

**Synopsis of the March 4, 1999 Meeting of the
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC)**

A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS, CHAIRPERSON'S REMARKS

1. The meeting was called to order at approximately 1:25 p.m. by *Mr. Richard A. Maitino*, Chairperson of the Program, Finance and Administration Committee. Attendees introduced themselves.
2. **Chairperson's Remarks** - *Mr. Maitino* announced that the annual Council meeting would be held on March 18, 1999 in the Oval Room, 43rd Floor of One World Trade Center, NYC. He also announced *Mr. Robert Dennison* as the new Director of NYS Department of Transportation, Region 8.
3. **Staff Executive Director's Report** - *Mr. Harris* said that four public workshops were held on the STP Enhancement Program. He also said that a series of public meetings would be held on the Port Studies in the region. The first would be held in March at the offices of the North Jersey Regional Planning Authority. Other meetings were being scheduled. *Mr. Harris* said that on March 19 a Ferry Forum would be held in Suffolk County. He also mentioned the Annual Council meeting.

Transportation Coordinating Committee (TCC) Staff Directors' Report

- a. **Mid-Hudson South** - *Ms. Shanahan* reported that the Mid-Hudson TCC staff had continued to work on the FFY 2000-2004 Transportation Improvement Program update which was their primary focus. Data was collected, and was provided to the Central Staff for the air quality analysis. The CMAQ operational committee met to determine how to utilize the funding that was set aside for operational projects. Staff continue to be involved with the Enhancement Program. Meetings were held and progress made on the Sustainable Development Studies. TIP amendments and project selections were processed as necessary.
- b. **Nassau-Suffolk** - *Mr. Chamberlain* said the staff continued to focus on the development of the FFY 2000-2004 Transportation Improvement Program. A Transportation Enhancement Program workshop was hosted by the Nassau/Suffolk TCC on February 10. The Corridor Profiles were updated and would be included in Chapter 4 of the Plan.
- c. **New York City** - *Mr. Malsam* said that like the other two TCCs, staff was focused on working on developing the City portion of the 2000-2004 Transportation Improvement Program. He also said that delays were experienced in the CMAQ program. If remaining issues were resolved, NYCTCC expected to have the first public review meeting in less than one month.

Mr. Harris said that the existing TIP was amended, and as a result the conformity analysis was updated. The amended TIP and the conformity analysis were released to the public for a 30-day review and comment period. A public meeting was planned in the NYMTC conference room for March 12. Copies of the documents were available.

Mr. Harris said that the Financial Report showed that NYMTC continued to under run its budget primarily because of staff vacancies. He asked that those interested in employment with the Council should contact the Central Staff for an application.

B. ACTION ITEMS

1. Accept: January 21, 1999 Meeting Synopsis

Mr. Maitino asked for a motion to accept the January 21, 1999, meeting synopsis. *Mr. Maitino* noted that there were two minor changes. A motion was made by *Dr. Lapp* of the Department of City Planning, and seconded by *Mr. Kessman* of Nassau County, and passed, approving the January 21, 1999, meeting synopsis with the minor changes that were indicated.

Note: The Regional Issue Presentation was held after B.1.

C. REGIONAL ISSUE

1. Overview of the 1999/2000 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP)

Mr. Harris said he would be talking about *Pathways to Possibilities 2000*, the new UPWP proposal for the 1999/2000. He thanked PFAC members and their respective staffs for all the work that was contributed to the UPWP—it was a cooperative effort which reflected the coordination and cooperation of all the parties involved.

Mr. Harris said that it was the second year of the new approach to the development of the UPWP, which was more cooperative and comprehensive. The target was to have a strategic and integrated program, which started with the Council's mission. *Mr. Harris* read the Council's mission. With the help of slides *Mr. Harris* presented *Pathways to Possibilities 2000*, the 1999-2000 Unified Planning Work Program (attached).

B. ACTION ITEMS (continued)

2. Endorse: Resolution #111 - 1999-2000 Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Maitino said that the UPWP was a very large program. He asked for a motion to endorse Resolution #111 - the 1999-2000 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by *Mr. Kessman* of Nassau County, seconded by *Dr. Yarmus* of Rockland County, and Resolution #111 was endorsed.

