



Joel P. Ettinger  
Executive Director

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 1, 2012  
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

**A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Robert Zerrillo of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) and Secretary of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council. The members of the Council introduced themselves. It was declared that there was a quorum. The meeting was chaired by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, of Rockland County and Co-Chair to the Council.

**B. OPENING SESSION**

**NYMTC's Co-Chair, C. Scott Vanderhoef, County Executive, Rockland County**

County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef welcomed the new Council members—Steve Bellone, Suffolk County Executive, MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County Executive, Joseph Lhota, Metropolitan Transportation Authority Chair & CEO, Patrick Foye, Port Authority of New York & New Jersey Executive Director; and Anthony Carr, Acting Regional Administrator, Federal Transit Administration. County Executive Vanderhoef talked about the meeting's theme, *Infrastructure at a Crossroads: Financing the Region's Transportation Needs*, noting that it was of the moment. County Executive Vanderhoef said that the region's transportation system was an important component of the State's infrastructure. He noted that in the New York City region, a vast transportation network provided unparalleled mobility which fueled the region's economic vitality, but the size and age of the region's transportation system signified that high levels of resources must continually be invested in its maintenance operation. He said that this was a challenge and finding additional resources to improve and enhance the system added to that challenge.

Nassau County Public Works Commissioner, Shila Shah-Gavnoudias spoke on behalf of County Executive Ed Mangano who was not available to attend the meeting. Ms. Shah-Gavnoudias reported that County Executive Mangano extended his thanks to Joel Ettinger and Commissioner Joan McDonald for providing support throughout his role as co-chair for the last year and that he was grateful for the opportunity to contribute to the Regional Transportation Plan. County Executive Mangano appreciated the support he received to expand Nassau's growth area that included the Belmont property in the western portion of Nassau County, which was consistent with his economic development plan, also known as Accelerate Nassau Now. It was noted that he would continue to commit to working collaboratively with the members of NYMTC with their initiatives and their key projects.

**C. NYMTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Joel Ettinger, NYMTC's Executive Director, said, "NYMTC, like many of the public agencies in the region, was doing more with less." He said that NYMTC was turning to innovative approaches to accomplish work and meet deadlines in the face of dwindling resources. Mr. Ettinger reported that the staff of the New York City Department of City Planning was acting as NYMTC's "consultant" in the development of the next Regional Transportation Plan, (Plan). He said that the staff of the New York

City Department of Transportation and suburban counties was playing similar roles in data collection needed to maintain NYMTC's analytical tools and the simulation modeling capabilities, which were critical in meeting federal air quality and congestion management requirements. He reported that NYMTC was collaborating with the University Transportation Research Center to accomplish tasks for the planning process, such as the development of new analytical tools, upgrading the Plan's long-range financial element, developing the analysis process for the Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality program, and developing the procedures for the federally-required Major Project Analyses. He reported that NYMTC was working through the New York State Association of Metropolitan Planning Organizations to spearhead a statewide planning integration exercise, to seek greater efficiencies between the statewide planning process of the NYSDOT and the regional planning processes of 13 metropolitan planning organizations. He said that the purpose of this effort was to make more efficient use of the federal and state resources available statewide for transportation planning and to eliminate duplicative efforts. Mr. Ettinger reported that other resources of funding had been pursued to accomplish work that was consistent with the Shared Vision, such as NYMTC's being a part of a consortium that applied for and received \$3.5 million Sustainable Communities Grant from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). The consortium consisted of New York City, four cities in the lower Hudson Valley, four cities in southwestern Connecticut; Nassau and Suffolk counties, six regional planning organizations, three metropolitan planning organizations in southwestern Connecticut, the Long Island Regional Planning Council and the Regional Plan Association. He reported that over \$1 million of that grant funded work of the NYCDOT in the Bronx and Brooklyn, and just over \$600,000 funded Nassau and Suffolk counties work related to their respective regional desired growth areas. In addition, almost \$75,000 of "in-kind" resources was directed to supporting related planning work in the lower Hudson Valley. He said that innovative approaches and expanded staff responsibilities allowed NYMTC to keep pace with the various federal planning cycles and deadlines that supported the Council member's shared vision for the region's transportation system. Mr. Ettinger reported that NYMTC adopted a new Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) containing almost \$35 billion of transportation projects and new related Transportation Conformity Determination; completed a Regional Household Travel Survey involving 18,000 households in three states; adopted a new set of Social-Economic and Demographic forecasts to a 2040 horizon year for the new Plan; and helped to kick-off the New York-Connecticut Sustainable Communities Planning Program, bringing over \$1.5 million of HUD funding into the planning program.

