

**SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 16, 2006 MEETING OF THE  
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

**A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:45 a.m. by Mr. Timothy Gilchrist, Secretary to the Council. Mr. Gilchrist introduced himself, welcomed everyone to the meeting and thanked everyone for attending. He asked the Council members and/or their representatives to introduce themselves. It was established that there was a quorum.

**B. OPENING SESSION**

Mr. Thomas Madison, Jr., Commissioner of the New York State Department of Transportation and permanent Co-Chair to the Council welcomed everyone to the meeting. Commissioner Madison talked about the actions that would take place during the meeting in order to keep Federal funding flowing into the region while advancing a major bi-state improvement to the transportation system with the Council's New Jersey partners. Commissioner Madison said that there would be a vote to adopt a \$48 million annual planning program, a vote to adopt an analysis which demonstrated that NYMTC's plan and program continue to conform to emissions milestones and tests under the Clean Air Act, and a vote amending the fiscally-constrained element of the Regional Transportation Plan to include the Trans-Hudson Express Tunnel from the Access to the Region's Core study. Commissioner Madison said that the Council would be recognizing the tenure of Nassau County Executive Tom Suozzi as NYMTC's Co-Chair and at the same time installing Commissioner Weinshall as NYMTC's new Co-Chair. He spoke about the Council's progress that was made as a group last year and said that there was an unprecedented level of discussion with the Principals which was very productive in terms of outlining the Council's goals for the future. Commissioner Madison commended Co-Chair Tom Suozzi for his leadership and enthusiasm. Commissioner Madison said that the New York State Transportation Master Plan and its impact on NYMTC's regional planning process would also be discussed. He said that the vision document would be available on the [www.dot.state.ny.us](http://www.dot.state.ny.us) website. Commissioner Madison thanked the Principals for the constructive dialogue and he thanked Joel Ettinger and the NYMTC staff for their support in putting the details together.

Mr. Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive and Co-Chair to the Council said that he had a great experience as Co-Chair for the past year and he learned a lot. County Executive Suozzi thanked the Principals for their participation in trying to develop a long term vision for the region. He said that NYMTC was a powerful group of people that had decision makers who when pulling together in the same direction could accomplish a lot more than had been accomplished in the region in the past years. He said working together as a group was key. He thanked the NYMTC staff for their research and their work to help educate the Principals about what was going on. County Executive Suozzi talked about the growth that would take place in the region and said it was important that the region try to establish a vision for the long term that would target growth. He said the key to doing that would be to tie growth, economic development, transportation and quality of life all together. County Executive Suozzi said it was key for the Council to work together on a specific vision for the region so that agencies that represented the Council could be more effective supporting each other on its projects than working separately. He said it would be recognized that improving the quality of life, economy and environment

for all our residents was something that was shared in common. County Executive Suozzi said he was grateful for the opportunity and was positive that Commissioner Weinshall would continue to move the project forward.

Commissioner Madison thanked Council Executive Suozzi for his energy and for being an enthusiastic leader. He said that a formal thank you from the Council was prepared and then Commissioner Madison read Resolution #2006-4, Recognition of Service by Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive. He presented County Executive Suozzi with a plaque.

Commissioner Madison said that the order of the agenda would be changed to accommodate scheduling conflicts. He then announced that the Council would then confirm Commissioner Weinshall as the new Co-Chairperson of the Council. He explained the Memo of Understanding for the Council in which the co-chairperson was rotated annually among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees--The Mid-Hudson South, Nassau/Suffolk, and New York City. Commissioner Madison said that this year the Co-Chairperson was to be selected from the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. Commissioner Madison provided a brief biography on Commissioner Weinshall and said that Commissioner Weinshall was approved by a unanimous vote as the rotating Co-Chair for April 2006 to March 2007.

