

**SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 15, 2005 MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:15 p.m. by Mr. Joseph Boardman, the Council's permanent Co-Chair and New York State Department of Transportation's Commissioner. Mr. Boardman welcomed everyone to the meeting and thanked everyone for attending. He asked the Council members and/or their representatives to introduce themselves. It was established that there was a quorum.

B. OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Joseph Boardman spoke about the progress NYMTC made in the past year in the metropolitan area and said in terms of air conformity, NYMTC made great progress. He said one report was submitted to Congress in January. Debates at the federal level had occurred and soon would be occurring at the state level on how transportation improvement for the future would be financed. Mr. Boardman said that there had been a second extension of the TEA-21 legislation, which was supposed to have been re-authorized October, 2003, and hoped that the bill would be re-authorized soon. Mr. Boardman said that the New York State Department of Transportation had been thinking differently on how it performed its job for the future and believed that it needed to be held accountable by residents or users of the transportation system or by the legislature at the federal and/or state level for five priority result areas, which were safety of the system, security of the system, sustainability of the environmental improvement that was made, the economic sustainability or improvement that could be made in the economy and the mobility and reliability of the transportation system. He said the "just-in-time" delivery of a good or a person became critically more important and said that a greater need for reliability of the transportation system was necessary for all modes. Mr. Boardman said that since September 11, 2001 in New York City, a heavier emphasis had been on security. He said that Congress was looking at how they might be able to improve the security and safety of additional transportation facilities because of its importance to maintain for that security and that safety. Mr. Boardman said that the transportation industry could make improvement in water quality because of the run off from the roadway and could make improvement in the quality of life in a community based on "Context-Sensitive Solutions". He said that the transportation industry could also make improvements in the economic environment by making sure there was a reliable connection across the region and across the country. He said the level and how projects were chosen for the future needed to be based on the five priority result areas.

Ms. Amanda Burden spoke about the government structure and density, the challenges, and opportunities for the region. Ms. Burden said with a combination of density and transit infrastructure available to us, we had levels of transit ridership that were unrivaled by any other North American city. Our transit network allowed us to minimize energy consumption and to continue to accommodate economic growth while at the same time, reduce production of greenhouse gases and other environmental pollutants. Ms. Burden said that NYMTC was essential to achieving these goals and NYMTC performed many vital functions for the region, and said that its' efforts were often invaluable to the work of each of the Council's agencies. She then spoke about NYC Department of City Planning's

plan for the redevelopment of the Westside of Manhattan, where the tradition of coordinating land use and development with investment in transportation and other infrastructure was built on. She said NYMTC's forecast of population and employment had formed a basis for much of the analysis of the future transportation demands of the development area. Ms. Burden spoke about the planning of the revitalization of lower Manhattan and the continued growth in downtown Brooklyn and said that NYMTC must continue to be the forum to ensure that land use and infrastructure planning go hand-in-hand so that progress toward improving mobility and air quality continued. Ms. Burden said that she looked forward on continuing to work with NYMTC and the other member agencies on shaping the transportation network to accommodate the growth and development that would keep the region vibrant for years to come. She welcomed NYMTC back to lower Manhattan, to help continue its revitalization, and wished NYMTC many productive years in their new Water Street office.

C. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Robert Dennison, the Council's Secretary, delivered the Executive Director's report. Mr. Dennison welcomed Council members, agency staffs and members of the public. He mentioned the passing of Debra Murray, a secretary of NYMTC, who died in service on March 3, 2004 after being ill for ten months with the Lou Gehrig disease and asked for a moment of silence in her memory. Mr. Dennison said that on January 1, 2004, Tom Schulze, the former Executive Director of NYMTC, resigned from NYMTC to accept a position with New Jersey Transit. He thanked Alan Borenstein, Gerry Bogacz and Kuo-Ann Chiao, the three Group Directors of NYMTC for stepping up and managing NYMTC as a team. He said that someone would be selected as the Acting Executive Director and the process of filling the job on a permanent basis would begin. Mr. Dennison reported that, after 2 ½ years, NYMTC received a signed a lease for office space located at 199 Water Street in lower Manhattan. Mr. Dennison then spoke about the NYMTC products underway or completed and mentioned that the Regional Transportation Plan discussion document was available and that public meetings were being held to gather input. He said that the Best Practices Model (BPM) was up and running and was being used on ten ongoing major investment studies in the NYMTC region. He said that the BPM was becoming a more useful and vital tool and the run time had been cut in half. Mr. Dennison referenced the NYMTC website, www.nymtc.org and said that there were many studies that were completed and data available to download or view.

D. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: MARCH 18, 2004 MEETING SYNOPSIS

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to accept the March 18, 2004 Council Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by Westchester County Executive Spano and seconded by Nassau County Executive Suozzi. The synopsis was accepted.