#### **D. CONFIRMATION OF NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIR**

County Executive Vanderheof said as per the Memo of Understanding for the Council, the co-chair was rotated annually among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees (TCCs). Last year, the co-chair was selected from the Nassau/Suffolk TCC. This year, the co-chair was selected from the New York City TCC. County Executive Vanderhoef confirmed the Commissioner of the NYC Department of Transportation Janette Sadik-Khan as the new co-chair to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council effective March 1, 2012 to March, 2013.

Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan said that NYMTC played a crucial role in the development of planning programs for a region that covers 64% of the State's population which was a big responsibility. She noted that coming up with the funding and planning priorities for the region was extraordinarily important work and that the funding on the local, state and federal level was a challenge and would take a lot of hard work to get priorities translated into actual projects on the ground. Commissioner Sadik-Khan said that she looked forward to the coming year and was pleased to work alongside with her Council member colleagues to ensure that the region continues to grow and thrive in the years to come so that in the year 2030, they will be pleased with what they will see.

**E. FEATURED SPEAKERS – INFRASTRUCTURE AND THE REGION’S ECONOMIC VITALITY**

**Karen Rae, New York State Deputy Secretary for Transportation**

Ms. Karen Rae, New York State Deputy Secretary for Transportation, spoke about the very important link between infrastructure and the region’s vitality. Ms. Rae emphasized Governor Cuomo’s initiatives to accelerate infrastructure funding and construction and said that he had dedicated a new focus to infrastructure investment and transportation. She said that the federal challenges were huge on-going issues, and the paralysis in Washington affected everyone and the communities served, so working together to press for that long term federal transportation program was a must. She said that the Tappan Zee Bridge project would finally be moving forward, thanks to Governor Cuomo and a special designation from the White House, so now the region would have jobs and a bridge that would be built that would support transit. She said pushing projects backwards was easy, but keeping them going was hardest and Governor Cuomo realized that completing large capital projects required constant focus and constant aggressive action. She said the momentum of building the bridge could not be stopped because if the bridge was not built, future transit would not exist. She said that she looked forward to working with NYMTC, the counties, the federal partners, and all transportation partners on advancing an aggressive agenda that would focus on the needs of New York State and its future.

**Kenneth Adams, President, Empire State Development Corporation**

Mr. Kenneth Adams, President of the Empire State Development Corporation, said his role was to advocate for investments in transportation infrastructure as a critical piece of economic development. He spoke about the state’s commitment to economic development at the regional level through Governor Cuomo’s Regional Economic Development Councils. He also spoke about one of the Governor’s goals to change the culture of New York State government by having the leaders of State agencies to step out of their bureaucratic silos of their agencies to find new ways to work together to get things done. He said that investments in infrastructure created jobs and also builds a strong economy. He said he looked forward to continuing conversations, learning specific needs and projects and being a partner.

**F. ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION: INFRASTRUCTURE AT A CROSSROADS**

Council members held a roundtable discussion expressing their thoughts on the theme—“Infrastructure at a Crossroads: Financing the Region’s Transportation Needs.”

County Executive Vanderhoef noted that the Council members all defined a shared vision for the maintenance and expansion of the region’s transportation infrastructure in the short and long term and said as individual officials, they were also responsible for specific components of the transportation system. He asked the council how they thought uncertain federal funding would impact the shared vision and their planning for the infrastructure under their jurisdiction.

Commissioner Shila Shah-Gavnoudias reported that Nassau County had been affected by the reduced federal funding. She said that the county’s focus over the next few years would be on road resurfacing, traffic signal and pavement marking projects. She said that their ability to borrow would be hampered, so the reduction of borrowing coupled with reduced federal funding would put the county in an unanticipated situation of not being able to perform the necessary infrastructure needs for the county, which were related to health & safety and economic development. She said that reduced funding would also hamper the ability to promote County Executive Mangano’s Accelerate Nassau Now Plan, which was a program that would create thousands of jobs throughout the county between the western side of Belmont through the Nassau Hub area and the Navy Grumman site.

