parkway Corridor Management Plan

Mr. Aizaz Ahmed said that NYMTC adopted the Unified Planning Work Program for 2004-2005 which included the Henry Hudson Parkway Corridor Management Plan as one of the new projects in the program. This project was initiated as a prelude to the possible designation of the Henry Hudson Parkway as a New York State Scenic Byway which would be the first scenic byway in New York City. The project limits would be 72nd Street extending north to the city line, extending 11 miles long. The New York State Scenic Byway program was created in 1992 by State Legislature. The program encouraged both economic development and resource conservation, recognizing that each of the aspects of a byway must be fostered to ensure the success of the others. The program, administered by the Landscape Architecture Bureau of the New York State Department of Transportation, is guided and implemented by the Scenic Byways Advisory Board that included a number of state agencies and members of the motoring public, tourism associations and organization interested in preserving scenic quality. For more information, see the website at www.dot.state.ny.us/scenic

6. Transportation Improvement Program

Mr. Stephen Hausch said that the NYMTC staff was in the process of developing a five-year, 2006-2010 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). The Transportation Coordinating Committee staffs were putting together TIP solicitations and were ranking and rating them and this process should conclude at the end of July, 2004. Beginning in

November 2004 the data activity on the air quality would be put into the new model and coded. The draft Transportation Improvement Program would be available by April, 2005.

F. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING

Mr. Dennison confirmed that the next PFAC meeting was scheduled for September 23, 2004 and would be held at the NYSDOT Offices located at 47-40 21st Street; Long Island City, Queens.

G. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned approximately at 3:00 p.m.

IN ATTENDANCE

Voting Member/Alternates

Lawrence Berger, Nassau County
Patricia Chemka, Westchester County
Robert A. Dennison III, NYS Department of Transportation
John Pilner, Putnam County
Sarah Rios, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Jack Schmidt, NYC Department of City Planning
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Charles Ukegbu, NYC Department of Transportation
Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County

Advisory (non-voting) Members

Denny Escarpeta, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Robert Griffith, Federal Highway Administration
Melanie Zeman, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

NYMTC Staff

Aizaz Ahmed	Stephen Hausch	Andrea Miles-Cole
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Jan Khan	Karen Rosenberger
Gerry Bogacz	Carl King	Viridiana Vivar
Alan Borenstein	David Kletsman	Kevin Wolford
Daniel Coots	Uchenna Madu	
Robert Donohue	Howard Mann	

OTHERS

Richard Backlund, FHWA
Ian Francis, NYSDOT
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
David Harris, NYCDOT
Millicent Herrera, MTA LI Bus
Peter King, NYSDOT
Hilary Kitasi, HHP Taskforce
Herbert Landon
Frank Lipinski, ACPA
William Mausling, NYSDOT
Sharon Persaud, MTA LI Bus
Michael Rossmly, Brooklyn Borough President Office
Francis Ryan, MTA LI Bus
Ted Shute, NYCRMB
Neil Trent, Rockland County

**Synopsis of the September 23, 2004 Meeting of the
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) of the
New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC)**

A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS, CHAIRPERSON'S REMARKS

1. The meeting was called to order at 1:20 p.m. by Mr. Robert Dennison, Chairperson of the Program, Finance and Administration Committee and Regional Director of the New York State Department of Transportation, (NYSDOT) Region 8. Mr. Dennison asked all attendees to introduce themselves.

Chairperson's Remarks – Mr. Robert Dennison announced that the NYMTC staff would be moving to downtown Manhattan and he thanked Alan Borenstein, Gerry Bogacz and Kuo-Ann Chiao for managing the NYMTC office as a trio since January 2004. Mr. Dennison talked about the New York University Wagner Rudin Center and NYMTC's collaboration Conference, "The Challenge of Congestion in the New York Region". He said the conference will be held in the Rudin Center's Kimmel Center Auditorium on November 16, 2004 and would focus on the issue of highway and street congestion in the New York metropolitan area and urged everyone to attend.

2. **Staff Report** – Mr. Alan Borenstein said that the NYMTC staff would be moving on September 28, 2004 to their new office located at 199 Water Street, 22nd floor, in lower Manhattan, and that the staff would be reporting to the office officially on September 29, 2004. Mr. Borenstein said that he was very excited about the move.