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2004-2005 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM

Mr. Boardman said that the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) sets the Council's priorities and work schedule for the fiscal year. He said that the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) endorsed the UPWP at its February 19, 2004 meeting. Mr. Boardman then introduced Mr. Alan Borenstein and Mr. Gerry Bogacz to talk about the UPWP and introduced the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Alan Borenstein, with the help of slides, provided the details about the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP). He said that the UPWP was the key element of the metropolitan planning process; a strategic program; a budget; a grant application and a required product of the planning process. He said that software had been developed so that the members were able to enter their UPWP information via access to the website. He said the UPWP provided a strategic framework for the regional metropolitan transportation process and NYMTC as a planning organization. It also provided a financial framework which supported NYMTC operations, funded important consultant work and supported the members planning programs. Mr. Borenstein said the total UPWP program was approximately 36 million dollars which included new funds and carryover funds. He said the document was available at the sign in table as well as on the NYMTC website, www.nymtc.org.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, with the help of slides, said that the work program was built from two key elements that provided a foundation—(1) NYMTC’s mission statement and (2) the regional goals that were defined in the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The work program was built from concepts that were defined in the RTP for further study, as well as from a prospectus assembled through listening sessions, and from staff and member agencies priorities and needs. Mr. Bogacz said that the required planning products, by law, in the work program included a Regional Transportation Plan, a Transportation Improvement Program, and a Unified Planning Work Program, as a body, so that the NYMTC region could remain eligible for federal funding for transportation improvements. NYMTC was also required to perform a congestion management analysis of the RTP and air quality conformity analysis. Mr. Bogacz said the planning process operational components in the work program included the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC), the three Transportation Coordinating Committees, and nine advisory groups that advised the members of NYMTC on various topics. There were various ad-hoc planning groups and study committees that operated, workshops were provided, focus groups met, planning forums were held, public information meetings were conducted, and a newsletter and website were maintained. Mr. Bogacz said that Best Practices Model, integrated data collection, and the socio-economic forecasts were a few of the technical components of the work program and the foundation of the planning process. He said the major investment studies were essential in defining the future in the region, the sustainable development studies were a new approach to bringing land use and transportation planning closer together, and sub-area and corridor studies looked at different components of the transportation system. Mr. Bogacz highlighted some of the new, first time, projects in the work program such as the Assessment of Freight Villages, the Henry Hudson Parkway Corridor Management Plan, and the River Towns Traffic Calming Study in Westchester, Nassau County’s Traffic Signal Progression Study and the Staten Island Ferry Planning, and the model and feasibility studies. Mr. Bogacz talked about NYMTC’s new funding program, the September 11th Memorial Program, which was a planning and academic program to memorialize the three NYMTC staff members who perished on September 11, 2001, Ignatius Adanga, Charles Lesperance and See Wong Shum. He said that the program would include solicitation of proposals for planning activities and would provide academic assistance for students completing their education in specific career fields. Mr. Bogacz concluded by thanking the members for their support and consideration of this memorial program.

Mr. Boardman asked if there were any questions or comments for Mr. Bogacz. There were none.

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to adopt the 2004-2005 Unified Planning Work Program. A motion was made by Amanda Burden representing New York City Department of City Planning and seconded by Robert Shinnick representing Suffolk County Executive Steve Levy. There was no discussion. The resolution unanimously passed.

Honorable Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive, said that he was very pleased that the plan incorporated \$130,000 for Westchester County to do a critical infrastructure survey because the County was doing an all hazard plan for emergencies. Mr. Spano said that all projects discussed and incorporated the awareness for emergencies that could occur. Mr. Spano then asked his surrounding county colleagues to join in on the study.

Honorable C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County Executive, said that he was pleased that emergency awareness was raised a number of times by Mr. Spano and not only would he be pleased to join, but also intended solicit for some additional dollars to do a study of their own for emergency planning mobility, in particular, the surrounding Indian Point area.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-2 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO TOM SCHULZE

Mr. Boardman said that Tom Schulze was NYMTC's Executive Director from 1999 to 2003 and had represented the Council and PFAC. He said that Tom had accepted a position with New Jersey Transit to manage the Access to the Region's Core Project and he was being recognized for his service to the Council and PFAC.

Mr. Boardman asked for a motion to adopt the Recognition of Service to Tom Schulze Resolution. A motion was made by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, representing Rockland County, and seconded by Chris Boylan representing Katherine Lapp of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority. There was no discussion. The resolution passed unanimously.

Mr. Boardman presented Tom Schulze with a plaque and read the resolution printed on it. Mr. Boardman said that Mr. Schulze held things together at a time when it was very difficult for all, and with staff losing staff. He thanked Mr. Schulze wholeheartedly for all the things he did, not just for the requirement of the job, but for the compassion and love he showed to his fellow man and patience he had as NYMTC tried to rebuild.

Mr. Schulze said that it was wonderful to be back for the Annual Council Meeting and more wonderful to come back as a member. He said he was happy to hear that the lease had moved forward. He said he appreciated all the warm wishes he received from the people and from the Council through the resolution and plaque. Mr. Schulze said that he could not accept it without acknowledging the hard work and many accomplishments all of the NYMTC staff and members achieved during the six years he was with NYMTC. Mr. Schulze said that despite the many small and large challenges NYMTC had to overcome, he was very proud. He said he was very proud of the NYMTC staff. Mr. Schulze closed by thanking everyone for their support, their confidence and their good will given to him while he worked at NYMTC and said that the plaque presented to him and continued friendships would be important to him forever.

