



Joel P. Ettinger  
Executive Director

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE AUGUST 20, 2012  
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

**A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Ron Epstein of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), representing Robert Zerrillo, Secretary to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council. The members of the Council introduced themselves. It was declared that there was a quorum. The meeting was chaired by New York State Department of Transportation Commissioner Joan McDonald and Co-Chair to the Council.

**B. OPENING SESSION**

**NYMTC's Co-Chair, Joan McDonald, Commissioner**

Commissioner Joan McDonald welcomed attendees and noted that the meeting was being webcast live which would be accessible through the NYMTC website at [www.NYMTC.org](http://www.NYMTC.org). She asked for a moment of silence in memory of Jean Shanahan, NYMTC's Mid-Hudson South Staff Director, who recently passed away. Commissioner McDonald explained that the Council Meeting was originally scheduled for July 10, 2012 and postponed so that the Final Environmental Impact Statement for the Tappan Zee Bridge Hudson River Crossing project could be reviewed. She further explained that all of the resolutions were posted on the NYMTC website on June 26<sup>th</sup> and since then significant public comments were received and addressed. She said that the meeting was called to expedite adoption of amendments involving the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing Project, which would allow progress to continue on replacing the critically important facility. She noted that the Tappan Zee project represented a multi-billion dollar investment that would create tens of thousands of jobs.

Mr. Howard Glaser, Director of State of Operations, Governor's Office, provided a brief history on creation of the Tappan Zee Bridge and provided an overview of the Tappan Zee Bridge Hudson River Crossing project. He explained that the bridge was built in the wrong place, with the wrong design and was outdated and overcrowded. He noted there were three options to proceed with--(1) Keep the old bridge; (2) Build a new bridge with a new county transit system; (3) Replace the old bridge with a new state-of-the-art, transit ready bridge. He said that the Final Environmental Impact Statement was distributed and concerns were being addressed. He said that the meeting established consensus to add the Tappan Zee Bridge Replacement project into the Regional Transportation Plan and then an application for funding under the Transportation Infrastructure Finance & Innovation Act Program would be initiated. For more information on the Tappan Zee Bridge Replacement Bridge project go to [www.NewNYBridge.com](http://www.NewNYBridge.com).

**C. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Mr. Phillip Musegaas, Riverkeeper, said that the non-profit organization's mission was to protect and restore the ecological integrity of the Hudson River. He said they supported the idea of dealing with the transportation problem of the existing bridge, but there were concerns about the two bridge proposal. He said the also supported the idea to a process of building something new or rehabilitating the existing bridge, but there were concerns about transparency. He said based on the timing of the meeting, the

lack of good public involvement and the process of holding the August 20<sup>th</sup> meeting was not adequate or proper notice to the public. He said that he did not believe that the financial plan presented was a fiscally-constrained plan. He requested that the members of NYMTC not vote until a detailed financial plan was made public and until the construction bids were made public so that the true cost of building the Tappan Zee Bridge would be known beforehand.

Mr. Ralph Freedman implored to the Council not to vote. He directed his comments towards County Executive Rob Astorino and reminded him that he was elected to assist the needs of his constituents, not those of the Governor. He agreed that something had to be done about the Tappan Zee Bridge. He noted that earlier in the year, County Executive Astorino expressed concerns about the lack of public transportation on the project. Mr. Freedman wanted to know what alleviated County Executive Astorino's concerns. He asked County Executive Astorino to be an advocate for his community and not to sell the community out.

Mr. Orin Getz said that when it was announced that the Tappan Zee Bridge project would move ahead, promises were made that an Environmental Impact Statement and a detailed plan of how the new Tappan Zee Bridge project would be financed would be available to the public. He said although the EIS was done, the detailed plans demonstrating how the new Tappan Zee Bridge would be financed were not provided. He said that the new MAP -21 did not include allocated funding for the bridge and he had concerns. He said that the entire financial responsibility could not be placed on the residents of Rockland County and until a better financial plan was developed, the building of a new Tappan Zee Bridge should not be done.