Commissioner Sadik-Khan said that one of the issues would be that major infrastructure projects would not be able to be funded. She said that the market depended on a stable source of funding to move forward with major capital projects and without it, full funding grant agreements would not be achievable. She noted that stripping out transit projects from the Highway Trust Fund would ensure that major transit projects would not be funded and was not a smart long-term strategy. She said that because companies and people could move anywhere, building healthy metropolitan areas that would attract investments, businesses, and families to live, grow and thrive was necessary. She talked about the HR7 bill that did not pass and said its impact would have been devastating and critical transportation investments that were key for economic development would not have been able to be moved forward. She said that consideration should be given that other countries were spending a significantly higher amount on transportation and unless a different strategy was pursued, the region was in danger of being left behind.

Nuria Fernandez, MTA Chief Operating Officer, said that federal dollars were in jeopardy and there would never be enough federal dollars to do everything needed. She said the pipeline of infrastructure investments was so long that the combinations of other sources were going to have to come to bear. She said that transportation was the life line of all areas, and the region thrived because of transportation, which went hand in hand with economic development and opened opportunity and gave people options to do what they needed to do, when they needed to do it. She said that the MTA had to do things a little differently and seek other opportunities to close the gap in their budget, without affecting the importance of safety, which was challenging. She said that other ways of addressing the need for maintaining and modernizing the transportation infrastructure in this 21<sup>st</sup> Century was necessary.

Anthony Carr, Federal Transit Administration Acting Regional Administrator said that there were not enough federal funds to really cover all of the projects that were on the table and presented to them, especially in a slowed down economy and asked the Principals to come up with more creative ways to finance their projects.

John Ma, Port Authority of NY&NJ, Special Assistant to Executive Director Patrick Foye, noted that the Port Authority followed a bi-state charter for their projects and although they were self-financed and self-funded, there were limited resources and many more needs than there was capital. He said that the Port Authority was looking at private sector investments and seeking for innovative ideas that would bring capital to help get projects going. He said that the Port Authority was also looking hard and close at the replacement of some existing infrastructure. He noted that the regulatory processes hindered getting projects done timely and efficiently. He said streamlining the regulatory processes where it made sense, while still protective of the environment, was important.

County Executive Vanderhoef acknowledged Governor Cuomo and said that private partnership was a critical issue of funding major projects, including the Tappan Zee Bridge, and was a way to get investors, not taxpayers, to invest in infrastructure as a way both to receive certain percentages of the long term benefits and to allow the government to do better. He said that for 10 years, there had been discussions about the Tappan Zee Bridge's entire corridor—that included the growth and sustainable development of the corridor and mass transportation, an important, critical component. He said that the goal was to provide for mobility for the region, to move people and goods in the most efficient and carefree manner that included transit. County Executive Vanderhoef said that he was pleased that Governor Cuomo was moving forward on the Tappan Zee Bridge project but also hoped that some sort of transit—Bus Rapid Transit, was not left out. He thanked Karen Rae and Ken Adams for talking about infrastructure and the region's economic vitality noting that it was the most ignored subject in New York State. He said that citizens often don't understand the connection between the vital economic health of the state and the region and infrastructure as it exists.

County Executive MaryEllen Odell said that Putnam County was rebuilding with a new administration for the first time in 20 years. She said that Putnam County was small and unique offering the region economic growth in the form of tourism. She said that she was pleased to hear the 3P concept (private public partnership) being administered in the Tappan Zee Project and said it was a smart way and a

reality check to understand that federal funds were no longer available in a way they were before. She said she and her new administration looked forward to working on a high level with the Council and appreciated the opportunity to be a part of the discussion.

Sarah Lansdale spoke on behalf of Suffolk County Executive Steven Bellone. Ms. Lansdale reported that Suffolk County's population exceeded 11 states and was not immune from financial worries. She reported that County Executive Bellone challenged staff to do more with less. She noted that connecting and coordinating transportation and land-use was essential to achieving economic development. She said that they looked forward to working with federal, state, and regional partners, specifically in advancing several key initiatives, including exploring Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) along the Route 110 corridor, which would promote transit-oriented development around the Ronkonkoma HUB and implementing "Wyandanch Rising".

Jonathan McDade, Division Administrator, Federal Highway Administration, noted that every agency was challenged with the lack of uncertainty and the lack of funding but action must be taken by all because sitting back and doing nothing would make the situation even worse. He said he appreciated the collaborative effort of the shared vision that showed where growth and improvement was desired and would continue to support that effort.

## **G. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents, said that there was a cultural divide and suggested that all members of the board to have a laptop or tablet in of them during the meeting. He said that unnecessary paper was being distributed during meetings and documents should be viewed on screens instead. He talked about the rules set for the meetings and if he was to follows any rules, the Council should also.