4a. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2004-3 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE TO AMANDA BURDEN

A motion was made to adopt Resolution 2004-3 – Recognition of Service to Amanda Burden, Director of New York City Department of City Planning and also Co-Chairperson of NYMTC by Mr. Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive, and seconded by Mr. C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County Executive. The Resolution unanimously passed.

Mr. Boardman presented Ms. Amanda Burden with a plaque for recognition of one year service as the Council's Co-Chairperson and thanked Ms. Burden for her service.

Ms. Amanda Burden said that NYMTC played a key role in making this region regional issues work. Ms. Burden said she had been proud and privileged to service as Co-Chairperson and thanked Mr. Boardman and the Council.

4b. CONFIRM: NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIRPERSON – ANDREW SPANO, WESTCHESTER COUNTY EXECUTIVE

Mr. Boardman said that a new incoming co-chairperson for NYMTC will be confirmed. He explained the Memo of Understanding for the Council in which the co-chairperson was rotated annually among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees--The Mid-Hudson South, Nassau/Suffolk, and New York City. Mr. Boardman said that this year the Co-Chairperson would be the Honorable Andrew Spano, County Executive of Westchester County. Mr. Spano was approved by a unanimous vote as the rotating Co-Chair for April 2004 to March 2005.

Mr. Boardman said that County Executive Andrew J. Spano became Westchester's seventh County Executive on January 1, 1998 and was re-elected to office in November 2001 with 73 percent of the vote—the highest margin of victory in the county's history. Mr. Boardman provided a brief biography on the Honorable Spano and said that he was happy to have Mr. Spano as Co-Chair of NYMTC.

Mr. Spano said that he was looking forward to being the Co-Chair and said that looking at things regionally was so significant. He said that so much of what happened in New York City affected the quality of lives of those in Westchester or Rockland County and it affected how emergencies were conducted. He said that 55,000 people came to work in Westchester County and many had come from Queens, Brooklyn, Manhattan and the Bronx and because of this things like the Second Avenue Subway and where it linked at its northern end was important to the counties. Mr. Spano said he looked forward to his tenure in working with everyone. He said that it was very important to listen and get involved and said that was what he had planned to do.

E. ROUNDTABLE – TRANSPORTATION VISIONS AND PROJECTS

Mr. Boardman said that there were seven speakers who would talk about their transportation vision and projects. He then introduced Mr. Thomas Suozzi, County Executive for Nassau County to speak.

Nassau County Hub Major Investment Study – Nassau County Executive Thomas Suozzi

County Executive Thomas Suozzi thanked the Council for the opportunity to speak and apologized in advance that he had to leave after he gave his presentation. Mr. Suozzi provided some history of Nassau County, saying that it's the nation's first modern suburb and that Levittown was the first suburban community in the history of the United States of America. Mr. Suozzi talked about Nassau County's financial problems and how the county's bond ratings were one step above junk bond status. He said that Nassau County had a \$428M deficit which led him to make many changes within his workforce and operations. He said that Nassau County received six bond upgrades and were recovering financially. Mr. Suozzi talked about how the problems discovered within the county were not related just to the fiscal mismanagement that took place, but talked about how Nassau County stopped growing. He said that the population grew tremendously from the 1950's to the 1970's and was the fastest growing county

in the USA with a population of 1.5 million, but today, the population had decreased by two million. There was no growth in offices, stores and homes because there was very little land left in the county and the commercial strips were over-developed with too much traffic. Mr. Suozzi talked about how the county had pockets of poverty, two failing school districts, segregated neighborhoods, no affordable housing for the young and elderly, and high property taxes. He also talked about the positive aspects of Nassau County such as low crime, low unemployment and raising property values. Mr. Suozzi then talked about how the county did not have any growth in their revenues, but dramatic growth in their expenses, escalating taxes and insurance costs. Mr. Suozzi said that Nassau County needed to grow and therefore needed to change the county's suburban lifestyle by marrying together the elements of the suburban dream with targeted growth and targeted locations and targeted industries that would supply money for the county to support the government and improve the county's quality of life. He called it "New Suburbia". He said New Suburbia was a ten point plan that would target high skilled, high-tech industries and sports, entertainment and tourism in four locations—traditional downtowns, brown fields, minority neighborhoods that were under-invested and the Nassau County Hub, which was the center of Nassau County and the most important economic engine of the county. Mr. Suozzi said the Nassau Hub had to connect to Northern Nassau County, Southern Nassau County, New York City and Suffolk County. He said the Nassau Hub should be the downtown of Long Island. He talked about the transportation needs to get into the Nassau Hub by mass transit. He said that twenty-nine alternatives were identified as to what was needed for the Nassau Hub and was in the process of limiting those alternatives down. He talked about utilizing the Garden City secondary line to connect to the Nassau Hub and to Mineola, Hempstead and West Hempstead. Mr. Suozzi said that the support from the entire region was needed. He said that making this investment would not only improve the quality of life and improve travel time, but would also an investment that would pay off in the future. The jobs and housing that would be created from this investment would bring in new revenue not only to Nassau County, but to the State of New York and to the federal government as well, which would make us economically more powerful. Mr. Suozzi talked about how New York, New Jersey and Connecticut subsidized the growth of other parts of the country and while they obtain new roads, bridges, mass transportation lines, new schools, newer services, New York, New Jersey and Connecticut received dollars enough to just fix up the old stuff and get by on a day to day basis. He said that we were being short changed by the federal government and we needed to be unified as a region to try to get dollars to help us to do the important work we do. He said that there needed to be a coordinated effort with New York and other states to recognize that the rules set up 30 or 40 years ago needed to be changed.