Commissioner Iris Weinshall thanked Tom Madison, Joel Ettinger and the entire NYMTC staff. She said that they did an excellent job. She talked about her previous experience as NYMTC's Co-Chair and said that NYMTC had come a long way in recovering from September 11, 2001. She thanked County Executive Suozzi and said she had big shoes to follow in and commended County Executive Suozzi on his leadership. Commissioner Weinshall considered that what County Executive Suozzi began at NYMTC to be a model for future co-chairpersons of NYMTC. She said she looked forward to being the Co-Chairperson to the Council and to the new endeavors of NYMTC.

Commissioner Madison said he looked forward to working with Commissioner Weinshall. He then asked Joel Ettinger, NYMTC Executive Director, to give his report.

Mr. Joel Ettinger said that the annual meeting provided an opportunity to reflect on the past year--to note successes--to evaluate challenges,--to regroup for the future. He said that it was NYMTC's 24<sup>th</sup> Annual Council meeting and it was a new NYMTC. Mr. Ettinger said that the Council adopted a new Regional Transportation Plan, which provided the vision of the region's transportation system through the year 2030; the Council adopted a new Transportation Improvement Program, which detailed where transportation resources of the next four years would be; and the Council would adopt a new Unified Planning Work Program, which detailed planning activities for the upcoming year. Mr. Ettinger reminded the audience that NYMTC demonstrated that the region was in conformity with Federal air quality standards at its August, 2005 meeting. He said that NYMTC made changes to eliminate yearly budget carryovers, to invest in studies that advanced the region's goals and streamlined the format of the UPWP to make the transportation planning process more transparent and more accessible. Mr. Ettinger said that attempts were made to heighten NYMTC's profile in the region by including transportation practitioners in discussions at NYMTC's Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) meetings to discuss provocative topics, by working with neighboring Metropolitan Planning Organizations on important transportation and air quality issues, and working with national organization such as the National Association of Regional Councils, the American Public Transportation Association, the Association of Metropolitan Planning Organizations, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials. He talked about the federal mandate of public involvement in the

transportation process and its importance to NYMTC. He talked about publication of NYMTC Notes, a bi-monthly newsletter, and production of a guidebook for public involvement providing a breakdown of how transportation projects were developed and funded. He talked about other accomplishments such as the creation of a Regional Planning Forum, accomplishments related to activities on freight and sustainable planning, the convening of a Clean Technologies Group, and the Best Practices Model, which serves as a cutting edge tool for NYMTC's air quality analysis. He pointed out many of NYMTC accomplishments that could be found in its Annual Report. Mr. Ettinger said that NYMTC was back, fully functioning and newly energized in its role as the region's Metropolitan Planning Organization. He thanked Commissioner Madison, County Executive Suozzi for their leadership; Timothy Gilchrist for his guidance; Robert Dennison III for his support, the Directors of NYMTC and the NYMTC staff.

Commissioner Madison informed the audience that the agenda would continue directly to the Principals Discussion.

## **PRINCIPALS DISCUSSION**

Commissioner Madison said that the NYMTC Principals had discussed the future of the region's transportation system. They talked about the resources, projects, policies and procedures. He said that the Principals of NYMTC were united on establishing a common plan that could be used to identify necessary transportation investments for the region's future for the next twenty-five years. He talked about the five shared values of the Principals which were--improving the regional economy, enhancing the regional environment, improving the regional quality of life, providing convenient, flexible transportation access within the region, and building the case for obtaining the resources to implement regional investment. He said that the region must speak with one voice in describing its needs and its priority solutions in order to obtain the necessary resources to improve the transportation system. Commissioner Madison said that there were discussions about emerging growth areas in the NYMTC region and the Principals began to identify the desired regional growth areas. They discussed how to better integrate land-use planning, economic and development and quality of life with future transportation investments. Commissioner Madison said that discussions would continue to be able to identify key transportation improvements and potential funding sources that would support the emerging growth areas.

County Executive Suozzi talked about the significance of the Principals discussions to identify what was needed to try to get money necessary to do the job. He said that there were many requests and ideas that existed for transportation improvements in the region and that the group needed to analyze projects to see how they fit in their long term goals. County Executive Suozzi said that establishing the five goals was a big step for the Principals and said that the five goals were the basis of what should be referenced when considering transportation projects. He said that he was excited of the progress made the engagement of the Principals, which was possible because everyone participated.