Orrin Getz expressed his thoughts regarding the Tappan Zee Bridge project. He said that the plans lacked mass transit facilities, an exclusive bus lane, and there were problems with the approach towards funding. He said that the #7 Flushing transit line needed to be extended to Secaucus, NJ and there was a need to upgrade the Passaic Valley Line. He also expressed the need to improve the performance of traffic signals maintained by the New York State Department of Transportation.

Lily Kesselman, a South Bronx resident, *submitted the attached remarks* expressing her concerns about the high rates of asthma in the Bronx County. She urged the New York State Department of Transportation to review its lease with Harlem River Rail Ventures and force them to comply with an easement giving residents access and giving residents "The Greenway." She urged the NYSDOT to stop Fresh Direct's move to the Harlem River Rail Yards and instead, bring in sustainable business and families.

George Haikalis, President, Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc., (IRUM), *submitted the attached remarks* requesting NYMTC to amend its 2012-2013 Unified Planning Work Program to include Amtrak's Gateway Project that would expand Hudson River passenger rail capacity.

Arthur Mychal Johnson, a South Bronx resident, *submitted the attached remarks* expressing that Harlem River Rail Ventures failed to develop the intermodal rail terminal in the Harlem River Yards and that the current usage of Harlem River Yards was a severe asthmatic health risk for many of the local residents. He urged the New York State Department of Transportation to halt all new development at Harlem River Yards, including Fresh Direct's proposed development.

Veronica Vanterpool, Tri-State Transportation Campaign (TSTC), said that transportation infrastructure was at a crossroad and that crossroad would either direct towards a path of sustainability or away from it, noting the Tappan Zee Bridge as an example. The TSTC supported the Governor's intention to move the project forward to spur economic growth and to spur job creation, but said a bridge without concrete design plans for transit, specifically Bus Rapid Transit (BRT), in the immediate construction of the bridge, would remove the transportation infrastructure project away

from sustainability for the region. She noted that the current bridge project focused on cars and trucks, which would increase traffic, water pollution, air pollution, sprawl and isolated communities. She said for the past 10 years support for BRT had been voiced consistently. She questioned why the state asserted that buses cost more than commuter rail and requested financial documentation that supported that claim; she questioned why doesn't Westchester and Rockland counties have sole responsibility of building a BRT system on the bridge; and questioned why aren't the creation and permanence of transit manufacturing and operations jobs on the bridge to spur economic development as important as construction jobs. She reiterated that TSTC strongly supported building the bridge but with BRT and with permanent jobs beyond the construction phase.

Harry Bubbins, Director, Friends of Brook Park, *submitted the attached remarks* requesting the New York State Department of Transportation's Commissioner McDonald to meet with local community members to discuss the Harlem River Yards property and to provide their input for the appropriate use of the property.

Alexander Saunders said that for twelve years, he had been working and sharing information with many teams that have been involved with the Tappan Zee Crossing. He said the current plan would not address the current traffic problem in the region and said that at least 20,000 people had died in the region of I-95, I-495 because traffic was not being handled correctly. He said that a Tappan Zee/Long Island tunnel with truck on train would ease this problem and would cost a lot less to build, noting that it would cost \$800 million to carry 70 million people verses \$5.2 billion to carry 140,000 cars.

Matt Shotkin congratulated Commissioner Sadik-Khan on her Co-Chair confirmation. He said that he was pleased that the new I-287 extension in White Plains and Tarrytown was complete. He said that the Metropolitan Transportation Authority needed funding and a complete overhaul on some of its train's brakes.

## **H. ACTION ITEMS**

### **1. ACCEPT: AUGUST 4, 2011 MEETING SYNOPSIS**

A motion to accept the August 4, 2011 Council Meeting Synopsis was made by Nuria Fernandez representing Joseph Lhota, Chairman & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, and was seconded by County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The meeting synopsis was accepted. There was no discussion.

### **2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2012-2013 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM**

County Executive Vanderhoef noted that the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) sets the Council's priorities and work schedule for the fiscal year. He said that the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) endorsed the UPWP at its February 23, 2012 meeting. He then introduced Mr. Gerry Bogacz to introduce the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, Planning Director of NYMTC, said that the resolution would adopt the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2012. He noted that it was an important required product that would bring in about \$26 million of new federal planning funds for both the operation of NYMTC staff and their activities as well as funding for the member agencies' related planning projects and would cover core and discretionary work. Mr. Bogacz took responsibility for the Amtrak Gateway Project not being included in the UPWP. He noted that it was a requirement to catalogue all planning activities even if they were not federally funded. He said because it was currently not in the UPWP, the funding for the project would not be affected. The full document, the management summary and a presentation could be found on the NYMTC website at [www.NYMTC.org](http://www.NYMTC.org).