Rockland County Transportation Challenges – Rockland County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef

County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef said that Rockland County had been and would continue to be very supportive of NYMTC. Mr. Vanderhoef said that over the course of history, Rockland County had been essentially a county whose past was dictated by transportation initiatives. He said that the first ever railroad for passenger went to Piermont Pier, which was called Tappan Pier in the 1850's. He said the roads that were built in Rockland County prior to the Tappan Zee Bridge were roads that served much of the brick and straw industries, rock and irons mines, and railroad cars that existed, which eventually led to the recognition that a thing called a thruway would be good for Rockland and good for the region. Mr. Vanderhoef said that in 1955, the Tappan Zee Bridge was built and changed Rockland County forever. He said that Rockland County was an agriculture county which housed over 150 farms and currently there were about five farms. He said that Rockland County was growing in population and diversity. Mr. Vanderhoef said that Rockland County was growing through its transformation attaching to all the other counties that were in NYMTC and other Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPO's). Mr. Vanderhoef said to Tom Schulze that he was pleased he was with New Jersey Transit because it was

so critical to Rockland County. He said that New Jersey Transit's, Access to the Region's Core, would make an enormous difference on those competing scenarios on how we move people in and out of Rockland County. He said that NYMTC must talk to Orange County, which is a separate MPO, about how to improve transportation from Orange County, Sullivan County, Ulster County to New York City through Westchester. Mr. Vanderhoef said that the Interstate-287 Corridor changed Rockland County's history and its diversity and that the county's future was linked to that very corridor. He said when there is talk about replacement of the Tappan Zee Bridge, it's not just talk about a bridge but talk about the future of Westchester and Rockland Counties. He said when transportation issues were looked at with NYMTC colleagues and other colleagues from other MPO's, the destiny of the entire county of Rockland would be reviewed, as well as the State of New York and he was very pleased to be a part of it. Mr. Vanderhoef said that it was taken quite seriously that while there may be competing interest within NYMTC, there were none which were mutually exclusive if everyone worked together; and if everyone worked together, then the ultimate end would be that this region and this MPO will be the highlight of the United States with respect to planning, thinking and investing in transportation.

Hudson RiverWalk – Westchester County Executive Andrew Spano

County Executive Spano said that quality of life was the single most important aspect and asset for Westchester County and was the reason why companies and people moved to the county, and for that reason, he would focus on preserving the county's quality of life. He talked about the county's diversity. He said there were almost one million people, different ethnic groups and 35% of the population was minorities. Mr. Spano said that transportation was a very critical issue because of the traffic that traveled through the county, affected the county's quality of life. He said that trying to find a balance between the county's quality of life and the needs for the region was very tough and he acknowledged New York City as the engine of their economy. Mr. Spano then talked about Westchester's RiverWalk. He said that RiverWalk was a 46 mile greenway trail along the Hudson River from Peekskill to Yonkers that had open space initiatives, housing developments and economic development opportunities. There were fourteen municipalities, twenty-nine segments, eighteen miles of trail way in place and seven miles in the planning stage, and the RiverWalk connected directly with thirteen Metro-North Hudson Line Stations. He said that the county had a legacy program where the county would put in money to develop new parks and then would turn the parks over to the localities. The localities would maintain and run the parks. He said the county was trying to create the infrastructure walk and then have the creative aspects of each individual town and city approach it from their perspective with the assistance of the county's Planning Department. Mr. Spano said that the RiverWalk document was published so people could get an idea of what it was and view the different stages that it was in and the different problems that were encountered. He said that the project was split into 29 segments so that it could be approached segment by segment, in any order. He said the RiverWalk would represent sustainable, inter-modal transportation by connecting with thirteen Metro-North Rail stations and connecting with 27 Bee Line Bus routes, including the Tappan Zee Express. He said that the RiverWalk would represent smart growth by providing non-motorized access to and between downtown centers, residential areas and parks and by reducing automobile trips and improving accessibility for everyone. He said that the RiverWalk would also represent improved quality of life by increasing non-motorized access to reduce traffic. Mr. Spano said that a Guidelines Manual for the RiverWalk Greenway Trail was available. He talked about design possibilities for trails through existing parking areas, trails on shorelines, trails adjacent to railroads and transforming urban waterfronts to bring people to the river. Mr. Spano said that people would use the trails to get from place to place because it would be easier to take bikes to get to places than taking vehicles and it would offer pleasure and increase or at least contribute to the quality of life in Westchester County.