3. Adopt: Resolution #112 - the Recommendation of the Freight Transportation Working Group (FTWG)

Mr. Mann said that Resolution #112 called on PFAC to adopt the recommendation of the Freight Transportation Working Group (FTWG) to begin developing a Scope of Work. The effort would be conducted in a coordinated manner appropriate with other ongoing planning efforts in the region. The item was included in the 1999-2000 UPWP which was endorsed. The FTWG had been meeting to develop a *Year 1 Plan of Action*, which was a document that included short term activities that the Group had outlined for itself for the upcoming year. Mr. Mann continued and said that one of the activities identified in the plan, was the development of a regional freight plan. He mentioned that the Regional Transportation Plan had outlined a number of freight issues, and identified several recommendations. Mr. Mann described what would be included in the Scope of Services.

Mr. Maitino asked for a motion to endorse Resolution #112. A motion was made by Dr. Lapp, seconded, by Mr. Cronin, and Resolution #112 - The Recommendation of the Freight Transportation Working Group was endorsed.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mr. George Haikalis, President of Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc. said that his organization was concerned with current irrational policies of public agencies that lead to uncompensated public health costs, thousands of persons injured or killed by motor vehicles and time wasted by cars and trucks stuck in traffic. He said that NYMTC must improve its citizen involvement to produce better regional transportation plans. Some positive steps have been taken, for example, the NYMTC Executive Director attended a Bronx Forum; and a hearing on Airport Rail Plan. Mr. Haikalis said that more steps were needed, for example, the need for citizens to want to attend and speak at PFAC meetings; the formation of a citizens advisory panel; and encouraging citizen and community planning elements in the UPWP. He also said that NYMTC needed to do a better job planning the airport/surface transportation interface. NYMTC also needed to improve its staff expertise in rail transit and rail freight planning. In closing Mr. Haikalis said that informed decision making would produce more cost effective and productive plans for the region.

Mr. Maurice Paprin of BLCC, asked if NYMTC could explore the possibility of holding interactive cable hearings or discussions to get the public involved without them having to go to the World Trade Center.

Mr. Maitino said that Mr. Paprin raised a good point, however, he did not think that the time allotted at PFAC was the heart of public participation for NYMTC. Outreach was done at the TCC level, the Central Staff level through the Regional Transportation Planning process, and through member agencies. Mr. Maitino said the idea could be investigated.

E. NEW BUSINESS

1. **Status Report: East End Ferry Forum** - *Mr. Tobin* said that the East End Ferry Forum was being held on March 19, 1999, at The Vineyard, in Aquebogue, Long Island. The forum would build upon some of the issues that were discussed at the Metropolitan Planning Forum held in Bridgeport, Connecticut. He said that the forum was being sponsored by the Town of Southold in cooperation with NYMTC, NYS Department Of Transportation, NYS Department Of State, American Planning Association, Greater Bridgeport Regional Planning Agency, and East End Supervisors and Mayors Association. Flyers announcing the forum were available.
2. **Status Report: Draft Conformity Determination for the Administrative Update to the Transportation Program** - *Ms. Bager* said that as already mentioned earlier in the meeting, certain amendments to the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) as part of the Administrative Update necessitated a re-analysis of the conformity of the TIP to the SIP. The analysis had been completed and released for public review which started March 3 and would continued until COB April 2, 1999. The Council would host a public meeting on the Conformity Determination necessitated by these amendments on March 12 at 2 p.m. in the NYMTC conference room.

Dr. Yarmus, in following up on Mr. Paprin's comments, suggested that Central Staff could have an e-mail distribution so that small or large lobbying groups could send their publications to NYMTC for distribution as appropriate. Mr. Maitino said it was a good idea. Mr. Harris said that NYMTC had a click on feature to the website that allowed organizations to obtain information.

Dr. Lapp added that he had been a long time advocate of using cable to reach thousands rather than hundreds of people. He said that with the Council meeting approaching in two weeks maybe, if it was not too late, NYMTC could contact Crosswalk Cable TV. They could also be contacted later for the Transportation Improvement Program's adoption. Dr. Lapp warned that there was a downside to using cable, which was the program may be aired at an hour when most people were sleeping. However, if there was some way for major events to be aired at reasonable times, it might add to the outreach effort.

F. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT MEETING

The next **PFAC meeting** is tentatively scheduled for **Thursday, April 22, 1999 at 1:15 p.m. One World Trade Center, New York City.**

G. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:10 p.m.

Voting Members/Alternates

Gerald Cronin, Nassau/Suffolk TCC
Marvin Church, Westchester County DOT
Irwin Kessman, Nassau/Suffolk TCC
Floyd Lapp, New York City TCC
Richard A. Maitino, Chairperson, NYSDOT-Region 11
John Pilner, Mid-Hudson South TCC
Sarah Rios, MTA
Charles Ukegbu, NYCDOT
James Yarmus, Rockland County

Advisory (non-voting) Members

Elizabeth Bartlett, NYSDEC
Nancy Danzig, FTA
Rudolph Kapichak, USEPA
Jonathan McDade, FHWA
Lou Venech, PANY&NJ

NYMTC Council Staff

Michele Bager
Gerry Bogacz
Alan Borenstein
Everett Chamberlain, Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee
Valli Gadsden-Smith
Anthony Gawrych
Alan Gershowitz, NYC Transportation Coordinating Committee
Stephen Hausch
Micheal Harmel
James W. Harris, Secretary
Charles Henry
Norma P. Hessic
Larry Malsam, New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee
Howard J. Mann
Tom Schulze
Mark Tobin
Jean Shanahan, Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee

Others

M. Albrecht, MTA
George Armeit, Empire State Passenger Association
Seth Berman, NYCDOT

Michael Doyle, MTA, PCAC
William Fahey, Liberty Lines
David Gamache, NYS Bridge Authority
Art Goldberg, T.W.U.
George Haikalis, Institute for rational Urban Mobility, Inc.
Shirley Jelks, NYC Transit
Stephen Kingsberry, NJPA
Naomi Klein, Westchester DOT
Hugh Louch, Citizens Housing
Joanna Oliver, Louis Berger Associates
Bob Olmsted
Maurice Paprin, BLCC
Sharon Persaud, MTA, LI Bus
George Sarmiento, Rockland County
Roberta Scott-Boatte, S.I. Chamber
Lou Separesky, Metro-East
John Walsh, USEPA
William Wheeler, MTA
John Zamurs, NYSDOT

**SYNOPSIS OF THE COUNCIL MEETING
MARCH 18, 1999**

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Welcome

The meeting was called to order at 1:20 p.m. by the permanent Co-chairperson *Joseph Boardman*, Commissioner, NYS Department of Transportation. Mr. Boardman asked attendees to join him in a moment of silence for John Walsh who passed away recently. Mr. Walsh was employed by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, and was a liaison to NYMTC. Mr. Boardman suggested that himself and Mr. Vanderhoef reach out to Mr. Walsh's family and offer condolences on behalf of the Council. After the moment of silence, Mr. Boardman thanked attendees for their courtesy.

Mr. Boardman welcomed all Council members or their representatives to the annual meeting. He also welcomed the rest of attendees. Members introduced themselves, and it was ascertained that there was a quorum.

Mr. Boardman announced that the next item would be the last official act for the Council's rotating Co-Chair the Hon. C. Scott Vanderhoef. He said that it was a pleasure to have worked with Mr. Vanderhoef because of his outstanding understanding of the NYMTC issues. He added that he knew that Mr. Vanderhoef would continue to be an active member. Mr. Boardman said that he appreciated all the work that Mr. Vanderhoef had done. He asked attendees to join him in recognizing Mr. Vanderhoef's contributions.

B. ISSUES FACING THE COUNCIL

1. Status of the Transportation System - Council Co-Chairperson C. Scott Vanderhoef

Hon. Vanderhoef, Co-chairperson of the Council, and Rockland County Executive said that the Council was at a very important moment as the 21st Century approached with respect to transportation, the economic viability and the sense of how the Council as a region move forward with the quality of life issues. Many issues were dealt with by the individual member agencies, but it was for the Council to decide how to connect the region. He mentioned portions of Rockland County State of the County address, and said that the protection and use of land around transportation corridors and rivers were very critical ingredients to the future of Rockland County as well as the region. He said that as one moved into the 21st Century, one must determine how goods and people were moved into and out of the metropolitan region, how land use would be

determined with respect to transportation initiatives, and how the future of the citizens would be determined, were all critical issues facing the Council.