Mr. Kuo-Ann Chiao said that NYMTC's website, www.nymtc.org, was revised and was up and running. He encouraged everyone to visit the website and provide any comments, if applicable. Mr. Chiao said that the Traffic Monitoring Committee would be re-activated to become the consistent format, location, and shared information, clearing house. Mr. Chiao said that there were two data products available on the sign-in table—Hub Bound Report 2001 At a Glance and NYMTC's Truck Toll Volumes – 2001/2002.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that by April 1, 2005, under the Air Quality Conformity Waiver Legislature, NYMTC must release a draft Regional Transportation Plan, a draft Transportation Improvement Program, a draft Congestion Management Systems Program, and a draft Preliminary Performance Analysis, all of which the staff was working on. Mr. Bogacz said that under the Emissions Reduction Program, the Regional Commuter Choice Program was developed and the funding was tripled to 30 million dollars for three full years, which included a fully integrated program amongst all three sub-regions. He said that NYMTC was developing a Regional Branding Program for the Regional Commuter Choice Program. He said that the Regional Clean Fuels Program extended the Clean Cities Program, which exists on Long Island and New York City to the Hudson Valley and money was set aside for the Clean Technical Group which functioned as a clearing house for fleet owners, managers and agencies to share information. Mr. Bogacz said that signal timing was done throughout the region to improve congestion and traffic flow.

B. ACTION ITEMS

1. **Accept: June 17, 2004 Meeting Synopsis**

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to accept the June 17, 2004 Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Dr. James Yarmus representing Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and the synopsis was accepted.

2. **Adopt: Resolution #189 – Incorporation of the Regional Freight Plan into the Draft Regional Transportation Plan**

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that a detailed presentation was given at the July 17, 2004 PFAC Meeting and noted that a copy of the presentation and the report was available at the sign-in table. He then introduced the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #189 – Incorporation of the Regional Freight Plan into the Draft Regional Transportation Plan. A motion was made by Dr. James Yarmus, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

3. Adopt: Resolution #190 – Incorporation of the 2030 County-Level Socio-Economic Forecasts into the Draft Regional Transportation Plan

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #190 – Incorporation of the 2030 County-Level Socio-Economic Forecasts into the Draft Regional Transportation Plan. A motion was made by Ms. Patricia Chemka, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

4. Adopt: Resolution #191 – Self Certification of NYMTC

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that it was mandated by the federal government that all Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPO) must be certified every three years. In the interim years, the MPO's are required to self certify that they were following the regulations and performing the functions as MPO's. Mr. Bogacz said that NYMTC's Self Certification report was prepared and was available at the sign-in table. The report addresses areas the federal governments have indicated areas of most concern and said that NYMTC's Self Certification report was submitted on behalf of the member agencies and showed that NYMTC were within the guidelines.

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #191 – Self Certification of NYMTC. A motion was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Lawrence Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

C. REGIONAL ISSUES

Hunts Point Waterborne Freight Assessment, Alan Meyers, Cambridge Systematics

Mr. David Kletsman said that the Hunts Point Waterborne Freight Project was not a stand alone project, but was a supplement to the existing Long Island Sound Waterborne Transportation Study. Mr. Kletsman said that NYMTC was approached by the Bronx Borough Presidents Office and the Point Community Development Corporation to do an assessment study to address the traffic flow and congestion as well as accessibility and business operation of Hunts Point because of the relocation of the Fulton Street Fish Market in Manhattan to the Bronx Hunts Point. Mr. Kletsman acknowledged Paula Kaplan, who represented Bronx Borough President's Office, of her active role on the advisory committee and on the project.

Ms. Paula Kaplan said that she and on behalf of the Bronx Borough President appreciated that the study was done and added that there was also an interest in adding the Hunts Point to the New Jersey Bridge Port Study and the ferry from New Jersey to Hunts Point. Ms. Kaplan said that anything that would remove trucks from the Cross Bronx Expressway was a positive move.

Mr. Alan Meyers of Cambridge Systematics, with the help of slides, provided a detailed presentation of the Assessment Study. See the presentation attached.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mr. Michael Replogle representing Environmental Defense submitted prepared remarks regarding the Preliminary Regional Emissions Analysis Report, issued by NYMTC on September 1, 2004. See the prepared remarks attached.

Mr. Cliff Hymolid said it was very rewarding working with Gerry Bogacz and the NYMTC staff on the Job Access and Reverse Commute Program. Mr. Hymolid requested the status of an Accessibility Study that was formed almost three years ago.

Mr. David Kletsman, who was the Project Manager of the Accessibility Study, said that because of staff reduction, the study was stopped. Mr. Kletsman said that the Scope of Work and the budget for the study were accepted and an Advisory Committee will be formed at a later date.