Access to the Region's Core – Tom Schulze, Program Manager, New Jersey Transit

Tom Schulze gave a presentation on Access to the Region's Core on behalf of Richard Roberts and apologized for him not being able to attend the meeting. Tom Schulze said that Access to the Region's Core (ARC) was a draft Environmental Impact Statement being prepared by New Jersey Transit in partnership with Port Authority of New York and New Jersey. He said that the project was a complicated project going through some complicated areas but the pace on the project would pick up over the next six months. Mrs. Schulze said that there would be more need for contact with agencies in New York and New Jersey and with public groups to ensure people understood what the project was and then the necessary planning on the project would be done. He then described the project. Mr. Schulze said that ARC was a new two track railroad between downtown Newark, New Jersey and the vicinity of Penn Station in New York which required new tracks in the Meadowlands and a new two track tunnel under the Hudson River. He said that there was a loop in Secaucus that would connect New Jersey Transit lines that travel into Bergen, Orange and Rockland Counties that would give area residents a one seat ride into New York for the first time. Mr. Schulze described three options for new station facility locations that were being looked into. One would be a deep tunnel about 150 feet beneath the block between 30th and 31st Streets; the second would be a deeper tunnel, about 170 feet beneath the existing Penn Station and the third option would be under the Right-Of-Way of 34th Street. He said that since 1994, the number of trains going between New Jersey and Penn Station grew from 88 to 186 and there had been a high increase in demand for rail service into the area because of growth and population in jobs. Also, because of the changes in the way New Jersey Transit ran train service in New Jersey such as the Midtown Direct, which generated increased demand for rail service into Penn Station. He said that recreation had increased demand in which 16% or 2.5 million of theatre goers come from West of the Hudson River. Mr. Schulze said that scoping was completed in December 2003 and the scoping document was in the process on being completed. Sixty comments from the public were received and were being incorporated into the scoping document. He said the draft Environment Impact Statement should be completed by the summer of 2005 and a final Environment Impact Statement should be completed by mid 2006. Mr. Schulze said that construction for the first operating segment was anticipated by late 2007 and the first phase operation by 2010-2012. For more information on this project check the website at www.accesstotheregionscore.com

Regional Connectivity – Lou Venech, Chief Planner, Port Authority of New York & New Jersey

Mr. Lou Venech said that he was adding the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey's (PANYNJ) message of importance to provide a framework for the joint planning in the region and would talk about PANYNJ's upcoming projects. Mr. Venech said that since the attacks of September 11, 2001, the PANYNJ was stretched in financial and in human in institutional terms as never before. He said that the PANYNJ had advanced lower Manhattan recovery working with others, opened Air Train JFK in cooperation with the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and other agencies, and committed to rail freight and bridge and tunnel improvements affecting both sides of the Hudson River. He said that NYMTC was an invaluable resource to foster the kinds of multi-agency planning that was going to be needed to keep the region moving. He said that the PANYNJ was bringing a new lower Manhattan ferry terminal, in partnership with New York City and with communities in the Hudson Valley to bring additional ferry service, but NYMTC's Long Island Sound Waterborne Transportation Plan helped with a roster of services containing a real ferry network that serviced the water metropolitan region. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ had partnered with both New York City and New York State Department of Transportation on rail freight capital improvements and worked to better manage truck flow at

crossings, but NYMTC's forth coming Regional Freight Plan would help support informed decision making about the next wave of highway and rail freight investments that would be needed to keep regional business competitive. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ fine-tuned access busses and trucks at the Holland Tunnel to make the best use of the facility in a very congested part of the region, but was counting on NYMTC's Canal Street Area Corridor Study to provide a long term look at a platform for the affected agencies to work together and consider future option for best managing the local and regional traffic that had relied on this corridor historically. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ created the Air Train services along with transit partners and supported planning for expansion of passenger rail transit throughout the region, but NYMTC provided an overall framework for the region's transit agencies to understand together the pivotal role of Penn Station as a shared regional asset for communities from both states and for inter-city rail and for airport passengers. Mr. Venech said that NYMTC and the neighboring Metropolitan Planning Organization's helped all to see the region as a whole. He said that the PANYNJ was restraining to repair and modernize its existing facilities, while upgrading security and improving the reliability of the facilities and services. He said that the PANYNJ had preserved and added to its funding partnerships with other operators in host cities to the limits of its resources. Mr. Venech said that the PANYNJ did not attend meeting to casts votes, but attended to plan and to partner with other agencies and jurisdictions. He said that NYMTC didn't have to become a household word to be successful in its mission, but there wasn't a household in the region that wouldn't benefit from the things that were achieved together.

Metropolitan Transportation Authority – Deputy Executive Director Christopher Boylan