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-1, Council Adoption of the 2012-2013 Unified Planning Work Program was made by Linda Bailey, representing Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan, New York City Department of Transportation, and was second by William Wheeler, representing Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-2 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF AN ACTION PLAN FOR NYMTC’S ANALYTICAL TOOLS**

County Executive Vanderhoef said that in response to the 2011 Federal Certification Review Report’s recommendation pertaining to Air Quality and the Best Practice Model, NYMTC proposed an Action Plan to improve the performance, efficiency and effectiveness of NYMTC’s analytical tools and their applications in the planning process.

Ms. Sangeeta Bhowmick, NYMTC’s Acting Technical Director, said that the action plan laid out updates and enhancements of NYMTC’s analytical tools over the next few years and with the implementation of this action plan, the conformity process would be reduced considerably and NYMTC would have an improved travel demand forecasting tool in place for various planning analyses in the region.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-2, Council Adoption of An Action Plan for NYMTC’s Analytical Tools, was motioned by Samuel Hornick, representing Amanda Burden, Director, New York City Department of City Planning, and seconded by County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-3 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE BY STEVE LEVY, PAUL ELDRIDGE, JAY WALDER, CHRISTOPHER WARD, AND BRIGID HYNES-CHERIN AS PRINCIPAL MEMBERS OF NYMTC**

County Executive Vanderhoef noted that the resolution acknowledged the service of past Principals of NYMTC. He said that each of the former members had contributed their work to the Council.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-3, Recognition of Service by Steve Levy, Paul Eldridge, Jay Walder, Christopher Ward, and Brigid Hynes-Cherin as Principal Members of NYMTC was motioned by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County, and seconded by William Wheeler, representing Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**5. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-4 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE AS NYMTC CO-CHAIR BY EDWARD MANGANO, NASSAU COUNTY**

County Executive Vanderhoef noted that County Executive Ed Mangano was being acknowledged for his service as Co-Chair to the Council for the 2011 fiscal year.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-4, Recognition of Service as NYMTC Co-Chair by Edward Mangano, Nassau County, was motioned by William Wheeler, representing Joseph Lhota, Chair and Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, and seconded by County Executive MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**I. ADJOURN**

The meeting was adjourned.

## ATTENDANCE

### Voting Council Principals/Representatives

C. Scott Vanderhoef, County Executive, Rockland County  
Sarah Lansdale for Steven Bellone, County Executive, Suffolk County  
Shila Shah-Gavnoudias for Edward Mangano, County Executive, Nassau County  
Sandy Hornick for Amanda Burden, Director, New York City Department of City Planning  
Janette Sadik-Khan, Commissioner, New York City Department of Transportation  
Nuria Fernandez for Joseph Lhota, Executive Director and C.E.O., Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
Christine Sultti for Robert Astorino, County Executive, Westchester County  
MaryEllen Odell, County Executive, Putnam County  
Robert Zerrillo, New York Department of Transportation & NYMTC Secretary

### Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Jonathan McDade, Division Administrator, Federal Highway Administration  
Anthony Carr, Acting Regional Administrator, Federal Transit Administration  
Mary K. Murphy, Executive Director, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority  
Reema Loutan for Judith Enck, Regional Administrator, US Environmental Protection Agency  
Richard Roberts for James Weinstein, Executive Director, New Jersey Transit  
John Ma, for Patrick Foye, Executive Director, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey  
Jared Snyder for Joseph Martens, Commissioner, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation

### NYMTC

Ali Afshar	Merrill Frank	Ali Mohseni
Afolabi Aiyedun	Emma Gaitain	Kathy Monroe
Olayinka Alamu	Maria Garcia	Larisa Morozovskaya
Ismet Apdiroglu	Anthony Gawrych	Olga Olovyannikov
Jorge Argote	Jerry Jonassen	Munnesh Patel
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Stephen Hausch	Shalendra Ramadhin
Gerry Bogacz	Ruben Hoyos	Alan Ripps
Rosemary Checca	Jan Khan	Chris Rodrigues-Moore
Ken Chin	Carl King	Abdus Salam
Michael Chiume	Mikhail Kotikovskiy	Judd Schechtman
Lisa Daglian	John Lopez	Jean Shanahan
Daniel Etkin	Howard Mann	Max Sokol
Joel Ettinger	Andrea Miles-Cole	