John Hummer, representing the New Jersey Transportation Planning Authority congratulated Gerry Bogacz, Alan Borenstein, Kuo-Ann Chiao and particularly Howard Mann for the incredibly good, hard steadfast work done on the NYMTC Regional Freight Plan. Mr. Hummer said that the New Jersey Transportation Planning Authority was completing their own Regional Freight Plan, which would also be incorporated into their Regional Transportation Plan and said that the encouragement and guidance received from the NYMTC staff were much appreciated.

E. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

1. Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Gerry Boagacz said that the Unified Program Work Program kick-off for the next program year, 2005/2006 had begun. All suggestions received from members and the public would be considered.

2. Transportation Improvement Program Update

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP), a three to five years program, identified all the proposed federally funded transportation projects in the NYMTC region. The existing federal fiscal year 2004-2006 NYMTC TIP identified over \$18.6 billion in transportation improvements. Mr. Bogacz said that the TIP was updated every two years and the federal fiscal year 2006-2010 TIP update was underway. He said that the NYMTC members were updating their projects for the full TIP update and the selected proposals would be programmed on the draft TIP. The 2006-2010 TIP was scheduled to take effect on October 1, 2005 and the current TIP document was available on NYMTC's website at www.nymtc.org.

3. Preliminary Regional Emissions Analysis

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the Preliminary Regional Emissions Analysis has been completed as per the requirements of the conformity waiver legislature. The report is available on NYMTC's website at www.nymtc.org.

4. Canal Area Transportation Study Track II

Mr. Aizaz Ahmed that a contract for the Canal Area Transportation Study Track II had not been executed as of yet, but he anticipated one to be implemented soon. Mr. Ahmed said that the consultant requested to begin work and that request was granted. The consultant would begin effective October 1, 2004.

5. Job Access and Reverse Commute Grant Program

Mr. David Kletsman said that Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) Grant Program was a federal funded program designed to help welfare recipients and low income individuals to travel to job opportunities, job training and other employment-related services, as well as provide funding to information services related to transportation. Mr. Kletsman said that although federal funds for JARC continuous and new projects were not available now because of the TEA-21 Reauthorization, NYSDOT had conducted a Grant round using \$1M in earmarked to the state federal funds statewide and the funds would be available October 2004 until October 2005. Mr. Kletsman said that NYMTC sent out solicitation letter to interested parties in March 2004. Ten workshops, consisting of two sessions each day were held throughout the region in April & May, 2004. He said the intent of the workshops was to educate prospective applicants interested in applying for the federal grants for JARC. Representatives from over 75 communities, non-profits organizations, local municipalities, and government agencies participated in the workshops and learned about federal requirements and regulations, project eligibility, financing and planning procedures. Mr. Kletsman said that nine letters of intent were received and reviewed by NYMTC members for eligibility. The eligible applicants were notified and were requested to submit project proposals applications. Four new and five continuous project proposals were submitted with the requested amount of \$2.3 million in federal funds, in which fifty percent match was required of the applicant. He said that an evaluation committee was formed, that evaluated and scored the project proposals and the

applications and the priority list would be submitted to Albany by October 8, 2004. The winners would be announced November 2, 2004. Mr. Kletsman said that projects proposals and the JARC Round information would be available on NYMTC's website at www.nymtc.org.

F. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING

Mr. Dennison confirmed that the next PFAC meeting was scheduled for November 18, 2004 and would be held at the new NYMTC Office located at 199 Water Street, 22nd floor, New York City.

G. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned approximately at 3:00 p.m.

IN ATTENDANCE

Voting Member/Alternates

Lawrence Berger, Nassau County
Patricia Chemka, Westchester County
Robert A. Dennison III, NYS Department of Transportation
John Pilner, Putnam County
Sarah Rios, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Jack Schmidt, NYC Department of City Planning
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Charles Ukegbu, NYC Department of Transportation
Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County

Advisory (non-voting) Members

Elizabeth Bartlett, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Tom Kearney, Federal Highway Administration
John Hummer, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority, Inc.
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Melanie Zeman, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

NYMTC Staff

Aizaz Ahmed	Stephen Hausch	Larry McAuliffe
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Jan Khan	Andrea Miles-Cole
Gerry Bogacz	Carl King	Karen Rosenberger
Alan Borenstein	David Kletsman	Abdus Salam
Colleen Brathwaite	Mikhail Kotikovskiy	William Thornwell
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Uchenna Madu	Kevin Wolford
Daniel Coots	Larry Malsam	