Mr. Christopher Boylan talked about some of the progress the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) had made in the last 20 years and where MTA was heading in the future. Mr. Boylan said that twenty years ago, MTA was headlined as a national disgrace because of daily breakdowns, fires, endless waits, high crimes and debt. He said twenty years later, MTA had improved on most of those issues and had invested about fifty billion dollars into the system. The current levels of investment were about three and a half billion dollars a year. He said that MTA added new subway cars and retired old fleets, such as the John Rucker Express. He said that the MTA bought new M7 rail cars for the Long Island Rail Road, which provided a nicer, cleaner and smother ride and improved the mean distance, which translated into fewer late and/or canceled trains. Mr. Boylan said that 103 new clean fueled busses were added to the New York City Transit fleet and another 300 were on the way. He said that the Long Island Bus fleet would have the largest CNG bus fleet in the country after they obtain 58 additional busses by the end of the year. Mr. Boylan talked about the Capital Construction Company, MTA's new family member, who was in charge of the mega projects, like the Eastside Access Project, the Second Avenue Subway, the work that would be done on the #7 line, the projects in lower Manhattan and the security projects. He said it would bring a singular engineering focus to all those projects. Mr. Boylan talked about the MTA's link to the new Air Train project, in conjunction with PANYNJ and how it had been successful with getting people from Howard Beach and Jamaica to JFK Airport in a convenient and inexpensive way. Mr. Boylan said that Metrocard had been added to a new station with PATH in lower Manhattan. MTA's Metrocard had also been added to the Air Train and to the Roosevelt Island Operation Company for the tram that traveled to Roosevelt Island. He said that the technologies of Metrocard, coupled with E-Z Pass, helped improve service for the region, dramatically. Mr. Boylan said that the MTA tried to take a little bit of the edge off of the fare increase by lowering the buy in on the Metrocard, by providing discounted rates of 20% on the multi-ride cards. The MTA had also provided balance protection for people who purchased monthly cards. He said that the average fare was about \$1.26, factoring into the average customers used some kind of discounted fare media. Mr. Boylan said

that the use of E-Z Pass provided benefits to customers by eliminating congestion, cleaning the air and saving dollars on roundtrips. Mr. Boylan then talked about some of MTA's projects. He said that the MTA was working through the Environmental Impact Statement with the Federal Transit Administration for the Second Avenue Subway and were working with New York City on the financing plan for the #7 line. He said that the Fulton Transit Center Project should be completed by 2007. Services would be linked with the PATH Concourse for the \$750 million project and would re-volumize transportation into and around lower Manhattan. He said the South Ferry Terminal project would create a new terminal down at South Ferry instead of the little loop that existed and would increase capacity in lower Manhattan and the Westside IRT line because ten car trains would be able to platform and more people would board on and off quickly. Mr. Boylan said that there were some significant projected out-year deficits in terms of MTA's operating budget and they were faced with renewing the current capital program. He said the projected out-year deficits were structural imbalances that stemmed primarily from raising debts service costs, increased health and pension welfare expenses and the depletion of some of the non recurrent revenue sources that was benefited from over the last few years. He said that debt services would grow, operating revenues pension cost would double by 2007, health & welfare cost would increase. He said that he would hope that the next capital program would be the same size and scope at least as the existed program, which was approximately twenty billion dollars. Mr. Boylan then talked about security and how it was an entirely new area for the MTA to address through the capital program. Mr. Boylan said that MTA was celebrating its 100th anniversary of the subway system and that fortunately, people a hundred years ago had vision, insight and the support to build the system that really made the region work. He said that the MTA was looking to their funding partners to help them be as creative as they headed into the next century.

Harlem River Bridges – Deputy Commissioner Gwen Perlman

Ms. Gwen Perlman said that she would talk about what the New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) would be doing with its next large federal project. She said that previous funds were mostly devoted to the East-River Bridge Program and over a billion dollars in federal aid was used to restore the bridges, and that the department was organizing a similar project for the Harlem River Bridges. Ms. Perlman said that the NYCDOT was nearing completion of the four East River Bridge Program receiving one billion dollars from the federal government and two billion dollars from city and state funds. She said that the last project in the East River Bridge Restoration Program would begin in 2010 and should be completed by 2013. She provided a summary of what was done on the four east river bridges and the costs. Ms. Perlman then talked about the Harlem River Bridge. She said that those bridges were Manhattan's link to the northeast and they carried over 340 thousand vehicles per day. She said the Harlem River Bridge Program consisted of the Broadway Bridge, University Heights Bridge, Macomb's Dam Bridge, 145th Street Bridge, Madison Avenue Bridge, The Third Avenue Bridge, the East 127th Street Viaduct was being included, the Willis Avenue Bridge and the Wards Island Bridge. She said with the exception of Wards Island Bridge, they were all movable bridges. She said the Broadway Bridge carried three tracks of the IRT on its upper deck in addition to vehicles; the University Heights bridges was completed; the Macomb's Dam Bridge would be completed by fall 2004; work had begun on the Third Avenue Bridge and work on the 145th Street Bridge would begin soon. She said that all projects would include incentive and disincentive clauses, which would penalize contractors for not completing work on time and would provide financial incentive to those who completed work earlier. She said the total cost for all of the projects would be 713 million dollars. Ms. Perlman said the biggest and most ambitious project within the program was the Willis Avenue Bridge and provided history on the bridge. The Willis Avenue Bridge, the third oldest bridge in system, was opened to the traffic in 1901. She said the Willis Avenue Bridge expanded the Harlem River Drive on the Manhattan side and

the Oak Point Link Rail Road and other businesses on the Bronx. The Willis Avenue Bridge carried traffic to the Bronx and its neighboring Third Avenue Bridge brought traffic from Manhattan. It carried approximately 71,000 vehicles per day. Ms. Perlman said the plan for the Willis Avenue Bridge was a completely off line new replacement bridge and said that the new bridge would be built to the south of the current structure which would help ease traffic problems during construction and would address most of the bridges geometry issues. The Willis Avenue Bridge would be a spring span bridge after completion and at the State's request new approach ramps on the Bronx side would be completed. Ms. Perlman said that the project was in the design phase, with 60% completed, and construction was expected to begin Spring 2007 and should be finished by 2012. Ms. Perlman said that federal funds were requested to pay for the project and that the NYCDOT would ask congressional delegation to support earmarking funds to pay 80% of the expected 713 million dollar cost of the program.

F. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Dee Vandenburg – United Transportation Union/Staten Island Taxpayers' Association, Inc.

Ms. Vandenburg introduced herself as the President of the Staten Island Taxpayers' Association, Inc. and as the Local Chair of the Local 1440 United Transportation Union of Staten Island Railway. She addressed New York State Department of Transportation and said that all mapped, unbuilt service roads needed to be completed and that three million dollars for the Staten Island Railway Park & Rides, which was ISTEA money at one time and was allocated, now faced problems getting Park & Rides. She said that the Staten Island Railway ridership gave the appearance that it had declined, but it didn't. Everyone drove their vehicles. She said that Richmond was the fastest growing county and were in dire need for improvements. She said that people from Staten Island had the longest commute on the entire east coast to get to work. Ms. Vandenburg then addressed the New York City Department of Transportation and said left hand turning arrows was needed to be placed on all traffic signals where there were existing turning bays and synchronized traffic lights to keep rush hour traffic moving. She said that Staten Island had become a pass through borough. Ms. Vandenburg asked the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey to look into a fast ferry site for the South Shore in the vicinity of Mount Loretto and the New York City Department of Parks Fishing Pier on Sharrots Avenue. She said that the North Shore Passenger Line needed to be up and running immediately. Ms. Vandenburg then addressed the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and said that the Staten Island Railway needed to not be left out in the cold because it was a vital part of transportation on Staten Island and the fare needed to be put back on this line. She said that the elimination of the fare with daytime riders affected the transit venue and rail was once again the future. She said funding streams were vital and the Verrazano Bridge needed to supply the county's fair share. Ms. Vandenburg said that the Metropolitan Transportation Authority needed to work with New York State Department of Transportation on getting Park & Rides in place where they were originally planned and work on enhancing connecting bus routes.

Hilary Hinds Kitasei – Henry Hudson Parkway Task Force

Ms. Kitasei said that the Henry Hudson Parkway Task Force included representatives of thirteen parks, four community board districts, seven historic districts, property owner associations, cultural institutions, and environmental and preservation organizations which all had a stake in the future of the 11.1 mile parkway corridor. She said that there were many agencies and authorities with jurisdiction over the corridor and many of them were represented on the NYMTC board. Ms. Kitasei thanked NYMTC for daring to undertake this collaboration to develop design guidelines based on a shared vision for the historic parkway and said that the Task Force was committed to support and participate in the process required to designate the Henry Hudson Parkway a New York Scenic Byway for the several years it is expected to take. She said that the Task Force was fortunate to have the leadership of

NYMTC, whose members come from regions and agencies where the Scenic Byways program was successfully applied and everyone would be in a position to establish the Henry Hudson Parkway not only the first scenic byway in New York City but a national model for urban scenic byways. She then explained that the Task Force also served on the Hudson River Valley Scenic Byway Steering Committee, a project of the Hudson River Valley Greenway to explore the potential for a regional system of scenic byways and the committee also identified Route 9A in New York City, as a potential New York Scenic Byway, which would make the New York Harbor, Statue of Liberty, and the World Trade Center Site the origin and terminus of a Hudson River Valley Scenic Byway and Greenway. Ms. Kitasei then requested the Council to consider expanding the scope of this project to include all of Route 9A, in which the Committee would continue public outreach to stakeholders throughout the corridor. Ms. Kitasei again thanked the Council for supporting the Scenic Byway initiative for New York City.

Joe Hartigan - Rockaway Action Committee

Mr. Hartigan said that he was a recent retired Fire Lieutenant and questioned why there wasn't any talk about terrorism in any of the discussions. He said the New York City subway system was wide open. There was a State law that was changed in regards to driving 15,000 gallons of gas in trucks that traveled on city streets over subway grates. He said that hot dog trucks on city corners contain propane and some buildings in lower Manhattan stored 20,000 gallons of diesel fuel in basements, and that vent pipes were within fifty feet of subway grates. He also said that there were parking lots, such as the Riis Park and Orchard Park parking lots, one mile south of the Belt Parkway that could be used for tours along the Hudson River. He said not to utilize an alternative transportation that was available, with a minimum expense, was foolish.

Luis E. Reyes, representing Council Member Alan J. Gerson, First District/Lower Manhattan

Mr. Reyes spoke on Council Member Alan Gerson's behalf, who was not able to attend the meeting. Mr. Reyes said that Council Member Gerson congratulated the honoree Tom Schulze and looked forward to meeting with him and he congratulated the NYMTC board for the work that they were doing and said all of the solutions that were necessary for his district needed to be regionally coordinated solutions. Mr. Reyes said that adequate parking was needed and requested that parking be considered in any solutions and studies that were being undertaken in lower Manhattan. He said that the parking situation could only get worse as the building continued. Mr. Reyes said that Mr. Gerson requested for a study that would address the problem of wholesalers that existed in Chinatown, Soho, and the lower Eastside because of the huge trucks that cause significant congestion. He asked for a study that would create a terminal somewhere in lower Manhattan or possibly in Brooklyn, that would serve as a transfer point from large trucks to smaller trucks that could then deliver to businesses in lower Manhattan. He requested a study to decrease the traffic traveling through lower Manhattan. He said that the traffic from New Jersey received free round trip, from the Verrazano-Narrows Bridge, the free no toll on the East River crossings, and then crossed back into New Jersey through the toll free Holland Tunnel. He said that the technology like E-Z Pass should be used.