### OTHERS

Kenneth Adams, Empire State Develop. Corp	Jack Craig
Onyinye Akujou, NYCDOT	Nancy Danzig, FTA
Marc Albrecht, MTA	Sandra Dixon, PANYNJ
Darin Allan, FTA	Gerard Drunn, Brookhaven Oil Terminal
Richard Anderson, NY Building Congress	John Duesing, Cambridge Systematics
Alexander Appel, FHWA	Phil Eng, NYSDOT
Linda Bailey, NYCDOT	Lawrence Fleischer, MTA
John Ballan, Selvin Law Firm	Michael Fleischer, HNTB
Monica Barrow, SYSTRA	Michael Flynn, NYCDOT
Andrew Bata, NYC Transit	Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County Pl Dept.
David Behrend, NJTPA	Paul K. Gessner, Gessner Transp Consulting
Seth Berman, NYCDOT	Orrin Getz, Rockland Coordinator ESPA
Justin Bernbach	Gary Giodano, CB #5 Queens
Judy Bliss, NYSDOT	Julie Greenburg
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents	Richard Gueltari, NYSDOT
Robert Brickman, Nassau County	George Haikalis, IRUM
Harry Bubbins, Friends of Brook Park	Krista Hartt
Dolores Buckenberger, TranSystem	Joseph Jarrin, NYCDOT
Pam Burford, MTA LIRR	A. Mychal Johnson
Luis Calderon, NYSDOT	Mike Jones, Jacobs
Pamela Chinn	Patrick B. Jordan, Zetlin Strategic Communications
Peter David Cohen,	Steven Jurow, HBTB
Jonathan Ehrlich, Thruway Authority	Bob Kaley, MTA
Jennifer Cox, LIRR	Filolaos T. Kefalas, PE, Sideris Kafalas Engrgs



Lily Kesselman  
Naomi Klein, Westchester Co DOPW&T  
Sarah Lansdale, Suffolk County  
Garry Lenberger, Suffolk Co. Planning Dept  
Adam Levin, NYSDOT  
Michael Levin, Town of Hempstead  
Mark Lieberman  
Richard Luong, New Partners for Com Revitalization  
Patrick Madigan, Senator Kruegers Office  
Uchenna Madu, NYSDOT  
Todd Maguire, NYCDOT  
John Mattera, NYC Parks  
Casey Morgan, MTA  
John Moss, PANJNY  
Tom Murphy, CB #7 Brooklyn  
Jim Newell, Oakland Transportation Holdings  
Kevin Olinger, NYCDOT  
Charles O'Shea, NYSDOT  
Fred Pena, Putnam Co. Hwy Commissioner  
Renee Peter-Smith, NYCDOT  
Dan Peterson, Hanover  
Lemuel Peterson, NYCDOT  
John Pilner, Putnam County  
Karen Rae, NYS Secy for Transportation  
Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT  
Karen Rosenberger, FHWA  
Haley Rubinson

Alexander Saunders, Tappan LI Tunnel  
Patrick Sbrano, NTABT  
Renee Schoonbeek, Hudson Square  
Kevin Scott, NYSDOT  
Christine Sculti, Westchester County  
Matt Shotkin  
Brian ten Siethoff, Cambridge Systematics  
Kate Slevin, Tri-State Transportation Campaign  
Karin Sommer, NYCDOT  
Satish Sood, Nassau County  
Laura Shabe, PANYNJ  
Satish Sood, Nassau Co. Planning Commission  
Gail Spears  
Heather Sporn, NYSDOT  
Michael Sweeney, TranSystems  
Vincent Tamanya, Putnam County  
A. Taylor, NYCDOT  
Jai Therattil, NYCDOT  
Vanis Trapp, NYCDOT  
Neil Trenk, Rockland County  
Thomas B. Vanderbeek, Rockland County  
Veronica Vanterpool, Tri-State Transp. Campaign  
Lou Venech, PANYNJ  
Chris Waite, TranSystems  
William Wheeler, NTA  
Melanie Zeman, USEPA

*This March 1, 2012 Meeting Synopsis was unanimously accepted by the voting members of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council at its September 27, 2012 meeting.*

*Respectfully Submitted,*

*Andrea' Miles-Cole  
Secretary II - NYMTC*