Mr. Vanderhoef said that the good news was that there was a group like the NYMTC that was committed to talking about the issues in a global way. The Council was about to issue “Mobility for the Millennium”, the first transportation regional plan since 1994. He urged everyone to get involved. He added that although Rockland County was small, it had always tried to be a leader in the discussion as to what was important in the long term with respect to regional considerations. He said that the region was one of the greatest regions in the U.S. - with some of the greatest transportation challenges in the U.S. and some of the greatest infrastructure in the U.S. Between the challenges and the assets, the Council would enter the new millennium with a great opportunity to assure that Council members think ahead and make the region successful in the long term.

Mr. Vanderhoef said he had enjoyed being the co-chair, and felt that each member agency was committed not only to their respective locality, but to the discussion of the future of the region as a whole. He thanked Commissioner Boardman for the opportunity to serve, and wished NYMTC well in the future.

Mr. Boardman introduced Mr. Fredrick Hiffa, Assistant Commissioner for Regional Affairs at NYS Department of Transportation, and said that he was asking Mr. Hiffa to take a stronger role in the Council. Mr. Boardman said that over the past year, he had come to realize that Mr. Hiffa was someone who understood both financial issues and complex government issues, having 14 years of experience in State Legislature at the highest levels of the Assembly. Mr. Hiffa stood and was recognized.

2. Federal Overview

Ms. Jeanne Fox, Regional Administrator for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) said that the EPA was very concerned with the air quality in the metropolitan New York region, as she had discussed at the last annual meeting. She said that EPA’s higher officials had proposed and adopted new regulations to improve air quality around the country for particulate matter and ozone standards. That would mean substantial benefits to residents of the New York metropolitan region. She added that transportation was very important as an integral part for obtaining clean air. Ms. Fox said that the TEA-21 money which was forthcoming to the region had a lot of flexibility, and could move money from highways to mass transit, and the congestion mitigation type of items. She acknowledged that the New York metropolitan area had historically been in favor of more mass transit.

Ms. Fox said that she was looking forward to working on those very important health and air quality issues with all Council members. She said that there had been many discussions held on public participation, and that NYMTC had over the past year increased the quality of public participation. She asked that the public continue their input, and give suggestions on better ways to improve the quality of how inputs were received and dealt with. She added that it was very

important that the communities in the region understand the importance of transportation, and how it related directly to their and their families health. She thanked Mr. Vanderhoef for his time, and asked him to continue to be involved in the Council's business.

Ms. Letitia Thompson, Regional Administrator for Federal Transit Administration, said that she wanted to alert attendees to the following: As a result of TEA-21, A White Paper, (a joint effort between Federal Transit Administration (FTA), and Federal Highway Administration, (FHWA)) was produced, as the planning, and environmental regulations were being developed. She added that there was a tremendous response from the entire country to the Job Access & Reverse Commute program. The proposals were being evaluated and decisions would be made shortly. She announced that FTA had recently moved its offices to One Bowling Green.

Mr. Harold Brown, Division Administrator for Federal Highway Administration said that FHWA had a metro office which was located at One Bowling Green. He said that 50% of the federal money that was spent in the State was spend in this region, and 90% of that money was transit money. He added that this area of the State was very important to the overall well being of the State. He said that the Council was charged with planning so that all transportation modes were blended to better the citizens quality of life. Mr. Brown said that environmental consequences must be considered in all aspects of transportation planning. He encouraged attendees to stay interested in the Council's program. He reiterated Mr. Vanderhoef's statement that people should be involved with the Plan. He mentioned that the FHWA recently went through a reorganization, and eliminated nine regional offices. He added that FHWA wanted to become more customer friendly, and he encouraged attendees to utilize the services of FHWA whenever there was a need.