Ms. Veronica Vanterpool, Tri-State Transportation Campaign, said that she understood that the meeting's goal was to advance the Tappan Zee Bridge Project for consideration into the federal Transportation Infrastructure Finance and Innovation Act (TIFIA) program, which would help alleviate the burden on New York State taxpayers. She said that the project was a fiscally irresponsible project and was concerned that it wasn't a competitive project for the TIFIA application. Ms. Vanterpool said that it was not clear how much it would cost to build a new bridge; it was not clear how the revenues would be used; and there was no clear outlook for the New York State Thruway Authority finances. She implored the Council to demand from the state to answer the questions raised about the Tappan Zee Bridge project's financial and transit components. Ms. Vanterpool said that the transparency and the open process had been "suspect" with most of NYMTC's website being inaccessible to the public. She said that it was unclear to determine what the public participation rules were governing meetings and how much notice was required for public meetings. She noted that the webcast for this meeting was not receiving sound and hoped that NYMTC's technical team was working on the process to have it available to the public as soon as possible.

Mr. Richard Anderson, President of New York Building Congress, said that the Council was making the right decision to take action on the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing project. He said that the summary delivered by Mr. Glaser was terrific and he commended the Governor and his administration. He also said that he was confident that the Council and the public would be pleased with the bids submitted for the project and moving forward, the region will have a terrific new Tappan Zee Bridge.

Mr. Joseph Lhota, Chair & CEO of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority addressed some of the concerns that were brought up during the public participation segment. He reassured that the Tappan Zee Bridge new replacement project was very competitive for the TIAFA funding. He said that \$100 million was prorated by Congress. He noted that a financial plan was not in place because the design and the cost of the bridge was out to bid, which was a very competitive process and once a cost was established, a financial plan would be prepared based on that cost. He said that the New York State Thruway's finances were fine whereas, their credit was rated A1 as per the S&P. As for the business of Rockland County, Mr. Lhota said that full support was received from these businesses, understanding that it is critical for economic stability in both Rockland and Westchester counties.

Deputy County Executive Kevin Plunkett addressed Mr. Freedman's comment. Deputy County Executive Plunkett said that County Executive Astorino, along with County Executive Vanderhoef and

County Executive Odell, had constant communication with Governor Cuomo and his staff with the attempt to collaboratively come up with a framework for mass transit in the Tappan Zee Bridge new replacement project. He said the project was in the beginning stages of not only funding competition, but also for the design and eventual finalization of plans for mass transit. He said there will be dedicated bus lanes and the Governor's Office will be working with constituents to form a taskforce for the project. He said that County Executive Astorino had always called for a new Tappan Zee Bridge and that had not changed. He said that they were glad to be able to work with the Governor and his staff to make today a reality.

Ms. Alicia Nolan, Federal Highway Administration, noted that financial information was required for the planning process of the Tappan Zee Bridge project and NYMTC has met those requirements.

**D. ACTION ITEMS**

**1. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-5 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF AN AMENDMENT TO INCLUDE THE TAPPAN ZEE HUDSON RIVER CROSSING PROJECT IN THE FISCALLY-CONSTRAINED ELEMENT OF THE 2010-2035 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN**

Commissioner Joan McDonald noted that federal planning regulations require that major transportation improvement be included in the fiscally-constrained element of NYMTC's Regional Transportation Plan, which was one prerequisite for federal funding and/or action. She noted that the resolution amended NYMTC's current 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) a federal required document, to include the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing Project in the fiscally-constrained element of the RTP. She said fiscal-constraint was determined by long-range forecasts of the region's transportation needs and anticipated resources.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-5, Council Adoption of an Amendment to Include the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing Project in the Fiscally-Constrained Element of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan was motioned by Deputy County Executive Kevin Plunket, Westchester County, and seconded by Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-6 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF A REGIONALLY-SIGNIFICANT AMENDMENT TO INCLUDE THE TAPPAN ZEE HUDSON RIVER CROSSING PROJECT IN THE 2011-2015 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM**

