



Joel P. Ettinger
Executive Director

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE SEPTEMBER 27, 2012
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Ron Epstein, Chief Financial Officer for the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), and the newly appointed Secretary to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council. The members of the Council introduced themselves. It was declared that there was a quorum. The meeting was chaired by Ron Epstein on behalf of the New York State Department of Transportation Commissioner Joan McDonald and Co-Chair to the Council. Commissioner McDonald was not present for the meeting.

B. OPENING SESSION

Mr. Epstein welcomed the Council members and their designees and gave a special welcome to the newest Council member, Regional Administrator Marilyn Shazor of Federal Transit Administration. He noted that NYMTC needed to develop and adopt a new long-range Regional Transportation Plan, a new Transportation Improvement Program and a new Transportation Conformity Determination which were essential to maintaining the flow of federal transportation funding into the region, which played a major role in the ability to advance improvements to the region's transportation system. He said that all of the members were aware of the financial challenges they faced but the challenge would be to make the best use of the resources at disposal to fulfill the federal planning requirements that enabled access to federal resources.

The NYC Department of Transportation Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan was not available to attend the meeting. Ms. Linda Bailey spoke on the behalf of Commissioner Janet Sadik-Khan, who agreed that challenges were faced by all. Ms. Bailey said that in transportation, a backlog of road repair work and the challenges faced as the population continues to grow over the next 25 years as represented in NYMTC's next Regional Transportation Plan. She talked about MAP-21 and noted that changes that were made in that federal bill would have to be addressed as the federal program moved forward. She said that performance management focused in MAP-21 would bring a new dimension to the planning work and a new focus for some of the products produced. She said that everyone would need to work together as members of NYMTC to develop a workable but meaningful performance management system that would be responsive to the guidance received on MAP-21. She said that the Commissioner looked forward to working with the members and for all of the agencies to bring their individual performance management structures into harmony as goals were attempted to be met.

C. PRESENTATION

Launching the Development of NYMTC's 2040 New Regional Transportation Plan

Mr. Joel Ettinger, NYMTC Executive Director, provided an overview of NYMTC's 2040 Regional Transportation Plan (Plan) titled, The Shared Vision for Sustainable Growth, and noted that the current Plan would expire October, 2013. He said the Plan's purpose was to set the course on how the NYMTC region would address the transportation needs through 2040. He said that Plan 2040 would be multi-modal and would cover the entire 10 county NYMTC region and would cover the period of 2014-2040. He noted that the Plan enabled transportation projects in the NYMTC region that were in the Plan to

qualify for federal transportation funding and noted that the plan had to be fiscally constrained. He said that Plan 2040 would give consideration to some overarching issues that impact the transportation system either directly or indirectly such as energy, climate change, transportation, public health, transportation innovation, technology, as well as globalization trends. He said that major factors underlying Plan 2040 were consideration of current and future demand; assessment of current and future needs; and consideration of overarching issues and trends.

**D. PRESENTATION – “Financing Transportation Improvements”
Kevin DeGood, Deputy Policy Director, Transportation for America**

Mr. Kevin DeGood, Deputy Policy Director for Transportation for America gave a presentation titled, Making the Most of MAP 21 and Transportation Finance. MAP-21, Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century Act is a funding and authorization bill to govern federal surface transportation. Mr. DeGood provided highlights of the bill and then talked about the available funding sources. The detailed presentation can be found on the NYMTC website at www.NYMTC.org.

E. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents, said that the NYSDOT does not understand the federal highway administration manual on uniform traffic control devices. He said that the NYSDOT refuses to follow the manual. He requested to have someone from the NSDOT to meet with him regarding this issue. He noted that the presentation given by Kevin DeGood was accurate, magnificent and the information Mr. DeGood provided should be a required course for everyone in the room.

Mr. Orin Getz said that steps should be taken to ensure that the New York State Thruway Authority had an “A” prime rating to be able to properly finance the Tappan Zee Bridge. He said that it was unreasonable to have two main authorities maintain bridges off the Hudson River and suggested that the New York State Bridge Authority should be merged with the New York State Thruway Authority to find the additional revenue needed in the long term. He said that the 2040 Regional Transportation Plan must include a comprehensive plan for improving Trans Hudson transportation, noting that 98% of freight was moved by truck and only 2% by rail. He suggested that the 2040 Regional Transportation Plan needed to include a freight tunnel from the Greenville Yard in Jersey City connecting into the railroad in Brooklyn, and that two new passenger rail tunnels were needed under the Hudson River connecting to Penn Station in New York and in Weehawken, New Jersey. He suggested that an extension of the #7 subway line to be extended to the Secaucus transfer station; a light rail system was needed over the Tappan Zee Bridge; and a train station was needed in the Woodbury Common on the Port Jervis line. He noted that Woodbury Common Mall as the most popular tourist attraction in the region but had no direct public transportation facilities.

F. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: MARCH 1, 2012 MEETING SYNOPSIS

A motion to accept the March 1, 2012 Council Meeting Synopsis was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt representing Ms. Amanda Burden, Director, NYC Department of City Planning, and was seconded by Mr. Fred Pena, representing County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The meeting synopsis was accepted. There was no discussion.

2. ACCEPT: AUGUST 20, 2012 MEETING SYNOPSIS

A motion to accept the August 20, 2012 Council Meeting Synopsis was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt representing Ms. Amanda Burden, Director, NYC Department of City Planning, and was seconded by Mr. Fred Pena, representing County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The meeting synopsis was accepted. There was no discussion.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-8 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF A REVISED PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT PLAN AND RELATED PROCEDURES

Mr. Ron Epstein said that on April 30, 2012, NYMTC opened up a 45-day public comment period to review its draft revised Public Involvement Plan and draft revised Overall Public Participation Procedures, per federal requirements, as part of an ongoing effort to improve public outreach and involvement activities.

Ms. Lisa Daglian, NYMTC's Public Information Officer, said that federal regulations required Metropolitan Planning Organizations to develop and to periodically review their public information procedures. She said the NYMTC's Public Involvement Plan had been revised and operating procedures for public participation had been developed.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-8, Council Adoption of a Revised Public Involvement Plan and Related Procedures was motioned by Deputy County Executive Charles T. Theofan, representing County Executive Edward Mangano, Nassau County, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing Director Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-9 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF SUPPLEMENTAL OPERATING PROCEDURES FOR ORGANIZATIONAL RESPONSIBILITIES

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, NYMTC's Planning Director, noted that the Memo of Understanding, which established NYMTC, designated specific organizational responsibilities to the member agencies and also set aside provisions for operating procedures to be adopted overtime to adjust to requirements given to federal legislation. He said that NYMTC had adopted operating procedures on several occasions to respond to different federal requirements. He noted that the resolution proposes the adoption of supplemental operating procedures that clarify the Program, Finance and Administration Committee's (PFAC) oversight responsibilities of the day to day operation of NYMTC and would clarify the relationship of the Council to the PFAC.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-9, Council Adoption of Supplemental Operating Procedures for Organizational Responsibilities was motioned by Mr. Thomas B. Vanderbeek, representing County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County, and seconded by Mr. Garry Lenberger, representing County Executive Steven Bellone, Suffolk County. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

5. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-10 – AMENDMENT OF THE FISCALLY-CONSTRAINED ELEMENT OF THE 2010-2035 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN TO INCLUDE TWO NEW SELECT BUS SERVICE PROJECTS

Mr. Jan Khan of NYMTC Staff explained that two New York City Select Bus Service projects needed to be amended into the fiscally constrained 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan. One project was located in Queens, on Hillside Avenue from Sutphin Boulevard and Archer Avenue to 168th Street. The other project was located in the Bronx, on Webster Avenue from 149th Street and 3rd Avenue to White Plains Road. He noted that the cost of each project was \$20 million and there was no negative impact on the fiscal constrained 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-10, Amendment of the Fiscally-Constrained Element of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan to Include Two New Select Bus Service Projects was motioned by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing Director Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning, and seconded by Mr. Fred Pena, representing County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

6. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-11 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO THE COUNCIL BY ROBERT ZERRILLO, NYS DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

Mr. Epstein noted that the purpose of the resolution was to give recognition of service to Robert Zerrillo, the former Secretary to NYMTC and Chair to PFAC. He wished him the best and thanked Mr. Zerrillo for his personality, his ethics and his commitment to the region in making sure that the region could be prepared for the future challenges that were faced. He then read resolution.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-11, Recognition of Service to the Council by Robert Zerrillo, NYS Department of Transportation was motioned by Mr. Thomas B. Vanderbeek, representing County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County, and seconded by Mr. William Wheeler, representing Mr. Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

7. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-12 – DISTRIBUTION OF SECTION 5307 URBANIZED AREA FORMULA PROGRAM FUNDS AND SECTION 5340 GROWING STATES FORMULA FUNDS FOR FEDERAL FISCAL YEAR 2012

Mr. Gerry Bogacz noted that the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) allocated funds for Section 5307, Urbanized Area Formula Program Funds and Section 5340, Growing State Formula Funds. He said that there were two urbanized areas that were covered by New York, New Jersey, and Connecticut to sub-allocate these funds and the designated recipients receive these funds. He noted that the caveat for the 5. ¼% for NYC Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) will be sub-allocated between the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and the NYCDOT via separate letter to the FTA once there has been an agreement of the sub-allocation. He noted that the finding was essential to the capital programs of the transit agencies in the region and each year NYMTC is required to adopt the sub-allocation to designated recipients.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-12, Distribution of Section 5307 Urbanized Area Formula Program Funds and Section 5340 Growing States Formula Funds for Federal Fiscal Year 2012 was motioned by Mr. William Wheeler, representing Mr. Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, and seconded by Ms. Christine Sculti, representing County Executive Robert Astorino, Westchester County. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

G. ADJOURN

The meeting was unanimously adjourned by the members of NYMTC.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

NYS Department of Transportation – Mr. Ron Epstein represented Commissioner Joan McDonald
NYC Department of Transportation – Ms. Linda Bailey represented Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan
NYC Department of City Planning – Mr. Jack Schmidt represented Director Amanda Burden
Metropolitan Transportation Authority – Mr. William Wheeler represented Executive Director and C.E.O Joseph Lhota
Nassau County – Deputy County Executive Charles T. Theofan represented County Executive Edward Mangano
Suffolk County – Mr. Garry Lenberger represented County Executive Steven Bellone
Putnam County – Commissioner Fred Pena represented County Executive MaryEllen Odell
Rockland County – Commissioner Thomas Vanderbeek represented County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef
Westchester County – Ms. Christine Sculti represented County Executive Robert Astorino

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Federal Highway Administration – Mr. Jonathan McDade, Division Administrator
Federal Transit Administration – Ms. Nancy Danzig represented Marilyn Shazor, Regional Administrator
NYS Department of Environmental Conservation – Mr. Jared Snyder represented Joseph Martens, Commissioner
North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority – Mr. David Behrend represented Mary K. Murphy, Executive Director
U. S. Environmental Protection Agency – Mr. Michael Moltzen represented Judith Enck, Regional Administrator
Port Authority of New York & New Jersey – Mr. John Ma represented Patrick Foye, Executive Director

NYMTC

Imran Ahmed	Lisa Daglian	Larry McAuliffe
Afolabi Aiyendun	Nina DelSenno	Andrea Miles-Cole
Olayinka Alamu	Joel Ettinger	Kathy Monroe
Jorge Argote	Angelina Foster	Elias Montes
Wieslaw Amber	Emma Gaitan	Darrin Moret
Ananya Barnah	Anthony Gawrych	Larisa Morozovskaya
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Jan Khan	Chris Rodrigues-Moore
Gerry Bogacz	Kyeongsu Kim	Munnesh Patel
Thusitha Chandra	David Kletsman	Abdus Salam
Ken Chin	John Lopez	Max Sokol
Michael Chiume	Howard Mann	

OTHERS

Whitney Alper, Cambridge Systematics	Andrew Kalloch, Manhattan BP Stringer
Phillip Azachi, Assemblyman Kavanagh’s Office	Naomi Klein, Westchester County
David Behrend, NJTPA	Frank Lipinski, ACPA
Noah Berger, FTA	John Pilner, Putnam County
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents	Karen Rosenberger, FHWA
Robert Brickman, Nassau County DPW/PI	Karin Sommer, NYCDOT
Kevin DeGood, Transportation for America	Lou Venech, PANYNJ
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County	Melanie Zeman, USEPA
Orrin Getz, NJ ARP	
Ryan Harris, Jacobs	
Brook Jackson, Partnership for NYC	
Anne Keyzamowski, Assemblyman Nolan’s Office	
Tom Leddy, GLICCC	
Michael Levine, Town of North Hempstead	

This September 27, 2012 Council Meeting Synopsis was unanimously accepted by all members of the Council at its February 26, 2013 Annual Meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Andrea’ Miles-Cole
Secretary II- NYMTC*