County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef said it took many years, through many Principals, under different leadership to get to a shared vision. He talked about the importance of finding a way to maximize the quality of living for the region. He talked about the lack of available funding for the region. County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef said that it was recognized that speaking with one voice maximized interest to the region and all would benefit.

Commissioner Madison said that goals were discussed, growth areas would be reviewed, and the NYMTC staff was charged with fleshing out more details about the region's growth areas and projects

within each group area. He said one important thing that needed to be emphasized was funding and financing. Commissioner Madison said from a state-wide perspective, projects were being looked at over the next 10 years. He then talked about the state's capital construction program. He said the New York State Department of Transportation would be engaged in a \$17.9 billion capital construction program along with both the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's and the Thruway Authority's capital plan. This totaled \$38 billion in capital investments and transportation infrastructure over the next 10 years. Commissioner Madison said that the state should have business relationships with the private sector to secure private equity capital that could help the state construct some projects or operate existing infrastructure assets that were state owned or maintained. He said that traditional government sources of financing were dwindling and the needs of the state were increasing. Commissioner Madison said that financing will be an important part of discussion as time continued.

### **C. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Ms. Maureen Morgan, representing Federated Conservationists of Westchester County, described the transportation disconnect between Westchester County and the Bronx, and urged the Council to consider alternatives for east-west transit between the two counties. Ms. Morgan argued that bus rapid transit is not an acceptable option, and requested a study for a regional rail line, noting "in the age of globalization, we can't get across the Hudson River."

Mr. Jeffery Zupan, representing the Regional Plan Association, expressed his support for the Trans Hudson Express Tunnel concept as an important element in improving regional transportation but asked the Council to re-examine its proposed terminus, stating that only an Eastside terminal, connected to Grand Central, would truly provide the regional access to its urban core.

Mr. Roger Herz, representing To Improve Municipal Efficiency (TIME), said that he was a former New York City Department of City Planning official. Mr. Herz criticized the proposed deep cavern terminal for the Trans Hudson Express Tunnel. He said the current design is too expensive, too risky in light of current security concerns and unnecessarily added 15 minutes per day to a daily commute. He proposed an alternative that would connect to Grand Central as both more cost efficient and a much needed method of improving East Side Access. Mr. Herz challenged the Council to re-examine their commitment to the deep cavern design.

Mr. George Haikalis, representing the Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc., asked the Council to allot more resources to the NYMTC staff. He commended out-going Co-Chair Thomas Suozzi on his leadership of the Council during the past year. Mr. Haikalis then talked about the East Side Access Project. He said that it was severely flawed, noting both the extraordinary expense of \$6.3 billion, and the security concerns inherent in a deep cavern terminus. Mr. Haikalis proposed a upper lever loop alternative as less expensive, less potentially risky and more user friendly.

Mr. Murray Boden, representing Concerned Grandparents, asked the Council what be left for our grandchildren when we're gone. Mr. Boden questioned whether the deep cavern terminal planned for beneath Macy's at 34<sup>th</sup> Street in Manhattan made sense in light of the region's and nation's energy crises. He urged the Council to come up with a "more robust" bus rapid transit system and suggested dedicating the shoulder of highways as a rapid transit lane.

County Executive Suozzi requested the NYMTC staff to provide him with a written rebuttal to the statements regarding the deep cavern terminal made by Mr. George Haikalis and Mr. Roger Herz.

**D. ACTION ITEMS**

**1. ACCEPT: AUGUST 4, 2005 MEETING SYNOPSIS**

Commissioner Madison asked for a motion to accept the August 4, 2005 Council Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing Suffolk County Executive Steve Levy, and seconded by Ms. Gwen Perlman, representing Commissioner Iris Weinshall of the New York City Department of Transportation. The synopsis was accepted.