OTHERS

Mark Albrecht, MTA	Alan Meyers, Cambridge Sysematics
Regina Armstrong, Urbanomics	Christopher McBride, AAA
Richard Backlund, FHWA	Henry Rainone, Inspector Inc.
Steve Brown, PANYNJ	Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Pam Burford, LIRR	Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Paula Caplan, Brooklyn Borough President Office	Michael Replogle, Environmental Defense
Tony Caserta, Imspecto Inc.	David Risley, USEPA
Lisa Felcocchio, Urbitran	Adam Rosenbloom, Urbitran Associates
David Harris, NYCDOT	Richard Rowan, PANYNJ
Jennifer Hoppa, NYC Parks & Recreation	C. Michael Sibia
Cliff Hymowitz, CCPTSC	S. Tatham, Environmental Defense
David Kantor, Parsons Brinkerhoff	Richard Wilson, Hatch Mott MacDonald
Peter King, NYSDOT	John Zamurs, NYSDOT
Randall Mardis, Zetlin Strategic Communications	

Synopsis motioned by Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee
Seconded by Lawrence Salley, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee

Respectfully submitted,

Andrea Miles-Cole

**Synopsis of the November 18, 2004 Meeting of the
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) of the
New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC)**

A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS AND REMARKS

1. The meeting was called to order at 1:20 p.m. by Mr. Robert Dennison, Chairperson of the Program, Finance and Administration Committee and Regional Director of the New York State Department of Transportation, (NYSDOT) Region 8. All attendees introduced themselves.

2. Chairperson's Remarks

Mr. Robert Dennison welcomed everyone to NYMTC's new office space and said that he would no longer be the Chairperson for the PFAC and Secretary of the Council. He said that the role had been assigned to Mr. Timothy Gilchrist, whom is also taking on Downstate Integration for the New York State Department of Transportation. Mr. Dennison said that announcements for hiring a new NYMTC Executive Director would be published soon.

3. NYMTC Directors' Report

Mr. Alan Borenstein reported on the NYMTC Open House and new office space. He thanked staff for their help with the event.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz reported on the status activities leading up to the April 1, 2005 milestone under the waiver of Air Quality Conformity requirements. Mr. Bogacz said that staff was focused on preparing the draft products required to be released by April 1, 2005.

Mr. Kuo-Ann Chiao said that the GIS Transportation Improvement Program was available on NYMTC's website at www.nymtc.org and he discussed the status of the enhancement of the transit component of the Best Practices Model.

B. ACTION ITEMS

1. Accept: September 23, 2004 Meeting Synopsis

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to accept the September 23, 2004 Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Lawrence Salley, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and the synopsis was accepted.

2. Adopt: Resolution #193 – Approval of the Revised Major Metropolitan Transportation Investments/Major Investment Study List

Mr. Aizaz Ahmed explained that the resolution was to revise the Major Metropolitan Transportation Investments (MMTI)/Major Investment Study (MIS) list by deleting the FDR & Harlem River Drive, (Battery Tunnel-George Washington Bridge MIS). Mr. Ahmed said that the MIS was recommended for deletion from the list because the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), the sponsor of the MIS, had done considerable amount of work to meet the critical infrastructure needs of these highways. He said that the NYSDOT also improved geometrics and operations where feasible through their ongoing project and the constrained nature of the corridors coupled with the amount of work done to meet critical infrastructure needs precluded the kinds of

opportunities that an MIS would normally entail. He then requested PFAC to approve the resolution.

Mr. Dennison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #193 – Approval of the Revised Major Metropolitan Transportation Investments/Major Investment Study List. A motion was made by Mr. Lawrence Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

C. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mr. George Haikalis, President of the Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc., congratulated NYMTC on its new space and said he was pleased that there was a library and data resource center included. He said he had large number of books and reports that he would like to make available to NYMTC and was looking forward to working with Robert Angel, NYMTC's Data Repository Manager. Mr. Haikalis said that NYMTC should reexamine its capital program to see how to achieve its goals by using less costly ways to build projects. He cited the example of "streamlining" the Long Island Railroad access to Grand Central by using existing tracks rather than building a very costly deep cavern under the terminal. He also urged NYMTC to use its planning tools like its Best Practices Model to study alternative pricing strategies for transportation.

Mr. Alexander Saunders spoke about the considerable research he had done on European tunnel construction. Mr. Saunders said that the best solution with the I-287 was the northern access to Long Island.

D. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

1. Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Stephen Hausch gave a brief presentation on the status of the development of the 2005-2006 Unified Planning Work Program. Mr. Hausch said the document would be available on NYMTC website at www.nymtc.org.