Commissioner Joan McDonald noted that federal regulations require that major transportation improvements must appear in NYMTC's Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) as a second prerequisite for federal funding and/or action. She said that the resolution amended NYMTC's current 2011-2015 TIP to include the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing project.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-6, Council Adoption of a Regionally-Significant Amendment to Include the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing Project in the 2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program was motioned by County Executive Mangano, Nassau County, and seconded by Mr. Samuel Hornick, representing Ms. Amanda Burden, Director, New York City Department of City Planning. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2012-7 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF A TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY DETERMINATION FOR THE 2011-2015 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AND 2010-2035 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN, AS AMENDED**

Commissioner Joan McDonald noted that the transportation conformity determination contained a regional mobile source emissions analysis that reflected proposed revisions to NYMTC's long

range plan into its Transportation Improvement Program which was required under the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990. She said that the resolution adopts the next transportation conformity determination for NYMTC that included a new regional emissions analysis which reflected changes to non-exempt projects in the current Regional Transportation Plan and TIP. She said that the Tappan Zee Hudson River Crossing project would be included and the results of the regional emissions analysis were available in the document.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2012-7, Council Adoption of a Transportation Conformity Determination for the 2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program for the 2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program and 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan, As Amended was motioned by Mr. Thomas B. Vanderbeek, representing County Executive Vanderhoef, Rockland County, and seconded by Joseph Lhota, Chair & Chief Executive Officer, Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

**E. ADJOURN**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned by the members of NYMTC.

**ATTENDANCE**

**Voting Council Principals/Representatives**

Thomas Vanderbeek for C. Scott Vanderhoef, County Executive, Rockland County  
Gilbert Anderson for Steven Bellone, County Executive, Suffolk County  
Edward Mangano, County Executive, Nassau County  
Sandy Hornick for Amanda Burden, Director, New York City Department of City Planning  
Janette Sadik-Khan, Commissioner, New York City Department of Transportation  
Joseph Lhota, Executive Director and C.E.O., Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
Kevin Plunket, DCE for Robert Astorino, County Executive, Westchester County  
Fred Pena for MaryEllen Odell, County Executive, Putnam County  
Robert Epstein for Robert Zerrillo, New York State Department of Transportation & NYMTC Secretary

**Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives**

Alicia Nolan for Jonathan McDade, Division Administrator, Federal Highway Administration  
Ted Ritter for Mary K. Murphy, Executive Director, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority  
Michael Moltzen for Judith Enck, Regional Administrator, US Environmental Protection Agency

**NYMTC**

Ali Afshar	Lisa Daglian	Kyeongsu Kim
Imran Ahmed	Nina DelSenno	John Lopez
Afolabi Aiyendun	Daniel Etkin	Larry McAuliffe
Olanyinka Alamu	Joel Ettinger	Andrea Miles-Cole
Wieslaw Amber	Leslie Fordjour	Larisa Morozovskaya
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Emma Gaitan	Chris Rodrigues-Moore
Gerry Bogacz	Anthony Gawrych	Abdus Salam
Ken Chin	Jan Khan	Max Sokol

**OTHERS**

Onyinye Akujua, NYCDOT	Juliet Papa, 1010 WINS
Richard T. Anderson, NY Building Congress	John Pilner, Putnam County
Fred Bell, WABC TV	Ted Mann
Katherine Creag, WNBC	Phillip Musegaas, Reporter
Katie Fisher, WFUU 90.7	Ted Nadratoof, NYSTA
Robert Friedman	Josh Niemi, WNBC
Orrin Getz, NJ ARP	Elizabeth Novak, NYSTA
Rody Glaesseman, Newsday	Karin Sommer, NYCDOT
Tai Hernandez, Fox 5	Robert Stromstead, Parsons Brinckerhoff
Naomi Klein, WCDPW&T	Leo Tsang, Parsons Brinckerhoff
Mark Lofflew, NY 1	Veronica Vanterpool, Tri-State Transp Campaign
Lisa LaRocca, News 12 Westchester	Josh Verleun, Riverkeeper
Olga Olavyannikov, NYCDOP	William Wheeler, MTA
Kevin Ortiz, MTA	

*This August 20, 2012 Meeting Synopsis was unanimously accepted by the voting members of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council at its September 27, 2012 meeting.*

*Respectfully Submitted,*

*Andrea' Miles-Cole  
Secretary II- NYMTC*