**2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2006-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2006-2007 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM**

Commissioner Madison said that the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) sets the Council's priorities and work schedule for the fiscal year. He said that the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) endorsed the UPWP at its February 16, 2006 meeting. Commissioner Madison then introduced Mr. Alan Borenstein and Mr. Gerry Bogacz to talk about the UPWP and introduced the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Alan Borenstein referenced the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) documents and said that they were available on the NYMTC website at [www.nymtc.org](http://www.nymtc.org). He said the document could also be mailed out upon request. Mr. Borenstein explained that the UPWP provided funding from the Federal Highway Administration, the Federal Transit Administration and the New York State Department of Transportation for transportation planning. The UPWP provided funds to the NYMTC Central Staff and members agencies. The overall budget for the next fiscal year would be \$48 million.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz explained that the Unified Planning Work Program was built from the member's regional priorities along with the shared goals. He said the Federal agencies required NYMTC to perform a congestion management analysis of the Regional Transportation Plan and air quality conformity analysis.

Commissioner Madison asked if there were any questions or comments. There were none.

Commissioner Madison asked for a motion to adopt the 2006-2007 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing Ms. Amanda Burden, Director of the New York City Department of City Planning and seconded by Mr. Chris Boylan representing the Metropolitan Transportation Authority. There was no discussion. The resolution unanimously passed.

**3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2006-2 – COUNCIL AMENDMENT OF THE 2005-2030 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN TO INCLUDE THE NEW JERSEY TRANSIT'S LOCALLY PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FROM THE ACCESS TO THE REGION'S CORE STUDY**

Mr. George Warrington, Executive Director of New Jersey Transit introduced the resolution to amend the 2005-2030 Regional Transportation Plan to include the New Jersey Transit's locally preferred alternative from the Access to the Region's Core Study. Mr. Warrington stated that the project would promote economic growth, would have realistic capabilities, and would meet the Federal requirements which

would allow progression of the project and continue to work on the draft environmental impact statement. Mr. Warrington thanked NJTPA, the Council Principals, the NYMTC staff, their partners, staff and the support received from both sides of the Hudson.

Commissioner Madison asked if there were any questions or comments. There were none.

Commissioner Madison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #2006-2, Council Amendment of the 2005-2030 Regional Transportation Plan to Include the New Jersey Transit's Locally Preferred Alternative from the Access to the Region's Core Study. A motion was made by Lawrence Salley, representing Andrew J. Spano, Westchester County Executive and seconded by C. Scott Vanderheof, Rockland County Executive. There was no discussion. The resolution unanimously passed.

**4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2006-3 COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY DETERMINATION FOR THE 2006-2010 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AND 2005-2030 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN, AS AMENDED**

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said that the resolution would adopt a transportation conformity determination which is a required analysis of the Federal Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990. The resolution includes an interim emissions test under new regulations governing fine particulate matter (PM 2.5), which was part of a multi-state effort. Mr. Bogacz said it was demonstrated that the analysis did not exceed the milestone budgets established in the New York State Implementation Plan for Air Quality.

Commissioner Madison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #2006-3, Council Adoption of the Transportation Conformity Determination for the 2006-2010 Transportation Improvement Program and 2005-2030 Regional Transportation Plan, as Amended. A motion was made by Robert Shinnick, representing Steve Levy, Suffolk County Executive and seconded by Jack Schmidt, representing Amanda Burden, Director of New York City Department of City Planning. There was no discussion. The resolution unanimously passed.

**5 ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2006-4 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE BY THOMAS SUOZZI, NASSAU COUNTY EXECUTIVE AND OUT-GOING CO-CHAIRPERSON**

Commissioner Madison asked for a motion to adopt Resolution #2006-4, Recognition of Service by Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive. A motion was made by Robert Shinnick, representing Suffolk County Executive Steve Levy and seconded by Jack Schmidt, representing Ms. Amanda Burden, Director of New York City Department of City Planning. The resolution unanimously passed.

**6. CONFIRM: NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIR**

Mrs. Iris Weinshall, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Transportation was confirmed as new Co-Chair to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council.

**E. ADJOURN**

Commissioner Madison adjourned the meeting.