Mr. Boardman said that before Mr. Harris gave his report he would like to say that he asked Mr. Harris to join the NYMTC staff approximately two years ago to try to get NYMTC's program recertified, and also to look at what was being done, so that the metropolitan area could begin to plan a transportation program that would work in the future. He added that the second part of his statement was an ongoing effort because there would always be a give and take necessary. However, he said that he was pleased at the wonderful job that Jim Harris had done. Mr. Boardman added that he told Mr. Harris when he started at NYMTC that he wanted him to work at NYMTC for 2 to 3 years, and it was presently over two years. He said he had another assignment in mind for Mr. Harris, and that there would be changes in the future. Mr. Boardman said that his statement was not an announcement, but a warning.

C. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Harris thanked Mr. Boardman and the rest of the Council members for their support over the past year. He reiterated Mr. Boardman's comments about the late Mr. John Walsh. Mr. Harris mentioned that because of the tremendous outcry from potential applicants, the deadline for submitting applications under the Transportation Enhancement Program was extended from April 1 to July 1, 1999.

Mr. Harris then read his prepared remarks. A copy is attached for your information.

D. ACTION ITEMS

1. Acceptance of March 19, 1998 Meeting Synopsis

Mr. Vanderhoef asked if there were any comments or changes to the March 19, 1998, meeting synopsis. There were none. A motion was made by Mr. Howard Blankman, representing Nassau County, and seconded by Mr. Robert Gaffney of Suffolk County, and the March 19, 1998 meeting synopsis was approved.

Before Action Item D.2 A Presentation on Pathways to Possibilities 2000 the 1999/2000 Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Harris said that the presentation dealt with two things, the business plan which was developed as a result of the ongoing activities at NYMTC, and included in the business plan's first year which was the Unified Planning Work Program. With the help of slides, Mr. Harris spoke about the approach; building the program; the strategic needs assessment; how the multi-year business plan was developed; what was heard; the mission objective; work program highlights; and the funding for the UPWP program. A copy of the presentation is attached.

D. ACTION ITEMS (continued)

2. Adopt: Resolution #99-1 - "Pathways to Possibilities 2000" - the Unified Planning Work Program

Mr. Vanderhoef asked if there were any questions or comments about Mr. Harris' presentation on the Unified Planning Work Program. There were none. A motion was made by Howard Blankman, representing Nassau County, and seconded by Floyd Lapp representing NYC Planning Commission, and Resolution #99-1 - *Pathways to Possibilities 2000* - the Unified Planning Work Program was unanimously adopted. (Resolution #99-1 is attached).

3. Confirm: New Rotating Co-Chairperson

Mr. Boardman said that the Council's Memorandum of Understanding provided for an annual rotation of one of the Council chairs among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees, Mid-Hudson South, Nassau-Suffolk, and New York City. The co-chairpersonship would be transferred from Mid-Hudson South TCC to Nassau-Suffolk TCC. Mr. Gulotta, the Nassau County Executive was nominated, and accepted the position of the New Council Co-Chair. Mr. Boardman said that Mr. Howard Blankman would accept the nomination and represent Mr. Gulotta.

Mr. Blankman said that Mr. Gulotta's absence should not be misinterpreted as a lack of interest. He said that, as Chairman of the Nassau County Planning Commission his office handled the responsibility for transportation in the County, and therefore to represent Mr. Gulotta at the Council meeting was appropriate. On behalf of Mr. Gulotta, he congratulated Mr. Vanderhoef on the outstanding dedicated job he did for two years as Council Co-chair. He added that Mr. Gulotta would do everything he could to emulate Mr. Vanderhoef's performance.

Mr. Blankman conducted the meeting from this point.

E. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mr. Blankman asked those who were planning to speak to keep their remarks to three minutes. He called the first speaker.

Ms. Zee Frank of Landmark Studios, Inc. spoke about the Harlem River Yard and Mr. Galesi who was utilizing 96 acres of land for his personal greed. She also spoke about the destruction of the people of the Bronx. She said that rail freight experts were brought into New York, but there was still no rail freight because of Francesco Galesi, and the situation should be investigated.