Mr. Boardman adjourned the meeting.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Joseph Boardman, NYS Department of Transportation
Chris Boylan, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning
Gwen Perlman, NYC Department of Transportation
John Pilner, Putnam County
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive
Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County Executive
C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Robert Arnold, Federal Highway Administration
Ron Borsollino, US Environmental Protection Agency
Carl Johnson, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Tom Schulze, New Jersey Transit
Karen Shannon, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority
Letitia Thompson, Federal Transit Administration
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

NYMTC Staff

Aizaz Ahmed	Emma Gaitan	Uchenna Madu
Robert Angell	Anthony Gawrych	Larry McAuliffe
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Stephen Hausch	Deinbo MacHarry
Gerry Bogacz	Jan Khan	Andrea Miles-Cole
Alan Borenstein	Navaid Khalil	Karen Rosenberger
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Carl King	Vividiana Vivar
Nina DelSenno	David Kletsman	Judith Wilson
Dan Evans	John Lopez	

OTHERS

Christina Alexiou, STV, Inc.	Robert Brickman, Nassau County
James Anderson, PBQD	Tyler Burke, Tri-State Transportation Campaign
Alfred Angiola, Cashin Associates	Subimal Chakraborti, NYSDOT
Arthur Anthonisen, Orange Co. Citi Found	Patricia Chemka, Westchester County DOT
Vincent Antonecchia, Westchester County	Howard Chynsky, HAKS Engineers
Alan Aronoff, Brookhaven Women Voters	Bradley P. Craig, LAK
Tony Augusto, DMJM	Liz Covorti, Office of State Comptroller
Richard Backlund, FHWA	Nancy Danzig, FTA
Jacob Balter, Nassau County Planning	James Dean, Orangetown Highway Development
Vince Barone, FHWA	Robert Dennison III, NYSDOT
Elizabeth Bartlett, NYSDEC	Beverly Dolinsky, PCAC/MTA
Lawrence Berger, Nassau County Planning	Frank Eadie
Pam Bortorl, LIRR	Dunson O. Eisele, NJ Transit
Patricia Bourne, Nassau Co. Planning Commission	William Fahey, Liberty Lines

ATTENDANCE

OTHERS (continued)

Christie Fasano, NY League of Conserv. Voters
Luke Galfano, Lockwood Kessler & Bartlett
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Paul Gisondo, Westchester County Planning
William K. Gord, NYC TRC
Robert Griffith, FHWA
Richard Gualtieri, NYSDOT
David Harris, NYCDOT
Joe Hartigan, Rockaway Action Committee
Rick Herbek, Village of Croton
Jennifer Hoppa, NYC Parks & Recreation
Sandy Hornick, NYCDCP
Michael Jones, PB
Gary Kassof, US Coast Guard
Irwin Kessman, FTA
Peter G. King, NYSDOT
Danielle Kisinger, SSC
Lisa Kuhner, NYSDOT
Conn MacAogain, NYCDOT
Larry Malsam, NYSDOT
James Manzolillo, LKB
Christopher McBride, AAA
Michael McCarthy, NYSDOT
Meg R. Midan
Maureen Morgan, Rail Project
Anne Morris, Baruch College
Jerry Mulligan, Westchester County Planning
Bob O'Brien, NYC Transit
James O'Shea, Real Estate Consultant
Sharon Persaud, MTA LI Bus

Robert Reardon, Village of Croton
Luis Reyes, Office of Council Member Gerson
Veronica Reed, Urban Engineers
Joseph E. Rich, FHWA
Sarah Rios, MTA
Marc Rivlin, Sen. Lachman's Office
Michael Rossmly, Bklyn. Boro Pres. Office
Erika Rush, Urban Engineers
Lawrence Salley, Westchester County DOT
Andrew Sandor, CTE Engineer
Harvey Sands, LIRO
Mark Seaman, NYU
Lou Sepersky, Metro East Inc.
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP
Jay Shuffield, PANYNJ
Alan Tabachnick, A.D. Marble & Co.
Frances Vella-Marrone, PANYNJ
Wayne Ugolik, NYSDOT
Charles Ukegbu, NYCDOT
Dee Vandenburg, VTV & SITA
Niwlette Wagner, Sam Schwartz
Willaim R. Wright, NJARD
Meseret Yilma, NYCDOT
Ken Vought, USDOT
Melanie Zeman, USEPA
John Zamurs, NYSDOT
Rae Zimmerman, NYU
Jeff Zupan, RPA

The March 15, 2004 meeting synopsis was accepted unanimously by the Council Members.

Respectfully Submitted,

Andrea Miles-Cole