**ATTENDANCE**

**Voting Council Principals/Representatives**

Thomas Madison, NYS Department of Transportation  
Iris Weinsall, NYC Department of Transportation  
Chris Boylan, Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
John Pilner for County Executive Robert Bondi, Putnam County  
Lawrence Salley for County Executive Andrew J. Spano, Westchester County Executive  
Jack Schmidt for Ms. Amanda Burden, Director, NYC Department of City Planning  
Robert Shinnick for County Executive Steve Levy, Suffolk County  
Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive  
C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County

Timothy Gilchrist, NYSDOT, Council Secretary

**Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives**

Robert Arnold, Federal Highway Administration  
William Baker for Mr. Alan Steinberg, US Environmental Protection Agency  
Carl Johnson for Ms. Denise Sheehan, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation  
George Warrington, New Jersey Transit  
Letitia Thompson, Federal Transit Administration  
Lou Venech for Mr. Kenneth Ringler, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

**NYMTC Staff**

Aizaz Ahmend	Anthony Gawrych	Deinbo MacHarry
Alan Borenstein	Leokadia Glogowski	Larry McAuliffe
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Kristen Hall	Ali Mohseni
Juliette Bergman	Colleen Hagan	Nancy O’Connell
Gerry Bogacz	Steve Hausch	Jennifer Rasic
Joel Ettinger	Barbara Lynch	Chris Rodrigues
Emma Gaitan	Uchenna Madu	Jean Shanahan
Maria Garcia	Larry McAuliffe	Judith Wilson
		David Zhang

**OTHERS**

Patrick Arden, Metro	Jay DiDomenico, Hudson TMA
Richard T. Anderson, NY Bldg. Congress	John Duesing, Cambridge Systematics
Richard Backlund, FWHA	Beverly Dolinsky, PCAC
Jennifer Badali, MTA	S. Ends, NY1
David Behrend, NJTPA	William Fahey, Liberty Lines
Lawrence Berger, Nassau Co.	Colin Foley, AKRF
Seth Berman, NYCDOT	Patrick Gerdin, Rockland Co.
Patricia Bourne, Nassau Co. Commission	Tatyana Golikova, NYSDOT
Robert Brickman, Nassau Co.	Robert Griffith, FHWA
Sam Bruchoy, Newsday	George Haikalis, IRUM
Patrica Chemka, Westchester Co.	Roger Herz, TIME
Tom Cowa, NYCDOT	Sandy Hornick, NYCDCP
Robert A. Dennison, III, NYSDOT	Carl Johnson, NYSDEC

**ATTENDANCE CONTINUED**

Michael Jones, Parson Brinckerhoff  
Irwin Kessman, FTA  
Peter G. King, NYSDOT  
Frank Lipinski, American Concrete Pavement  
Barbara LoMauilo, Suffolk Co. Legislature  
Janet Mainer, Metro North Railroad  
E. Junior Maldonado, Hudson TMA  
Larry Malsam, NYSDOT  
Randall Mardis, Zetlin Communications  
Christopher McBride, AAA  
Kyle McGraw, LIRR  
Patrick McGeeham, NY Times  
Michael Moltzen, USEPA  
Maureen Morgan, FCWC  
Lance Newmann, Cambridge Systematics  
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents  
Charles O'Shea, NYSDOT  
Gwen Perlman, NYCDOT  
Meg Reed Mian  
Sarah Rios, MTA

Tom Schulze, NJT  
Steve Seidl, Petron & Jones  
Michael Sheehan, NYSDEC  
Jennifer Strasser, Cambridge Systematics  
Marty Taub, Eng-Wong, Taub & Assocs.  
Steve Weber, NYCDOT  
Joshua Winter, NYCDOT  
David Woloch, NYCDOT  
Artis Q. Wright, Columbia University  
Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland Co.  
Melanie Zeman, USEPA  
Jeff Zupan, RPA

The March 16, 2006 meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted by the Council at its March 15, 2007 meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

***Andrea' Miles-Cole***