2. Transportation Improvement Program Update

Mr. Stephen Hausch gave a brief presentation on the status of the development of the 2006-2010 Transportation Improvement Program. Mr. Hausch said that the TIP was one of the major products developed by NYMTC and is a three to five year program that identified all the proposed federally funded transportation projects in the NYMTC region. He said that the NYMTC member's were updating their projects for the full TIP update and the selected proposals were programmed on the draft TIP. He said the 2006-2010 TIP was scheduled to take effect on October 1, 2005 and the current TIP document can be viewed at www.nymtc.org

3. September 11th Memorial for Regional Transportation Planning

Mr. Gerry Bogacz reported on the September 11th Memorial program for Regional Transportation Planning, which was publicly announced at the NYMTC Grand Opening Ceremony. Mr. Bogacz said that \$1 million had been set aside for the program and that a public solicitation for proposals was expected by February, 2005.

E. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING

Mr. Dennison confirmed that the next PFAC meeting was scheduled for January 20, 2005, and would be held at NYMTC, 199 Water Street, 22nd floor, New York City.

F. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned approximately at 2:30 p.m.

IN ATTENDANCE

Voting Member/Alternates

Lawrence Berger, Nassau County
Robert Dennison III, NYS Department of Transportation
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
John Pilner, Putnam County
Sarah Rios, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Lawrence C. Salley, Westchester County
Jack Schmidt, NYC Department of City Planning
Charles Ukegbu, NYC Department of Transportation

Advisory (non-voting) Members

Robert Griffith, Federal Highway Administration
Irwin Kessman, Federal Transit Administration
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Melanie Zeman, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

NYMTC Council Staff

Aizaz Ahmed	Carlos Delpozo	Howard Mann
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Emma Gaitan	Larry McAuliffe
Colleen Braithwaite	Stephen Hausch	Karen Rosenberger
Gerry Bogacz	Jan Khan	Jean Shanahan
Alan Borenstein	Carl King	William Thornewell
Kuo-Ann Chia	Deinbo MacHarry	Kevin Wolford
Daniel Coots	Uchenna Madu	

OTHERS

Edwin Alicea, TEC/Brooklyn	George Haikalis, IRUM
Robert Arnold FHWA	Dave Harris, NYCDOT
Richard Backlund, FHWA	Roger Herz, TIME to Improve
Michele Bager, NYSDOT	Martin Hofler, NJ TPA
Seth Berman, NYCDOT	Randolph Hunt, NYSDOT
Judy Bliss, NYCDOT	Cynthia Hunter
Patricia Bourne, Nassau County Planning	Alex Jordan, NY Port
Carter Brown, URS Corp	Peter King, NYSDOT
Robert Cassera, Gowanus Stakeholder Group	Anthony Lee, Louis Berger
Steven Brown, PANYNJ	Lawrence Lennon, Parsons Brinkerhoff
Patricia Chemka, Westchester County	Jim Manzollilo, Lockwood Kessler & Bartlett
Neil Cohen, Gowanus Stakeholders Group	Wanda Matos, NYCDOT
John Culpepper, LWHNA	Christopher McBride, AAA
Nancy Danzig, FTA	Maura McCarty, NYCDOT
Denny Escarpeto, NYSDEC	Joan McDonell, NUCEDC
William Fahey, Liberty Lines	Kevin Olinger, NYCDOP
Brian Fineman, NJTPA	Olga Olovyannikov, NYCDOP
Robert Francis	Maribeth Osorio, TE/Brooklyn
Edgar Freud, Lower Washington Heights Neighborhood Assoc	Gwen Perlman, NYCDOT
Roy Grey-Stewart, MTA LIB	Irv Perlman, Parsons Brinkerhoff
Leon Goodman, Arson Transportation Group	Naim Rasheed, NYCDOT
Peter Goslett, NYCDOT	Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Richard Gualtieri, NYSDOT	George Ripp, Louis Berger
Dalilah Hall, NYCDOT	Richard Roberts, NJ Transit

Michael Rossmly, Brooklyn, Borough President Office
Alexander Saunders
Joseph S. Parsons Brinckerhoff
Ellyn Shannon, PCAC
Rhonda Smith, NYCDOT
Ed Sullivan, URS
Dorothy Szorc, NYCDOT
Letitia Thompson, FTA
Neil Trenk, Rockland County
Randy Wade, NYCDOT
Roberta Weisbrod, Partnership for Sustainable
Raymond Werner, USEPA
Matthew Winchell, NYCDOT
John Zamurs, NYSDOT

The synopsis was accepted unanimously by all PFAC members.

Respectfully Submitted,

Andrea Miles-Cole, NYMTC