Mr. Lou Sepersky of Metro East, Inc., a citizens advisory group, urged greater and heightened attention for a fully built Second Avenue Subway, which would start at 125th & Lexington Avenue down Second Avenue to the financial district. He added that none of the plans for the Second Avenue Subway were new, that they had been around for 70 years, and it was time that all options were examined, and a decision made to have a fully built project which would lend itself to expansion to the Bronx, southeast Queens, and to portions of Brooklyn. Mr. Sepersky said that he thought the time was at hand to find the mechanism to get the work done. He closed and congratulated the pass chairperson, and wished the new co-chair well for his term.

Mr. Blankman turned the meeting back to Mr. Boardman.

Mr. Boardman asked if there were any other items to be raised. There were none.

H. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned.

VOTING MEMBERS

Joseph H. Boardman, NYSDOT, Commissioner
Forrest Taylor, representing Marc Shaw, Executive Director, MTA
Jay Hashmall, representing Andrew J. Spano, Westchester County Executive
Howard Blankman, representing Thomas S. Gulotta, Nassau County Executive
Robert J. Gaffney, Suffolk County Executive
Floyd Lapp, representing Joseph B. Rose, Commissioner, NYC Planning Commission
John Lynch, representing Robert J. Bondi, Putnam County Executive
Charles Ukegbu, representing Wilbur Chapman Commissioner, NYCDOT
C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County Executive
Richard A. Maitino, NYSDOT, Council Secretary

ADVISORY MEMBERS

James Austin, NYSDEC, representing J.P. Cahill, Commissioner
Harold J. Brown, Division Administrator, FHWA
Letitia Thompson, Regional Administrator, Federal Transit Administration
Jeanne M. Fox, Regional Administrator, Environmental Protection Agency
Cliff Sobel, representing Joel S. Weiner, Executive Director, NJTPA
Lou Venech, representing Robert E. Boyle, Executive Director, PANY&NJ

COUNCIL STAFF

Michele Bager
Juliette Bergman
Gerard Bogacz
Everett Chamberlain, Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee (TCC)
Kuo-Ann Chiao
George Crawford
Swati Desai
Lenn Ditman
Valli Gadsden-Smith
Emma Gaitan
James W. Harris, Executive Director
Norma Hessian
Jan Khan
Larry Malsam, NYCTCC
Larry McAuliffe
Tom Schulze
Jean Shanahan, Mid-Hudson South TCC
Wesley Stephen
Mark Tobin
Wendy VanEaton, MHSTCC

OTHERS

George Armeit, ESPA
Seth Berman, NYCDOT
Ron Borsellino, USEPA
Andrew Branch, Westchester Co. DOT
Dominic Bryan, Keyspan Energy
Charle J. Cafian, CB#2, Manhattan
Anthony Carr, FTA
Patty Chemka, Westchester Co.
Marvin Church, Westchester Co.
Gerald V. Cronin, Suffolk County
Nancy Danzig, FTA
Michael Doyle, PCAC
Beverly Dolinsky, PCAC
William Fahey, Liberty Lines
Zee Frank, Landmark Studios
Omar Freilla, NYC Environmental Justice Alliance
Harold Gary, Putnam County Highway
Robert Gottleim, Cong. Nadler's Office
William K. Guild, Inst. For Rational Urban Mobility
Robert Grotell, Mayor's Office on Transportation
Fred Hiffa, NYSDOT
Jeff Hirsch, USDOD
A. Ilan, A. Ilan Consultants
Rudolph Kapichak, USEPA
Irwin B. Kessman, Nassau County
Susan Kupferman, MTA
Floyd Lapp, NYCDCP
Jim Manzolino, NYSDOT, region 11
Jonathan McDade, FHWA
Joan McDonnell, Amtrak
Barbara McGarry, USEPA
John Orcutt, Tri-State Campaign
Kate Quinn, FHWA
Sarah Rios, MTA
Dave Rettig, NYSDOT, Reg. 10
Elliot Sander, NYU
George Sarmiento, Rockland County
Lou Sepersky, Metro-East
Gail Spears, ESDC
Andrew Suncta, WHGDCD
Bill Vann, Gannett
William Wheeler, MTA
James J. Yarmus, Rockland County